



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 16, 2015

Ms. Sarah Stallberg  
Assistant County Attorney  
Open Records Division  
Montgomery County  
501 North Thompson, Suite 300  
Conroe, Texas 77301

OR2015-19285

Dear Ms. Stallberg:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 579741 (MCSO ORR File Nos. 15PIA399, 15PIA415, 15PIA423).

The Montgomery County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received three requests for offense report number 15A010417. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information includes a court document, which is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a)(17) provides for the required public disclosure of "information that is also contained in a public court record" unless it is "made confidential under [the Act] or other law[.]" Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). Although you raise section 552.108 of the Government Code as an exception to disclosure of this information, section 552.108 is a discretionary exception and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). As such, section 552.108 does not make information confidential for the purposes of section 552.022(a)(17). Therefore, the court document, which we have marked, may not be withheld under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, because sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code make information confidential for

purposes of section 552.022, we will address the applicability of these exceptions to the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17).<sup>1</sup>

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977).

You state the submitted information relates to a pending criminal prosecution. Generally, the release of information pertaining to an open case is presumed to interfere with the criminal case. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). We note, however, the information at issue includes DIC-24 statutory warning and DIC-25 notice of suspension forms. Because copies of these documents have previously been released to the arrestee, we find you have not shown how release of the documents will interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). As the remaining information at issue has not been previously released, we find the sheriff’s office has demonstrated release of this information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.

However, we note section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the basic information and the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms, the sheriff’s office may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen’s date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court’s rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336

---

<sup>1</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

(Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.<sup>2</sup> *Tex. Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3. We note the first requestor has a right of access to her own date of birth pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.023(a) ("person or person's authorized representative has special right of access, beyond right of general public, to information held by governmental body that relates to person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests"); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Thus, the sheriff's office must withhold the first requestor's date of birth in the court document from the second and third requestors under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides that information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1). Because section 552.130 protects personal privacy, the first requestor has a right of access to her own motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. Upon review, we conclude the sheriff's office must withhold from the second and third requestors the information we have marked in the court document subject to section 552.022(a)(17) and in the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, with the exception of the basic information, the court document subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code, and the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms, the sheriff's office may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. In releasing the court document and the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms, the sheriff's office must withhold from the second and third requestors the first requestor's date of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office also must release the basic information.<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>2</sup>Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

<sup>3</sup>We note the information to be released contains a social security number. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision under the Act. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b). However, the first requestor has a right of access to her own social security number. *See generally id.* § 552.023(b); ORD 481 at 4.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

CN/dls

Ref: ID# 579741

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 3 Requestors  
(w/o enclosures)