



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 16, 2015

Mr. Nicholas Toulet
Assistant City Attorney
City of Midland
City Attorney's Office
P.O. Box 1152
Midland, Texas 79701

OR2015-19351

Dear Mr. Toulet:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 580573 (Midland Reference No. 17118).

The Midland Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a named individual. You state you have released some information to the requestor. You indicate the department redacted motor vehicle record information under section 552.130(c) of the Government Code and social security numbers under section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision."

¹Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. *Id.* § 552.147(b).

Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code, which makes confidential juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. Fam. Code § 58.007(c). The relevant portion of section 58.007 provides:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Id. § 58.007(c). Juvenile law enforcement records relating to delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007. *See id.* § 51.03(a)-(b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision”). For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the conduct at issue. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we find the submitted information involves children engaged in delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred after September 1, 1997. Thus, this information is generally confidential under section 58.007 of the Family Code.

However, section 58.007(e) of the Family Code provides, “[l]aw enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101 [of the Family Code or] a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code[.]” *Id.* § 58.007(e). Section 411.082 of the Government Code defines a “criminal justice agency” as including “a federal or state agency that is engaged in the administration of criminal justice under a statute or executive order and that allocates a substantial portion of its annual budget to the administration of criminal justice.” Gov't Code § 411.082(3)(A).

We note the requestor is a representative of the United States Probation Office for the Western District of Texas (the “probation office”). You state the probation office is a criminal justice agency for purposes of section 58.007(e). Accordingly, the requestor has a

right to inspect the submitted information under section 58.007(e) of the Family Code, and it may not be withheld from this requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. In light of the fact the request in this case may implicate the named individual's right to privacy because the requestor seeks all department records pertaining to the named individual, we note a statutory right of access also prevails over a claim under common-law privacy.² See *Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common-law principle); *CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law). Accordingly, the department must generally release the submitted information to this requestor pursuant to section 58.007(e) of the Family Code.

We note, however, some of the submitted information contains motor vehicle record information which is subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code.³ Section 552.130 provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. See Gov't Code § 552.130(a). Accordingly, the motor vehicle record information we have marked is generally excepted from disclosure under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

However, as previously noted, the requestor has a statutory right to inspect the submitted information pursuant to section 58.007(e) of the Family Code. Therefore, we must address the conflict between the access provided under section 58.007(e) of the Family Code and the confidentiality provided under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Where information falls within both a general and a specific provision of law, the specific provision prevails over the general. See *Horizon/CMS Healthcare Corp. v. Auld*, 34 S.W.3d 887, 901 (Tex. 2000) ("more specific statute controls over the more general"); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 277 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones). In this instance, section 58.007(e) generally applies to all juvenile law enforcement records, while section 552.130 specifically protects motor vehicle record information. Although a specific statutory right of access prevails over general exceptions to disclosure under the Act, because section 552.130 has its

²A request for information that requires a governmental body to compile an individual's criminal history, implicates that individual's common-law right to privacy. See *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976) (establishing test for violation of right to privacy under common law in Texas); cf. *U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse file and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information).

³The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

own access provisions, we conclude section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. Thus, we find the confidentiality provided by section 552.130 is more specific than the general right of access provided by section 58.007(e). Accordingly, in releasing submitted information to the requestor, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information to this requestor pursuant to section 58.007(e) of the Family Code.⁴

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cristian Rosas-Grillet
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CRG/cbz

Ref: ID# 580573

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

⁴We note the requestor has a special right of access to the information being released in this instance. See Fam. Code § 58.007(e). Because such information is confidential with respect to the general public, if the department receives another request for this information from a different requestor, the department must again seek a ruling from this office.