



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 21, 2015

Mr. David V. Overcash  
Counsel for the City of Anna  
Wolfe, Tidwell & McCoy, L.L.P.  
2591 Dallas Parkway, Suite 205  
Frisco, Texas 75034

OR2015-19732

Dear Mr. Overcash:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 586144 (City File No. C03029PIR2015050813-02).

The City of Anna (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for a specified report. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code, which provides in relevant part as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

...

(e) Law enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101, a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code, the child, and the child's parent or guardian.

...

(j) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (e), the custodian of the record or file shall redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, or other law.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c), (e), (j)(2). Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007(c). Section 58.007 allows the review or copy of juvenile law enforcement records by a child's parent or guardian. *Id.* § 58.007(e). The submitted documents involve alleged juvenile delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred after September 1, 1997. *See id.* §§ 51.02(2) (for purposes of section 58.007(c), "child" means person ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age when conduct occurred), .03(a), (b) (defining "delinquent conduct" and "conduct indicating a need for supervision" for purposes of section 58.007). Therefore, the submitted information is confidential under section 58.007(c). However, the requestor is a parent of the juvenile offender and, therefore, the information pertaining to the requestor's child may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that ground. *See id.* § 58.007(e). Further, section 58.007(j) provides that information subject to any other exception to

disclosure under the Act or other law must also be redacted. *See id.* § 58.007(j)(2). Accordingly, we will consider whether this information is otherwise excepted under the Act.

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen’s date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court’s rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees’ dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees’ privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.<sup>1</sup> *Texas Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens’ dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3. We note some of this information pertains to the requestor and her child. Section 552.023 of the Government Code gives a person a special right of access to information that is excepted from public disclosure under laws intended to protect that person’s privacy interests. *See generally* Gov’t Code § 552.023; Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Therefore, the requestor has a special right of access to her date of birth, as well as her child’s date of birth, we have marked for release, and the city may not withhold this information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find the date of birth we have marked, which does not pertain to the requestor, satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the city must withhold the date of birth we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate that the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments

---

<sup>1</sup>Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a).

explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You state the information you have marked pertains to a criminal investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on your representations, we find the city may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(2).

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *Id.* § 552.130. Upon review, we agree most of the information you marked consists of motor vehicle record information. However, we note section 552.130 protects personal privacy. Accordingly, the requestor has a right of access to her own and her child's motor vehicle record information under section 552.023 of the Government Code and it may not be withheld from her under section 552.130. *See id.* § 552.023(a); ORD 481. Accordingly, except for the information we marked for release, the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.147 of the Government Code provides that "[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from" required public disclosure under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(a). Upon review, we agree the city may withhold the social security number you have marked under section 552.147(a) of the Government Code.

In summary, the city must withhold the date of birth we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Except for the information we have marked for release, the city must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information to this requestor.<sup>2</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for

---

<sup>2</sup>We note the requestor has a special right of access to the information being released pursuant to section 261.201(k) of the Family Code. Accordingly, if the city receives another request for this information from a different requestor, then the city should again seek a decision from this office.

providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Britni Fabian". The signature is written in a cursive, slightly slanted style.

Britni Fabian  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

BF/bhf

Ref: ID# 586144

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)