



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 30, 2015

Ms. Linda Hight
Records Coordinator
City of Cleburne
P.O. Box 677
Cleburne, Texas 76033

OR2015-20510

Dear Ms. Hight:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 581320.

The City of Cleburne (the "city") received a request for a specified incident report. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes such as section 58.007 of the Family Code, which provides, in pertinent part, as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

...

(e) Law enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101, a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code, the child, and the child's parent or guardian.

...

(j) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (e), the custodian of the record or file shall redact:

(1) any personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the child; and

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law.

Id. § 58.007(c), (e), (j)(2). Juvenile law enforcement records relating to delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007. *See id.* § 51.03(a)-(b) (defining "delinquent conduct" and "conduct indicating a need for supervision"). For purposes of section 58.007(c), "child" means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the conduct at issue. *See id.* § 51.02(2). The submitted information involves a child engaged in delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred after September 1, 1997. As such, this information constitutes a juvenile law enforcement record that is subject to section 58.007(c). In this instance, however, the requestor is the parent of the juvenile offender and, therefore, has access to the information at issue pursuant to section 58.007(e). *See id.* § 58.007(e). Accordingly, the city may not withhold the submitted information from the requestor under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. *See id.* § 58.007(e). However, personally identifiable information concerning any other juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness that is not the juvenile suspect at issue must be redacted pursuant to section 58.007(j)(1) of the Family Code. For purposes of section 58.007(j)(1),

a juvenile victim or witness is a person who is under eighteen years of age. Accordingly, the city must withhold the personally identifiable information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(j)(1). *Id.* § 58.007(j)(1). In addition, section 58.007(j)(2) provides information subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or law must be redacted before a governmental body releases information pursuant to section 58.007(e). *Id.* § 58.007(j)(2). Thus, we will determine whether the remaining information is otherwise excepted from release under the Act.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.¹ *Texas Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. Thus, the city must withhold the date of birth we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, the city must withhold the personally identifiable information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(j)(1). The city must withhold the date of birth we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/>

¹Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

[orl_ruling_info.shtml](#), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Cole Hutchison". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large initial "C".

Cole Hutchison
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CH/som

Ref: ID# 581320

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)