



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 6, 2015

Ms. Susan Camp-Lee
Counsel for the City of Round Rock
Sheets & Crossfield, P.C.
309 East Main Street
Round Rock, Texas 78664-5246

OR2015-20879

Dear Ms. Camp-Lee:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 582013.

The City of Round Rock (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for a specified police report. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information subject to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065 applies only to a written report of an accident required under section 550.061, 550.062, or 601.004. Act of June 1, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 936, § 1, 2015 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 3256 (Vernon) (to be codified at Transp. Code § 550.065(a)(1)). Chapter 550 requires the creation of a written report when the accident resulted in injury to or the death of a person or damage to the property of any person to the apparent extent of \$1,000 or more. Transp. Code §§ 550.061 (operator's accident report), .062 (officer's accident report). An accident report is privileged and for the confidential use of the Texas Department of Transportation or a local governmental agency of Texas that has use for the information for accident prevention purposes. *Id.* § 550.065(b). However, a governmental entity may release an accident report in accordance with subsections (c) and (c-1). Act of June 1, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 936, § 1 2015 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 3256, 3256-57 (Vernon) (to be codified at Transp. Code § 550.065(c), (c-1)).

Section 550.065(c) provides a governmental entity shall release an accident report to a person or entity listed under this subsection. *Id.* § 550.065(c). Here, the requestor is a person listed under subsection (c). Therefore, this requestor has a right of access to the submitted accident report pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4)(B). *Id.* § 550.065(c)(4)(B). Accordingly, the city must release Exhibit B under section 550.065(c).¹

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Further, this office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992) (employee's designation of retirement beneficiary, choice of insurance carrier, election of optional coverages, direct deposit authorization, forms allowing employee to allocate pretax compensation to group insurance, health care or dependent care), 545 (1990) (deferred compensation information, participation in voluntary investment program, election of optional insurance coverage, mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 682. In considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.² *Texas Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3.

¹We note the city seeks clarification on the effect of the recent amendments to section 550.065 of the Transportation Code on *City of San Antonio v. Abbott*, 432 S.W.3d 429 (Tex.App.—Austin 2014, pet. denied). We note the amendments to section 550.065 supercede *City of San Antonio v. Abbott*. Accordingly, we will address your arguments for the remaining information.

²Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

Upon review, we find the information you have marked, and we have marked, satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the city must generally withhold all public citizens' dates of birth and the marked information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note, however, the requestor may be acting as an authorized representative of one of the individuals to whom some of the marked information pertains. If the requestor is acting as the individual's authorized representative, then the requestor has a right of access pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code to the information pertaining to this individual, and the information may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(b) (governmental body may not deny access to person or person's representative to whom information relates on grounds that information is considered confidential under privacy principles); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning herself). If the requestor is not acting as the authorized representative of the individual at issue, then the city must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. We note section 552.130 protects personal privacy. We find the information you marked, in addition to the information we marked, consists of motor vehicle record information. In this instance, the requestor may be acting as the authorized representative of one the individuals whose motor vehicle record information we marked. To the extent the requestor is acting as the authorized representative of the individual at issue, the requestor has a right of access under section 552.023 to information pertaining to that individual that would otherwise be protected under section 552.130. *See id.* § 552.023(a) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates or person's agent on ground that information is considered confidential by privacy principles); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Accordingly, to the extent the requestor has a right of access to the motor vehicle record information of the individual at issue, such information may not be withheld from this requestor under section 552.130 of the Government Code. If the requestor is not acting as the authorized representative of the individual whose motor vehicle record information is at issue, then the city must withhold this information as well as the remaining marked information under section 552.130.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code states, "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." Gov't Code § 552.136(b); *see also id.* § 552.136(a) (defining "access device"). This office has determined an insurance policy number is an access device number for the purposes of section 552.136. *See* Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009). Accordingly, the city must

withhold the insurance policy number you have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, if the requestor is not acting as the authorized representative of the individual at issue, then the city must withhold the marked information and all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. If the requestor is not acting as the authorized representative of the individual whose motor vehicle record information is at issue, then the city must withhold this information as well as the remaining marked information under section 552.130. The city must withhold the insurance policy number you have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cole Hutchison
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CH/som

Ref: ID# 582013

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)