



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 14, 2015

Ms. Ann-Marie Sheely
Assistant County Attorney
Transactions Division
Travis County
P.O. Box 1748
Austin, Texas 78767

OR2015-21589

Dear Ms. Sheely:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 581454.

The Travis County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") received a request for information related to three specified arrests of a named individual. You state you have released some responsive information to the requestor. You further state the district attorney's office does not have information responsive to a portion of the request.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as article 42.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. Section 9 of article 42.12 is applicable to pre-sentence investigation and post-sentence reports and provides, in part:

(j) The judge by order may direct that any information and records that are not privileged and that are relevant to a report required by Subsection (a) or

¹We note the Act does not require a governmental body to release information that did not exist when it received a request or create responsive information. *See Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 555 at 1 (1990), 452 at 3 (1986).

Subsection (k) of this section be released to an officer conducting a presentence investigation under Subsection (i) of this section or a postsentence report under Subsection (k) of this section. The judge may also issue a subpoena to obtain that information. A report and all information obtained in connection with a presentence investigation or postsentence report are confidential and may be released only:

- (1) to those persons and under those circumstances authorized under Subsections (d), (e), (f), (h), (k), and (l) of this section;
- (2) pursuant to Section 614.017, Health and Safety Code; or
- (3) as directed by the judge for the effective supervision of the defendant.

Crim. Proc. Code art. 42.12, § 9(j). You state the information you have marked consists of a pre-sentence investigation report. Additionally, you indicate none of the release provisions in section 9(j) of article 42.12 are applicable. Accordingly, we conclude the district attorney's office must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 9(j) of article 42.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 411.083 of the Government Code, which pertains to criminal history record information ("CHRI"). CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center ("NCIC") or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." Gov't Code § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the NCIC network or other states. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990); *see generally* Gov't Code ch. 411 subch. F. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Act of May 27, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 1279, § 21, 2015 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 4327, 4337 (Vernon) (to be codified as an amendment to Gov't Code § 411.083(a)). Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. Gov't Code § 411.089(b)(1). Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. Upon our review, we conclude the district attorney's office must generally withhold the CHRI we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.083 and federal law.

In this instance, however, the requestor is a representative of the Arkansas Department of Correction (the “department”) and may have a right of access to some of the information at issue. Section 411.089(a) of the Government Code provides that “[a] criminal justice agency is entitled to obtain from the [DPS] any [CHRI] maintained by the [DPS] about a person.” *See* Gov’t Code § 411.089(a). In addition, section 411.087(a) of the Government Code provides, in pertinent part:

(a) [A] person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter or Subchapter E-1 to obtain from the [DPS] criminal history record information maintained by the [DPS] that relates to another person is authorized to:

...

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state criminal history record information maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

Act of May 27, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 1279, § 24, 2015 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 4327, 4337-4338 (Vernon) (to be codified as an amendment to Gov’t Code § 411.087(a)). We find the submitted information contains CHRI. However, a criminal justice agency that receives CHRI from another criminal justice agency pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) may only receive such information for a criminal justice purpose. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083(c), .087(b); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997) (discussing limitations on release of criminal history record information). Thus, to the extent the requestor in this instance is a representative of a “criminal justice agency,” he is authorized to obtain CHRI from the district attorney’s office pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code, but only for a criminal justice purpose. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083(c); Act of May 27, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 1279, § 24, 2015 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 4327, 4337-4338 (Vernon) (to be codified as an amendment to Gov’t Code § 411.087(a)).

A “criminal justice agency” is defined in part as “a federal or state agency that is engaged in the administration of criminal justice under a statute or executive order and that allocates a substantial portion of its annual budget to the administration of criminal justice[.]” Gov’t Code § 411.082(3)(A). “Administration of criminal justice” has the meaning assigned to it by article 60.01 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. *See id.* § 411.082(1). Article 60.01 of the Code of Criminal Procedure defines “administration of criminal justice” as the “performance of any of the following activities: detection, apprehension, detention, pretrial release, post-trial release, prosecution, adjudication, correctional supervision, or rehabilitation of an offender. The term includes criminal identification activities and the collection, storage, and dissemination of [CHRI].” Crim. Proc. Code art. 60.01(1).

We find the department is a criminal justice agency for purposes of section 411.082 of the Government Code. Although it appears the requestor is engaged in the administration of

criminal justice under chapter 411, we cannot determine whether he intends to use the CHRI for a criminal justice purpose. Consequently, if the district attorney's office determines the requestor intends to use the CHRI at issue for a criminal justice purpose, then the requestor has a right of access to CHRI and the district attorney's office may not withhold this information from him under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083. See Open Records Decision No. 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Act). However, if the district attorney's office determines the requestor does not intend to use the CHRI at issue for a criminal justice purpose, then the requestor does not have a right of access to the submitted CHRI pursuant to chapter 411 and the district attorney's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.

You claim a portion of the remaining information, which you have marked, is subject to common-law privacy. Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.² *Texas Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. Thus, the district attorney's office must withhold the public citizens' dates of birth, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find the remaining information you have marked is not highly intimate or embarrassing information or is of legitimate public interest. Therefore, none of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.108 of the Government Code provides, in part:

²Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:

...

(4) it is information that:

(A) is prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation; or

(B) reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state.

(b) An internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution [is excepted from required public disclosure] if:

...

(3) the internal record or notation:

(A) is prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation; or

(B) reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state.

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(4), (b)(3). A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why this exception is applicable to the information the governmental body seeks to withhold. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(4), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You contend the information you have marked constitutes prosecutorial work product. You state the information at issue was created or assembled by attorneys representing the State in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation. Based on your representations and our review, we conclude sections 552.108(a)(4) and 552.108(b)(3) are applicable to the information at issue. As a result, the district attorney's office may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108 of the Government Code.

In summary, the district attorney's office must withhold the public citizens' dates of birth, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 9(j) of article 42.12 of the Code of Criminal

Procedure. The district attorney's office may withhold the information you have marked under sections 552.108(a)(4) and 552.108(b)(3) of the Government Code. If the district attorney's office determines the requestor intends to use the CHRI for a criminal justice purpose, then the district attorney's office must release the remaining information.³ However, if the district attorney's office determines the requestor does not intend to use the CHRI at issue for a criminal justice purpose, then the district attorney's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Tim Neal
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

TN/bhf

Ref: ID# 581454

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

³We note the remaining information contains a social security number. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b).