



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 15, 2015

Ms. Stacie S. White
Counsel for the City of Benbrook
Taylor Olson Adkins Sralla Elam, L.L.P.
6000 Western Place, Suite 200
Fort Worth, Texas 76107

OR2015-21674

Dear Ms. White:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 583656.

The Benbrook Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You state the department is withholding motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code and social security numbers pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.¹ You further state the department is withholding certain information pursuant to Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009).² You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

¹Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in subsection 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See id.* § 552.147(b).

²Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain information without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

Initially, we note some of the submitted information, which we have marked, is not responsive to the instant request for information because it does not pertain to the specified incident. This ruling does not address the public availability of any information that is not responsive to the request and the department is not required to release such information in response to this request.

Next, we note the responsive information was the subject of previous requests for information, as a result of which this office issued Open Records Letter No. 2015-16980 (2015) to the City of Benbrook (the "city"). In that ruling, we determined the city must withhold incident number 1500014049 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. We further determined with the exception of the redacted accident report, which must be released pursuant to section 550.065(c-1) of the Transportation Code, and the basic information, which must be released, the city may withhold incident number 15000147047 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. We have no indication there has been any change in the law, facts, or circumstances on which the previous ruling was based with respect to incident number 15000147047. Accordingly, we conclude the department may rely on Open Records Letter No. 2015-16980 as a previous determination and withhold or release the information related to incident number 15000147047 in accordance with that ruling. *See* Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (so long as law, facts, and circumstances on which prior ruling was based have not changed, first type of previous determination exists where requested information is precisely same information as was addressed in prior attorney general ruling, ruling is addressed to same governmental body, and ruling concludes that information is or is not excepted from disclosure). However, upon review, we find circumstances have changed with respect to the submitted accident report and with respect to incident number 1500014049. Therefore, the department may not rely upon the prior ruling as a previous determination for the accident report or for incident number 1500014049, and we will address the submitted arguments against release of the accident report and incident number 1500014049.

The submitted accident report is subject to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065 applies only to a written report of an accident required under section 550.061, 550.062, or 601.004. Act of June 1, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., H.B. 2633, § 1 (to be codified at Transp. Code § 550.065(a)(1)). Chapter 550 requires the creation of a written report when the accident resulted in injury to or the death of a person or damage to the property of any person to the apparent extent of \$1,000 or more. Transp. Code §§ 550.061 (operator's accident report), .062 (officer's accident report). An accident report is privileged and for the confidential use of the Texas Department of Transportation or a local governmental agency of Texas that has use for the information for accident prevention purposes. *Id.* § 550.065(b). However, a governmental entity may release an accident report in accordance with subsections (c) and (c-1). Act of June 1, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., H.B. 2633, § 1 (to be codified at Transp. Code § 550.065(c), (c-1)). Section 550.065(c)

provides a governmental entity shall release an accident report to a person or entity listed under this subsection. *Id.* § 550.065(c).

In this instance, the requestor is a person listed under section 550.065(c). Although the department asserts section 552.108 to withhold the information, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). Because section 552.108 is a general exception under the Act, the requestor's statutory access under section 550.065(c) prevails and the department may not withhold the information under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Thus, the department must release the accident report to this requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Juvenile Justice Department, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing

conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law; and

(3) the identity of the person who made the report.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a); Act of May 29, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 734 § 82, 2015 Tex. Sess. Law. Serv. 2218, 2244 (Vernon) (to be codified as an amendment to Fam. Code § 261.201(k)); Fam. Code § 261.201(l)(2)-(3). Incident number 1500014049 relates to an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect conducted by the department. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes); Act of June 1, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 1273, § 4, 2015 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 4310, 4312 (to be codified as an amendment to Fam. Code § 261.001(1)) (defining “abuse” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code); Act of May 21, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 432, § 1, 2015 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 1686, 1686-87 (to be codified as an amendment to Fam. Code § 261.001(4)) (defining “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we find this information is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. We note the requestor may be a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child victim listed in incident number 1500014049. Moreover, the requestor is not alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect. Thus, if the requestor is not a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child victim, then as you do not indicate the department has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information, the department must withhold incident number 1500014049 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).

However, if the requestor is a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child victim listed in incident number 1500014049, then pursuant to section 261.201(k), the information at issue may not be withheld from this requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of section 261.201(a). *See* Act of May 29, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 734 § 82, 2015 Tex. Sess. Law. Serv. 2218, 2244 (Vernon) (to be codified as an amendment to Fam. Code § 261.201(k)). However, section 261.201(l)(3) states the identity of the reporting party shall be withheld from disclosure. Fam. Code § 261.201(l)(3). Further, section 261.201(l)(2) states any information that is excepted from required

disclosure under the Act or other law must still be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(1)(2). Accordingly, in that instance, we will consider your remaining arguments against disclosure of incident number 1500014049.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state incident number 1500014049 pertains to an active criminal investigation or prosecution. Based on your representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to incident number 1500014049.

However, we note section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note basic information includes the identity of the complainant. *See* ORD 127 at 3-4. Thus, with the exception of the basic information, the department may withhold incident number 1500014049 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. As noted above, section 261.201(1)(3) states the identity of the reporting party shall be withheld from disclosure. Fam. Code § 261.201(1)(3). Accordingly, in releasing the basic information, the department must withhold the identity of the reporting party under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(1)(3) of the Family Code.

In summary, the department may rely on Open Records Letter No. 2015-16980 as a previous determination and withhold or release incident number 15000147047 in accordance with that ruling. The department must release the accident report to this requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code. If the requestor is not a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child victim listed in incident number 1500014049, then the department must withhold incident number 1500014049 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. If the requestor is a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child victim listed in incident number 1500014049, then with the exception of the basic information, the department may withhold incident number 1500014049 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code; however, in releasing the basic information,

the department must withhold the identity of the reporting party under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(1)(3) of the Family Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/som

Ref: ID# 583656

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)