KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 21, 2015

Ms. Lillian Guillen Graham
Assistant City Attorney
City of Mesquite
Office of the City Attorney
P.O. Box 850137
Mesquite, Texas 75185-0137

OR2015-22066

Dear Ms. Graham:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 585247.

The Mesquite Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to nine specified service numbers. You state you have released some information to the requestor. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

> (a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

> (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] and the identity of the person making the report; and
>
> (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, we agree the information in Exhibit 2 was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect; thus, this information falls within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See id.* § 101.003(a) (defining "child" for purposes of section 261.201 as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes); Act of June 1, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 1273, § 4, 2015 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 4310, 4312 (to be codified as an amendment to Fam. Code § 261.001(1)) (defining "abuse" for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code); Act of May 21, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 432, § 1, 2015 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 1686, 1686-87 (to be codified as an amendment to Fam. Code § 261.001(4)) (defining "neglect" for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Upon review, we determine the information in Exhibit 2 is confidential pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute). Therefore, the department must withhold Exhibit 2 in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.[1]

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the

---

[1]As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.[2] *Texas Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. Additionally, a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. Upon review, we find the remaining information includes public citizens' dates of birth and additional information that satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the department must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth, as well as the information we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.[3]

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a). Upon review, we find the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information it has marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.147(a) of the Government Code excepts the social security number of a living individual from public disclosure. *Id.* § 552.147. Upon review, we find the department may withhold the social security numbers it has marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold Exhibit 2 in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. The department must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth, as well as the information we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information it has marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department may withhold the social security numbers it has marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

---

[2]Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

[3]As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your argument against disclosure of this information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Cristian Rosas-Grillet
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CRG/cbz

Ref: ID# 585247

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)