



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 30, 2015

Ms. Teresa J. Brown
Senior Open Records Assistant
City of Plano
P.O. Box 860358
Plano, Texas 75086-0358

OR2015-22798

Dear Ms. Brown:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 585278 (Plano PD # MANM081015).

The Plano Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident report. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by other statutes, including section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides in relevant part as follows:

- (a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). You state the submitted information is confidential under section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. Upon review, however, we find you have not demonstrated the submitted information was used or developed in an investigation by the department of suspected child abuse or neglect under chapter 261 of the Family Code. *See id.* § 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of section 261.201); Act of June 1, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 1273, § 4, 2015 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 4310, 4312 (Vernon) (to be codified as an amendment to Fam. Code § 261.001(1)) (defining “abuse” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code); Act of May 21, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 432, § 1, 2015 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 1686, 1686-87 (Vernon) (to be codified as an amendment to Fam. Code § 261.001(4)) (defining “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, the department may not withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen’s date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court’s rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees’ dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees’ privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.¹ *Tex. Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens’ dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. Thus, the department must withhold the date of birth we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

¹Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a).

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See Gov't Code* § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body," unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *Id.* § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail addresses we have marked are not of the type excluded by section 552.137(c). Accordingly, the department must withhold the e-mail addresses we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners of the e-mail addresses affirmatively consent to their release.

In summary, the department must withhold the date of birth we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the e-mail addresses we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners of the e-mail addresses affirmatively consent to their release. The remaining information must be released.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for

²We note the remaining information includes social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b). However, because section 552.147 protects personal privacy, the requestor has a right of access to her own and her minor child's social security numbers under section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.023(a) ("person or a person's authorized representative has a special right of access, beyond the right of the general public, to information held by a governmental body that relates to the person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests"). We also note the remaining information contains additional private information pertaining to the requestor and her minor child. The requestor also has a right of access to this private information pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See id.*

providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Cole Hutchison". The signature is written in black ink and is positioned below the word "Sincerely,".

Cole Hutchison
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CH/bhf

Ref: ID# 585278

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)