



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 2, 2015

Ms. Ana Vieira Ayala  
Senior Attorney & Public Information Coordinator  
University of Texas System  
201 West Seventh Street  
Austin, Texas 78701-2902

OR2015-22961

Dear Ms. Ayala:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 585410 (University of Texas OGC# 163894).

The University of Texas at Austin (the "university") received a request for any correspondence sent to or received from a specified e-mail address and any correspondence discussing university business via the specified e-mail address account. You state the university will release some information to the requestor. You claim a portion of the submitted information is not subject to the Act. You claim the remaining submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.111 of the Government Code. We have considered your arguments and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>1</sup>

You argue a portion of the submitted information is not subject to the Act. The Act is applicable only to "public information." *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.002, .021. Section 552.002(a) defines "public information" as

---

<sup>1</sup>We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

[I]nformation that is written, produced, collected, assembled, or maintained under a law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of official business:

(1) by a governmental body;

(2) for a governmental body and the governmental body:

(A) owns the information;

(B) has a right of access to the information; or

(C) spends or contributes public money for the purpose of writing, producing, collecting, assembling, or maintaining the information; or

(3) by an individual officer or employee of a governmental body in the officer's or employee's official capacity and the information pertains to official business of the governmental body.

*Id.* § 552.002(a). Thus, virtually all of the information in a governmental body's physical possession constitutes public information and thus is subject to the Act. *Id.*; *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 549 at 4 (1990), 514 at 1-2 (1988). Information is subject to the Act even if a governmental body does not physically possess it as long as it is written, produced, collected, assembled, or maintained for the governmental body and the governmental body owns the information or has a right of access to it. Gov't Code § 552.002(a)(2); *see* Open Records Decision No. 462 at 4 (1987). Thus, information written, produced, collected, assembled, or maintained by a third party may be subject to disclosure under the Act if a governmental body owns or has a right of access to the information. *See* ORD 462; *cf.* ORD 499.

You inform us the information you have marked consists of communications regarding a university employee's personal travel, personal business information, personal financial decisions, membership on outside boards with no relation to the university, and information not related to the employee's official duties. You further state this information is not collected, assembled, or maintained pursuant to any law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of university business. You inform us the university has a policy that allows for incidental use of e-mail, and you state the expenditure of state resources to create the information was *de minimis*. Based on your representations and our review of the information at issue, we find the information you have marked does not constitute public information for purposes of section 552.002 of the Government Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 635 at 4 (1995) (section 552.002 not applicable to personal information unrelated to official business and created or maintained by state employee involving *de*

*minimis* use of state resources). Therefore, we conclude the information you have marked is not subject to the Act and need not be released in response to the present request for information.

Section 552.111 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure “[a]n interagency or intraagency memorandum or letter that would not be available by law to a party in litigation with the agency[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.111. This exception encompasses the deliberative process privilege. *See* Open Records Decision No. 615 at 2 (1993). The purpose of section 552.111 is to protect advice, opinion, and recommendation in the decisional process and to encourage open and frank discussion in the deliberative process. *See Austin v. City of San Antonio*, 630 S.W.2d 391, 394 (Tex. App.—San Antonio 1982, writ ref’d n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 538 at 1-2 (1990).

In Open Records Decision No. 615, we determined section 552.111 exempts from disclosure only those internal communications that consist of advice, recommendations, opinions, and other material reflecting the policymaking processes of the governmental body. *See* ORD 615 at 5. A governmental body’s policymaking functions do not encompass routine internal administrative or personnel matters, and disclosure of information about such matters will not inhibit free discussion of policy issues among agency personnel. *Id.*; *see also City of Garland v. Dallas Morning News*, 22 S.W.3d 351, 364 (Tex. 2000) (section 552.111 not applicable to personnel-related communications that did not involve policymaking). A governmental body’s policymaking functions include administrative and personnel matters of broad scope that affect the governmental body’s policy mission. *See* Open Records Decision No. 631 at 3 (1995). Further, section 552.111 does not protect facts and written observations of facts and events severable from advice, opinions, and recommendations. *Arlington Indep. Sch. Dist. v. Tex. Attorney Gen.*, 37 S.W.3d 152, 157 (Tex. App.—Austin 2001, no pet.); *see* ORD 615 at 5. But if factual information is so inextricably intertwined with material involving advice, opinion, or recommendation as to make severance of the factual data impractical, section 552.111 protects the factual information. *See* Open Records Decision No. 313 at 3 (1982).

This office has also concluded section 552.111 exempts from disclosure a preliminary draft of a document intended for public release in its final form because the draft necessarily represents the drafter's advice, opinion, and recommendation with regard to the form and content of the final document. *See* Open Records Decision No. 559 at 2 (1990) (applying statutory predecessor). Section 552.111 protects factual information in the draft that also will be included in the final version of the document. *See id.* at 2-3. Thus, section 552.111 encompasses the entire contents of a preliminary draft of a policymaking document, including comments, underlining, deletions, and proofreading marks, that will be released to the public in its final form. *See id.* at 2.

You state the information you have marked under section 552.111 of the Government Code consists of advice, opinion, and recommendations pertaining to university policy matters and

business related to the university's overall policy mission. Additionally, you state some of this information consists of draft documents which you state were intended to be released to the public in their final forms. Upon review, we find the university may withhold the information we have marked under section 552.111 of the Government Code. However, we find you have failed to establish that any portion of the remaining information at issue constitutes advice, opinions, recommendations, or other material reflecting the policymaking processes of the university. Accordingly, you may not withhold any portion of the remaining information under section 552.111 of the Government Code. As you raise no further exceptions to disclosure, the university must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Abigail T. Adams  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

ATA/akg

Ref: ID# 585410

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)