



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 3, 2015

Ms. Teresa J. Brown
Senior Open Records Assistant
City of Plano Police Department
P.O. Box 860358
Plano, Texas 75086-0358

OR2015-23020

Dear Ms. Brown:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 586033 (File# ROOC081315).

The Plano Police Department (the "department") received a request for all incident reports at a specified location over a specified time period. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the department's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code, which prescribes the procedural obligations that a governmental body must follow in asking this office to decide whether requested information is excepted from public disclosure. Section 552.301(b) requires that a governmental body ask for a decision from this office and state which exceptions apply to the requested information by the tenth business day after receiving the request. Gov't Code § 552.301(b). In this instance, you state the department received the request for information on August 13, 2015. Accordingly, the department's ten-business-day deadline was August 27, 2015. However, the department's request for a ruling bears a meter mark of August 28, 2015. *See id.* § 552.308 (describing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail). Consequently, we find the department failed to comply with the requirements of section 552.301 of the Government Code.

¹Although you do not raise section 552.130 in your brief, we understand you to raise this exception based on your markings in the documents.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption the requested information is public and must be released unless a compelling reason exists to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 191 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Generally, a compelling reason to withhold information exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third party interests are at stake. Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). You claim that the submitted information is confidential under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. Because the application of sections 552.101 and 552.130 can provide compelling reasons for non-disclosure under section 552.302, we will consider your claims under these sections.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information that other statutes make confidential, such as section 58.007 of the Family Code. Section 58.007 provides in pertinent part as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007(c). For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we find portions of the submitted information involve an allegation of a child engaged in delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred after September 1, 1997. *See* Act of June 1, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 935, § 18, 2015 Tex. Sess.

Law Serv. 3224, 3233-34 (to be codified as amendments to Fam. Code § 51.03); Act of May 31, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 944, § 4, 2015 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 3268, 3269-70 (to be codified as an amendment to Fam. Code § 51.03(b)); Act of June 1, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 1273, § 3, 2015 Tex. Sess. Law. Serv. 4310, 4311 (to be codified as an amendment to Fam. Code § 51.03(b)) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of section 58.007). Thus, the information at issue is subject to section 58.007. It does not appear any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply. Accordingly, the information we marked must be withheld in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, we find portions of the submitted information consist of files, reports, records, communications, or working papers used or developed in an investigation under chapter 261. *See* Act of May 21, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 432, § 1, 2015 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 1686, 1686-87 (to be codified as an amendment to Fam. Code § 261.001(4)) (defining “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code); Act of June 1, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 1273, § 4, 2015 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 4310, 4312 (to be codified as an amendment to Fam. Code § 261.001(1)) (defining “abuse” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code); *see also* Fam. Code §101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of chapter 261 of Family Code). Accordingly, we find the information we marked is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. You have not indicated the department has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information. Therefore, we assume no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, the information at issue is confidential pursuant to section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute). Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we marked from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 1702.284 of the Occupations Code. Section 1702.284(a) provides:

(a) Information contained in alarm systems records maintained by a governmental body that concerns the location of an alarm system, the name of the occupant of an alarm system location, or the type of alarm system used is confidential and may be disclosed only to the [Texas Private Security Board], to the alarm company to which the confidential records relate, or as otherwise required by state law or court order.

Occ. Code § 1702.284(a); *see also id.* § 1702.002(1)(A)(ii) (defining “alarm system” as electronic equipment and devices designed to detect or signal the occurrence of a robbery or other emergency). You assert portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under section 1702.284. However, we note section 1702.284 is not applicable to investigative information. *See* Act of June 19, 1983, 68th Leg., R.S., ch. 496, § 1, 1983 Tex. Gen. Laws 2915. Accordingly, the department may not withhold any of the information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1702.284 of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen’s date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court’s rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees’ dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees’ privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.² *Tex. Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens’ dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. Upon review, we find some of the remaining information which we have marked satisfies the standard articulated

²Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a).

by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we marked, as well as the public citizen's date of birth, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, you have not demonstrated that the remaining information you marked is intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate concern to the public. Therefore, the department may not withhold the remaining information at issue under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure information that relates a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by this state or another state or country. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130.

In summary, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code, and section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. The department must also withhold the information we marked, along with the public citizen's date of birth, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Ashley Crutchfield
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

AC/dls

Ref: ID# 586033

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)