



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 3, 2015

Mr. Brendan W. Guy
Assistant Criminal District Attorney
Victoria County Criminal District Attorney's Office
205 North Bridge, Suite 301
Victoria, Texas 77901-8085

OR2015-23022

Dear Mr. Guy:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 585802.

The Victoria County Criminal District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") received two requests from the same requestor for the case file and all records pertaining to seven specified cases involving the requestor's client. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, we note the submitted information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part:

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

(1) a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body, except as provided by Section 552.108[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(1). The submitted information consists of completed investigations subject to subsection 552.022(a)(1). The district attorney's office must release the completed investigations pursuant to subsection 552.022(a)(1) unless they are excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code or are made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* You seek to withhold the submitted information under section 552.103 of the Government Code. However, section 552.103 is a discretionary exception and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive Gov't Code § 552.103); Open Records Decision No. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally). Therefore, the district attorney's office may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.103 of the Government Code. However, because sections 552.101 and 552.130 can make information confidential under the Act, we will address the applicability of those sections to the submitted information.²

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.³ *Tex. Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

³Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. Thus, with the exception of the requestor's client's date of birth, the district attorney's office must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.⁴

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(a). Upon review, we find the submitted information contains motor vehicle record information. However, we note section 552.130 protects personal privacy. In this instance, it is not clear whether some of the information at issue belongs to the requestor's client. As such, the requestor may have a right of access to this marked information, and we must rule conditionally. *See id.* § 552.023(a) ("A person or a person's authorized representative has a special right of access, beyond the right of the general public, to information held by a governmental body that relates to the person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests."); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Thus, to the extent the marked information belongs to the requestor's client, the requestor has a right of access under section 552.023 to the marked information, and this information may not be withheld under section 552.130. To the extent the marked information does not belong to the requestor's client, the district attorney's office must withhold it under section 552.130.

In summary, with the exception of the requestor's client's date of birth, the district attorney's office must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. To the extent the marked information does not belong to the requestor's client, the district attorney's office must withhold it under section 552.130. The remaining information must be released.⁵

⁴We note the requestor has a right of access to her client's date of birth. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a) (person or person's authorized representative has special right of access, beyond right of general public, to information held by governmental body that relates to person and is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect person's privacy interests); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual asks governmental body to provide him with information concerning himself).

⁵We note the requestor has a right of access to some of the information being released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. We also note the information being released contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. However, the information contains the requestor's client's social security number, which may not be withheld in this instance. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Cole Hutchison".

Cole Hutchison
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CH/bhf

Ref: ID# 585802

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)