



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 3, 2015

Ms. Lillian Guillen Graham
Assistant City Attorney
City of Mesquite
P.O. Box 850137
Mesquite, Texas 75185

OR2015-23088

Dear Ms. Graham:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 585953.

The Mesquite Police Department (the "department") received a request for all information pertaining to a specified incident. You state the department will redact certain information pursuant to the previous determination issued to the department in Open Records Letter No. 2012-07334 (2012).¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as laws that make criminal history record information ("CHRI") confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center (the "NCIC") or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means "information collected about

¹Open Records Letter No. 2012-07334 authorizes the department to withhold Federal Bureau of Investigation numbers under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code without requesting a decision under the Act when requests for such numbers are not made by individuals or entities who are authorized to obtain them under chapter 411 of the Government Code.

a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *Id.* § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the NCIC network or other states. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). *See generally* Gov’t Code §§ 411.081-.1409. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Act of May 27, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 1279, § 21, 2015 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 4327, 4337-4338 (Vernon) (to be codified as an amendment to Gov’t Code § 411.083(a)). Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. Gov’t Code § 411.089(b)(1). Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. Accordingly, the department must withhold the CHRI you have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 560.003 of the Government Code, which provides that “[a] biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under [the Act].” *See id.* § 560.003; *see also id.* §§ 560.001(1) (defining “biometric identifier” to include fingerprints), .002(1)(A) (governmental body may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose individual’s biometric identifier to another person unless individual consents to disclosure). Upon review, we find the fingerprints you have marked constitute biometric identifiers for purposes of section 560.003 of the Government Code. Thus, the department must withhold the marked fingerprints under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Moreover, under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen’s date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court’s rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The

supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.² *Tex. Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987).

Upon review, we find some of the information you marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must also withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate the remaining information you marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Therefore, the department may not withhold the remaining information you have marked under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. We find some of the information you have marked constitutes motor vehicle record information. However, we find some the remaining information you have marked is not motor vehicle record information subject to section 552.130 and the department may not withhold it on this basis. With the exception of what we have marked for release, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.147 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the social security number of a living person. *Id.* § 552.147(a). Upon review, we find the department may withhold the social security numbers you have marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the CHRI you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the fingerprints you have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we have marked and the dates of birth of public citizens under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of what we have marked for release, the department must

²Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department may withhold the social security numbers you have marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Mili Gosar
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MG/akg

Ref: ID# 585953

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)