



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 16, 2015

Mr. Stephen D. Gates
Assistant City Attorney
City of Midland
P.O. Box 1152
Midland, Texas 79702

OR2015-24102

Dear Mr. Gates:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 587430 (Midland ID# 17564).

The City of Midland (the "city") received a request for all incident reports involving a named individual. The city states it has released some information to the requestor. The city claims the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception the city claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Govt Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, including section 261.201 of the Family Code. Section 261.201(a) provides as follows:

[T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, we find report numbers 2002-10280051, 120922028, 121012031, and 140730041 consist of files, reports, records, communications, or working papers used or developed in an investigation under chapter 261, so as to fall within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of section 261.201), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of section 261.201 of Family Code). You do not indicate the city has adopted a rule governing the release of this type of information; therefore, we assume that no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, we find the information we have marked is generally confidential pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code.

However, we note the requestor is a representative of the Probation Office of the United States District Court for the Western District of Texas (the “probation office”). Section 261.201(a) provides that information encompassed by subsection (a) may be disclosed “for purposes consistent with [the Family Code] and applicable federal or state law.” *Id.* § 261.201(a). Chapter 411 of the Government Code constitutes “applicable state law” in this instance. Section 411.089(a) of the Government Code provides that “[a] criminal justice agency is entitled to obtain from the [Texas Department of Public Safety] any criminal history record information maintained by the [Texas Department of Public Safety] about a person.” *See Gov’t Code* § 411.089(a). In addition, section 411.087(a) of the Government Code provides in pertinent part the following:

(a) [a] person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter or Subchapter E-1 to obtain from the [Texas Department of Public Safety] criminal history record information maintained by the [Texas Department of Public Safety] that relates to another person is authorized to:

....

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state criminal history record information maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

Id. § 411.087(a)(2). We note criminal history record information (“CHRI”) is defined as “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *See id.* § 411.082(2). Thus, report number 140730041 contains CHRI of the named individual. However, a criminal justice agency that receives CHRI from another criminal justice agency pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) may only receive such information for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* §§ 411.083(c), .087(b); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997) (discussing limitations on release of criminal history record information).

You acknowledge the requestor represents a criminal justice agency and intends to use the CHRI for a criminal justice purpose. Thus, she is authorized to obtain CHRI from the city pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code, but only for purposes consistent with the Family Code. *See* Gov’t Code §§ 411.083(c), .087(a)(2); *see also* Fam. Code § 261.201(a). We are unable to determine whether the requestor intends to use the information for purposes consistent with the Family Code. Consequently, if the city determines the requestor intends to use the CHRI in report number 140730041 for purposes consistent with the Family Code, then the city must release the information at issue that is otherwise subject to section 261.201 of the Family Code and that shows the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. In that instance, the city must withhold the remaining information in report number 140730041 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. If the city determines the requestor does not intend to use the CHRI in report number 140730041 for purposes consistent with the Family Code, then the city must withhold this report in its entirety pursuant to section 552.101 in conjunction with section 261.201. *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(b)-(g) (listing entities authorized to receive section 261.201 information); Open Records Decision Nos. 655, 440 at 2 (1986) (construing predecessor statute). Furthermore, report numbers 2002-10280051, 120922028, and 121012031 must be withheld in their entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code, which makes confidential juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. Fam. Code § 58.007(c). The relevant portion of section 58.007 provides:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Id. § 58.007(c). Juvenile law enforcement records relating to delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007. *See id.* § 51.03(a)-(b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision”). For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the conduct at issue. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we find the information in Exhibit C involves children engaged in delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred after September 1, 1997. Thus, this information is generally confidential under section 58.007 of the Family Code.

However, section 58.007(e) of the Family Code provides, “[l]aw enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101 [of the Family Code] [or] a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code[.]” *Id.* § 58.007(e). Section 411.082 of the Government Code defines a “criminal justice agency” as including “a federal or state agency that is engaged in the administration of criminal justice under a statute or executive order and that allocates a substantial portion of its annual budget to the administration of criminal justice.” Gov’t Code § 411.082(3)(A).

As previously noted, the requestor is a representative of the probation office. We understand the probation office is a criminal justice agency for purposes of section 58.007(e). Accordingly, the requestor has a right to inspect the information in Exhibit C under section 58.007(e) of the Family Code, and it may not be withheld from this requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

We note, however, some the information in Exhibit C contains motor vehicle record information which is subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov’t Code

§ 552.130(a). Accordingly, the motor vehicle record information we have marked is generally excepted from disclosure under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

However, as noted above, the requestor has a statutory right to inspect Exhibit C pursuant to section 58.007(e) of the Family Code. Therefore, we must address the conflict between the access provided under section 58.007(e) of the Family Code and the confidentiality provided under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Although a specific statutory right of access prevails over general exceptions to disclosure under the Act, because section 552.130 has its own access provisions, we conclude section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. Where information falls within both a general and a specific provision of law, the specific provision prevails over the general. *See Horizon/CMS Healthcare Corp. v. Auld*, 34 S.W.3d 887, 901 (Tex. 2000) (“more specific statute controls over the more general”); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 277 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones). In this instance, section 58.007(e) generally applies to all juvenile law enforcement records, while section 552.130 specifically protects motor vehicle record information. Thus, we find the confidentiality provided by section 552.130 is more specific than the general right of access provided by section 58.007(e). Accordingly, in releasing Exhibit C to the requestor, the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681 - 82. A compilation of an individual’s criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep’t of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual’s privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one’s criminal history). Moreover, we find a compilation of a private citizen’s criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. Information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person does not implicate the privacy interest of the individual and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

The present request seeks any arrest reports pertaining to the named individual. This request requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the individual named in the request, thus implicating the named individual’s right to privacy. Thus, to the extent the city maintains law enforcement records, other than the submitted records we have indicated under sections 261.201 and 58.007 of the Family Code, listing the

named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the city must generally withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note, however, the requestor, as a representative of the probation office, may have a right of access to CHRI in this information pursuant to chapter 411 of the Government Code. You acknowledge the requestor intends to use any CHRI for a criminal justice purpose. Accordingly, to the extent the city maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, we conclude the city must make available to the requestor the CHRI that shows the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. *See Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common law principle). In that event, to the extent it exists, the city must withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, the city must withhold report numbers 2002-10280051, 120922028, and 121012031 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. If the city determines the requestor intends to use the CHRI in report number 140730041 for purposes consistent with the Family Code, then the city must release the information at issue that is otherwise subject to section 261.201 and that shows the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. In that instance, the city must withhold the remaining information in report number 140730041 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. If the city determines the requestor does not intend to use the CHRI for purposes consistent with the Family Code, then the city must also withhold report number 140730041 in its entirety pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. The city must generally release Exhibit C to this requestor pursuant to section 58.007(e) of the Family Code; however, in releasing this information, the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. To the extent the city maintains any remaining unspecified law enforcement records listing the named individual as a suspect, arrested person, or criminal defendant, the city must make available to the requestor the CHRI from those records that shows the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions, but must withhold under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy any remaining information listing the named individual as a suspect, arrested person, or criminal defendant.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Katelyn Blackburn-Rader
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KB-R/akg

Ref: ID# 587430

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)