



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 17, 2015

Mr. Stephen D. Gates
Assistant City Attorney
City of Midland
P.O. Box 1152
Midland, Texas 79701

OR2015-24149

Dear Mr. Gates:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 587576 (ID# 17615).

The Midland Police Department (the "department") received a request for any contacts or arrests of a named individual. You state you have released some information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses information protected by other statutes such as section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides as follows:

- (a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). We find Exhibit C was used or developed in an investigation by the department of suspected child abuse or neglect under chapter 261 of the Family Code. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of section 261.201), 261.2001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Thus, Exhibit C is within the scope of section 261.201(a). There is no indication the department has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information. Therefore, we assume that no such regulation exists. Accordingly, we find Exhibit C is generally confidential under section 261.201(a) of the Family Code.

In this instance, however, the requestor is a probation officer with the United States District Court for the Western District of Texas Probation Office (the “probation office”). Section 261.201(a) provides information encompassed by subsection (a) may be disclosed “for purposes consistent with [the Family Code] and applicable federal or state law.” *Id.* § 261.201(a). Section 411.089(a) of the Government Code provides a criminal justice agency is entitled to obtain from the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) any criminal history record information (“CHRI”) maintained by the DPS about a person. *See Gov’t Code* § 411.089(a); *see also id.* § 411.083(b)(1) (DPS shall grant criminal justice agencies access to CHRI). *See id.* In addition, section 411.087(a) of the Government Code provides, in part:

(a) [A] person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter or subchapter E-1 to obtain from [DPS CHRI] maintained by [DPS] that relates to another person is authorized to:

...

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state [CHRI] maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

Id. § 411.087(a)(2)). CHRI is defined as “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *See id.* § 411.082(2). Thus, the information at issue contains CHRI of the named individual. However, a criminal justice agency that receives CHRI from another criminal justice agency pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) may receive such information only for a criminal justice

purpose. *See id.* §§ 411.083(c), .087(b); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997) (discussing limitations on release of CHRI). Thus, to the extent the requestor represents a “criminal justice agency,” the requestor is authorized to obtain CHRI from the department pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code, but only for a criminal justice purpose. *See Gov’t Code* §§ 411.083(c), .087(a)(2); *see also* Fam. Code § 261.201(a).

A “criminal justice agency” is defined in part as “a federal or state agency that is engaged in the administration of criminal justice under a statute or executive order and that allocates a substantial portion of its annual budget to the administration of criminal justice[.]” Gov’t Code § 411.082(3)(A). “Administration of criminal justice” has the meaning assigned to it by article 60.01 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. *See id.* § 411.082(1). Article 60.01 defines “administration of criminal justice” as the “performance of any of the following activities: detection, apprehension, detention, pretrial release, post-trial release, prosecution, adjudication, correctional supervision, or rehabilitation of an offender. The term includes criminal identification activities and the collection, storage, and dissemination of criminal history record information.” Crim. Proc. Code art. 60.01(1).

You state the probation office is a criminal justice agency as defined by section 411.082 and the requested information will be used for criminal justice purposes. However, we are unable to determine whether the requestor intends to use the information in Exhibit C for purposes consistent with the Family Code. Consequently, if the department determines the requestor intends to use the CHRI for purposes consistent with the Family Code, then the department must release from Exhibit C information that shows the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. *See Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common law principle); *see also CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law). In that instance, the department must withhold the remaining information in Exhibit C under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. If the department determines the requestor does not intend to use the CHRI for purposes consistent with the Family Code, then the department must withhold Exhibit C in its entirety pursuant to section 552.101 in conjunction with section 261.201. *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(b)-(g), (k) (listing entities authorized to receive 261.201 information); Open Records Decision Nos. 655 (1997), 440 at 2 (1986) (construing predecessor statute).

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007. The relevant language of section 58.007 reads as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise,

concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

...

(e) Law enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101, a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code, the child, and the child's parent or guardian.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c), (e). Section 58.007(c) is applicable to records of juvenile delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. *See id.* § 51.03(a), (b) (defining "delinquent conduct" and "conduct indicating a need for supervision" for purposes of section 58.007). For purposes of section 58.007(c), "child" means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we find case numbers 2004-01190004 and 2007-06010067 involve juvenile delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred after September 1, 1997. Therefore, case numbers 2004-01190004 and 2007-06010067 are generally confidential pursuant to section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

However, as noted above, the requestor is a probation officer with the probation office. Section 58.007(e) of the Family Code gives a "criminal justice agency as . . . defined by Section 411.082, Government Code" a right of access to juvenile law enforcement records. *Id.* § 58.007(e). As noted above, you state the probation office is a criminal justice agency as defined by section 411.082. We note the named individual is a juvenile offender in case number 2004-1190004. Therefore, the requestor has a right of access to case number 2004-01190004 in its entirety under section 58.007(e) of the Family Code, and the department may not withhold the submitted information from this requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

We note the named individual is an adult offender in case number 2007-06010067. Thus, the requestor does not have a right of access to case number 2007-06010067 under section 58.007(e) of the Family Code. However, case number 2007-06010067 contains the CHRI of the individual named in the request. As previously noted, the requestor is a representative of the probation office, a criminal justice agency, and as such has a right of access to some of this otherwise protected information pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.087(a)(2). A criminal justice agency that receives CHRI from another criminal justice agency pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) may receive such information only for a criminal justice purpose. As noted above, the requestor is engaged in the administration of criminal justice for purposes of chapter 411 and intends to use the requested CHRI for a criminal justice purpose. *See* Gov't Code §§ 411.083(c), .087(a)(2). Thus, pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2), the requestor generally has a right of access to the information that shows the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions from case number 2007-06010067. Accordingly, there is a conflict between the confidentiality provided by section 58.007(c) of the Family Code and the requestor's right of access to the named individual's CHRI in case number 2007-06010067 under section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Where information falls within both a general and a specific statutory provision, the specific provision prevails over the general statute. *See id.* § 311.026 (where general statutory provision conflicts with specific provision, specific provision prevails as exception to general provision unless the general provision is the later enactment and the manifest intent is that the general provision prevail); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 277 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones). In this instance, although section 58.007(c) generally makes juvenile law enforcement records confidential, section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code gives specific types of requestors, criminal justice agencies, access to particular information, CHRI, for a criminal justice purpose. Thus, the statutory right of access granted to a criminal justice agency by section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code prevails over the more general confidentiality provision of section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. Therefore, notwithstanding section 58.007(c), the department must make available to this requestor information within case number 2007-06010067 that shows the types of allegations made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the remaining information within case number 2007-06010067 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

We note portions of case number 2004-01190004 are subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country

is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must generally withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked in case number 2004-01190004 under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

However, as previously noted, the requestor has right of access to case number 2004-01190004 pursuant to section 58.007(e) of the Family Code. Therefore, we must address the conflict between the access provided under section 58.007(e) of the Family Code and the confidentiality provided under section 552.130 of the Government Code. In this instance, section 58.007(e) generally applies to all juvenile law enforcement records, while section 552.130 specifically protects motor vehicle record information. Although a specific statutory right of access prevails over general exceptions to disclosure under the Act, because section 552.130 has its own access provisions, we conclude section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. Thus, we find the confidentiality provided by section 552.130 is more specific than the general right of access provided by section 58.007(e). Accordingly, in releasing case number 2004-01190004 to the requestor, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, if the department determines the requestor intends to use the CHRI in Exhibit C for purposes consistent with the Family Code, then the department must release from Exhibit C the information that shows the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. In that instance, the department must withhold the remaining information in Exhibit C under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. If the department determines the requestor does not intend to use the CHRI for purposes consistent with the Family Code, then the department must withhold Exhibit C in its entirety pursuant to section 552.101 in conjunction with section 261.201. The department must release to this requestor information within case number 2007-06010067 that shows the types of allegations made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the remaining information within case number 2007-06010067 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. In releasing case number 2004-01190004 to the requestor pursuant to section 58.007(e), the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Cole Hutchison".

Cole Hutchison
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CH/bhf

Ref: ID# 587576

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)