



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 2, 2015

Mr. Vance Hinds
Assistant County & District Attorney
County of Ellis
109 South Jackson
Waxahachie, Texas 75165

OR2015-25143

Dear Mr. Hinds:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 588861.

The Ellis County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for all offense, incident, and investigative reports pertaining to a named individual. The sheriff's office claims portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions the sheriff's office claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977).

The sheriff's office asserts the information it has marked relates to a pending criminal investigation and prosecution and release would interfere with the investigation. Based upon these representations, we find the sheriff's office has demonstrated the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of

crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, the sheriff's office may generally withhold the information at issue under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Next, we must address whether the requestor has a right of access to the information subject to section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. In this instance, the requestor is an investigator for the Texas Education Agency (the "TEA"), which has assumed the duties of the State Board for Educator Certification (the "SBEC").¹ Section 22.082 of the Education Code provides the SBEC "may obtain from any law enforcement or criminal justice agency all criminal history record information ["CHRI"] and all records contained in any closed criminal investigation file that relate to a specific applicant for or holder of a certificate issued under Subchapter B, Chapter 21 [of the Education Code]." Educ. Code § 22.082. Section 411.090 of the Government Code grants the SBEC a right of access to obtain CHRI from the Texas Department of Public Safety (the "DPS") regarding persons who have applied to the SBEC. *See Gov't Code* § 411.090. Additionally, section 411.0901 of the Government Code specifically provides the TEA with a right of access to obtain CHRI maintained by the DPS regarding certain school employees or applicants for employment. *See id.* § 411.0901. Pursuant to section 411.087 of the Government Code, an agency entitled to obtain CHRI from the DPS also is authorized to "obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state [CHRI] maintained by that [agency]." *Id.* § 411.087(a)(2). CHRI consists of "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, information, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." *Id.* § 411.082(2). We note TEA states the individual at issue is seeking or currently holds a certificate.

We find, when read together, sections 22.082 of the Education Code and 411.087 of the Government Code give TEA a statutory right of access to portions of the information at issue. *Cf. Brookshire v. Houston Indep. Sch. Dist.*, 508 S.W.2d 675, 678-79 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1974, no writ) (when legislature defines term in one statute and uses same term in relation to same subject matter in latter statute, later use of term is same as previously defined). Thus, we conclude the sheriff's office must release to this requestor information that shows the types of allegations made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. *See Open Records Decision No. 451* (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under Act). The sheriff's office may withhold the remaining information it has marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

¹The 79th Texas Legislature passed House Bill 1116, which required the transfer of the SBEC's administrative functions and services to the TEA, effective September 1, 2005.

The sheriff's office claims some of the remaining information is protected by common-law privacy. Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.² *Texas Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the dates of birth it has marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit, a motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. Gov't Code § 552.130(a). Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the information it has marked, and the additional information we have marked, in the remaining information under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.147 provides "the social security number of a living person is excepted from" required public disclosure under the Act. *Id.* § 552.147(a). The sheriff's office may withhold the social security number it has marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

In summary, the sheriff's office must release to this requestor information that shows the types of allegations made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. The sheriff's office may withhold the remaining information it has marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the dates of birth it has marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information it has marked, and the

²Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

additional information we have marked, in the remaining information under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office may withhold the social security number it has marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Rahat Huq
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

RSH/som

Ref: ID# 588861

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)