



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 4, 2015

Ms. Captoria Brown
Paralegal
Office of the City Attorney
City of Carrollton
1945 East Jackson Road
Carrollton, Texas 75006

OR2015-25464

Dear Ms. Brown:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 589517 (City ID No. 5789).

The City of Carrollton (the "city") received a request for any 9-1-1 or domestic violence calls to a named individual's address over a specified period of time. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

We note the submitted information indicates the requestor is a representative of a child-placing agency that is licensed by the Texas Department of Family Protective Services ("DFPS") in accordance with chapter 42 of the Human Resources Code, and the individual whose information she requested is a prospective foster parent. *See generally* Hum. Res. Code ch. 42. Pursuant to rules promulgated by the Executive Commission of the Health and Human Resources Commission (the "executive commission") under chapter 42 of the Human Resources Code, child-placing agencies are required to complete a foster home screening prior to verifying a foster home. *See* Hum. Res. Code § 42.042(a), (e), (f)-(g) (the executive commission shall make rules to carry out provisions of chapter 42, including minimum standards for child-placing agencies, child-care services, licensed child-care facilities, and registered family homes). As part of the screening, the agency must obtain

certain information as set forth at section 749.2447. 40 T.A.C. §§ 749.2445(c)(1), .2471(1); *cf.* Hum. Res. Code § 42.0561 (providing in part that “[b]efore . . . a child-placing agency may issue a verification certificate for an agency foster home, the . . . child-placing agency must obtain information relating to each family violence report at the applicant’s residence to which a law enforcement agency responded during the 12 months preceding the date of the application. The applicant shall provide the information on a form prescribed by the department.”). Section 749.2447(7) provides a child-placing agency must obtain, document, and assess, in part, the following information about a prospective foster home:

The results of criminal history and central registry background checks conducted on the prospective foster parents[.] . . . With respect to law enforcement service call information, [the child-placing agency] *must do the following*:

(A) *Obtain service call information from the appropriate law enforcement agency for the prospective foster parents’ addresses for the past two years.* Discuss with the prospective foster parents any service call information that [the child-placing agency] obtain[s] from a law enforcement agency and the facts surrounding the incident.

...

(C) Assess and document information obtained from law enforcement and any discussion with the prospective foster parents in the foster home screening.

40 T.A.C. § 749.2447(7)(A), (C) (emphasis added); *see id.* § 749.2445(a); *see also id.* §§ 745.21(8) (defining “child-placing agency”), (32) (defining “permit”), (33) (defining “permit holder”), 749.41(1) (defining “you” as applicant or permit holder), .43 (words and terms in chapter 749 have meanings assigned under section 745.21). Thus, section 749.2447(7) of title 40 of the Texas Administrative Code requires a child-placing agency to obtain all service call information for a two year period for service calls to the addresses of prospective foster parents from appropriate law enforcement agencies. *See id.* § 749.2447(7)(A), (C). Accordingly, we find a child-placing agency licensed by DFPS under chapter 42 of the Human Resources Code has a right of access to this information under section 749.2447(7) when it is obtained for the purpose of verifying a prospective foster home pursuant to the requirements of section 749.2445.

In this instance, the requestor is seeking information pertaining to calls for service involving a prospective foster parent at her residence for the previous year. Accordingly, we conclude the requestor has a right of access to the submitted information pursuant to section 749.2447(7) of title 40 of the Texas Administrative Code. We note a specific statutory right of access overcomes general exceptions to disclosure in the Act and the

common law. *See Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common-law principle); Open Records Decision Nos. 623 at 3 (1994) (exceptions in the Act generally inapplicable to information that statutes expressly make public), 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge in statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Act). Accordingly, the department may not withhold any of the submitted information on the basis of common-law privacy. Nevertheless, we will address the city's remaining arguments under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information that is made confidential by statute. As part of the Texas Homeland Security Act (“HSA”), sections 418.176 through 418.182 were added to chapter 418 of the Government Code. These provisions make certain information related to terrorism confidential. You assert portions of the submitted information are confidential under section 418.179(a) of the Government Code, which provides:

Information is confidential if the information:

- (1) is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental entity for the purpose of preventing, detecting, or investigating an act of terrorism or related criminal activity; and
- (2) relates to the details of the encryption codes or security keys for a public communications system.

Id. § 418.179. Section 418.182(a) provides as follows:

- (a) Except as provided by Subsections (b) and (c), information, including access codes and passwords, in the possession of a governmental entity that relates to the specifications, operating procedures, or location of a security system used to protect public or private property from an act of terrorism or related criminal activity is confidential.

Id. § 418.182(a). The fact that information may relate to a governmental body's security concerns does not make the information per se confidential under the HSA. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 at 3 (1996) (language of confidentiality provision controls scope of its protection). Furthermore, the mere recitation by a governmental body of a statute's key terms is not sufficient to demonstrate the applicability of a claimed provision. As with any

exception to disclosure, a governmental body asserting one of the confidentiality provisions of the HSA must adequately explain how the responsive records fall within the scope of the claimed provision. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must explain how claimed exception to disclosure applies).

You state portions of the information you have marked are excepted from disclosure under section 418.179 of the Government Code. However, we find the information you have marked does not contain the encryption codes or security keys for a public communications system, nor have you demonstrated this information is otherwise related to the encryption codes or security keys for a public communications system. Therefore, we find the city may not withhold this information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 418.179 of the Government Code.

You also seek to withhold an access code you have marked in the submitted information under section 418.182 of the Government Code. You state the access code relates to the specifications, operating procedures, or location of a security system used to protect public or private property from an act of terrorism or related criminal activity. Based on your representation and our review, we find the city must generally withhold the information you have marked under section 418.182 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *Id.* § 552.130(a). Upon review, we find the city must generally withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

However, as previously noted, the requestor has a statutory right of access to the submitted information pursuant to section 749.2447(7) of title 40 of the Texas Administrative Code. As noted above, a statutory right of access generally prevails over the Act's general exceptions to disclosure. *See* ORDs 613 at 4, 451 at 4. We note that because section 552.130 of the Government Code has its own access provisions, section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. Therefore, we must address the conflict between the access provided under section 749.2447(7) and the confidentiality provided under sections 418.182 and 552.130 of the Government Code. Where information falls within both a general and specific provision of law, the specific provision prevails over the general. *See* Gov't Code § 311.026 (where general statutory provision conflicts with specific provision, specific provision prevails as exception to general provision unless general provision is later enactment and manifest intent is that general provision prevails); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 277 (Tex. Crim. App.1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones). Although section 749.2447(7) generally allows a child-placing agency access to service call information, section 418.182

specifically protects information that relates to security systems used to protect public or private property from an act of terrorism or related criminal activity and section 552.130 specifically protects motor vehicle record information. Thus, we find the confidentiality provided by sections 418.182 and 552.130 are more specific than the right of access provided by section 749.2447(7). Accordingly, we conclude, notwithstanding the statutory right of access granted to the requestor by section 749.2447(7) of title 40 of the Texas Administrative Code, the city must withhold the access code you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 418.182 of the Government Code and the motor vehicle record information you marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the city must withhold the access code you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 418.182 of the Government Code. The city must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information to the requestor pursuant to section 749.2447(7) of title 40 of the Texas Administrative Code.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Thana Hussaini
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

TH/som

¹Because the requestor has a special right of access to the information being released, the city must again seek a decision from this office if it receives another request for the same information from another requestor.

Ref: ID# 589517

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)