



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 10, 2015

Mr. John C. West
General Counsel
Office of the Inspector General
Texas Department of Criminal Justice
4616 West Howard Lane, Suite 250
Austin, Texas 78728

OR2015-25903

Dear Mr. West:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 590146.

The Texas Department of Criminal Justice's Office of the Inspector General (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to the death of a named inmate. You state the department has released some of the requested information, including the custodial death report. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 49.18(b). You state the department will redact social security numbers under section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.¹ You also state the department will information under sections 552.117 and 552.1175 of the

¹Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

Government Code.² You claim most of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, 552.107, 552.108, 552.134, and 552.137 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen’s date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court’s rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees’ dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees’ privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.³ *Tex. Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens’ dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. However, because privacy is a personal right that lapses at death, the common-law right to privacy does not encompass information that relates only to a deceased individual. Accordingly, information pertaining to a deceased individual may not be withheld on common-law privacy grounds. *See Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref d n.r.e.); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 272 at 1 (1981) (privacy rights lapse upon death). Thus, the department must withhold the dates of birth we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.134 of the Government Code is applicable to information related to inmates of the department. Section 552.134(a) states that

²Section 552.024 of the Government Code permits a governmental body to redact information subject to section 552.117 of the Government Code in certain situations without requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.024(c). Section 552.1175(f) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact under section 552.1175(b), without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office, the home addresses and telephone numbers, emergency contact information, social security number, and family member information of a peace officer as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure who properly elects to keep this information confidential. *See id.* § 552.1175(b), (f).

³Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a).

[e]xcept as provided by Subsection (b) or by Section 552.029 [of the Government Code], information obtained or maintained by the [department] is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the department.

Gov't Code § 552.134(a). Section 552.029 of the Government Code provides in part that

[n]otwithstanding Section . . . 552.134, the following information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the [department] is subject to required disclosure under Section 552.021:

. . .

(8) basic information regarding the death of an inmate in custody, an incident involving the use of force, or an alleged crime involving the inmate.

Id. § 552.029(8). Thus, section 552.134 is explicitly made subject to section 552.029. Although section 552.134(a) is generally applicable to the information in Exhibit C, we note the information pertains to the named inmate's death in custody, which involved the use of force. Therefore, the department must release basic information about the inmate's death pursuant to section 552.029. The basic information that must be released includes the time and place of the incident, the names of inmates and of department employees who were involved, a brief narrative of the incident, a brief description of any injuries sustained by anyone involved, and information regarding any criminal charges or disciplinary actions that were filed as a result of the incident. Accordingly, except for basic information under section 552.029(8) of the Government Code, the department must withhold Exhibit C under section 552.134 of the Government Code.⁴

In summary, the department must withhold the dates of birth we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department must withhold Exhibit C under section 552.134 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

⁴As we are able to make these determinations, we need not address your other arguments against disclosure of this information. We note basic information under section 552.029(8) corresponds to the basic front-page information that may not be withheld under section 552.108 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.108(c); *Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177, 186-88 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976); Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Lee Seidlits
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CLS/som

Ref: ID# 590146

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)