



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 11, 2015

Ms. Linda Pemberton
Paralegal
Office of the City Attorney
City of Killeen
P.O. Box 1329
Killeen, Texas 76540

OR2015-26012

Dear Ms. Pemberton:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 590414 (Killeen ID W017402).

The Killeen Police Department (the "department") received a request for all information pertaining to a named individual, including a specified report. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

Upon review, we find the present request, in part, requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the named individual. Accordingly, we find the request implicates the named individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note, however, the department has submitted a report which does not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. Further, the department has submitted information pertaining to the specified report. This information does not implicate the privacy interests of the named individual, and the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy as a criminal history compilation.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information made confidential by section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Report number 15-005820 consists of information used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected abuse under chapter 261 of the Family Code. Accordingly, this information falls within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining "child" for the purposes of this section as a person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1) (defining "abuse" for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). As we have no indication the department has adopted a rule governing the release of this type of information, we assume that no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, and based on our review, we conclude report number 15-008520 is confidential pursuant to section 261.201(a) of the Family Code, and the department must withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection,

investigation, or prosecution of crime. . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state report number 10-011719 pertains to an open and pending case. However, this report pertains to an investigation of interference with child custody that occurred on August 20, 2010. We note the longest possible statute of limitations for interference with child custody is three years from the date of the commission of the offense. Crim. Proc. Code art. 12.01(7) (limitations on felony not otherwise listed in article 12.01 of Code of Criminal Procedure is three years from date of offense); Penal Code § 25.03(d) (providing that interference with child custody is a state jail felony offense). Thus, the statute of limitations for the offense at issue has expired. Thus, we find you have not demonstrated that release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Accordingly, the department may not withhold report number 10-011719 under section 552.108(a)(1).

We note report number 10-011719 contains dates of birth which are excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Indus. Found.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen’s date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court’s rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees’ dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees’ privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.¹ *Tex. Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens’ dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. We note the requestor has a special right of access under section 552.023 of the Government Code to information that would otherwise be withheld to protect her privacy. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.023(a) (person or person’s authorized representative has special right of access to information held by governmental body that relates to person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect person’s privacy interests); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning herself). Thus, with the exception of the requestor’s date of birth, the department must withhold all public citizens’ dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

¹Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a).

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold report number 15-008520 under section 261.201(a) of the Family Code in conjunction with section 552.101 of the Government Code. With the exception of the requestor's date of birth, the department must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Paige Lay
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PL/dls

Ref: ID# 590414

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)