



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 14, 2015

Mr. John C. West
General Counsel
TDCJ - Office of the Inspector General
4616 West Howard Lane, Suite 250
Austin, Texas 78728

Mr. Steve Smeltzer
Assistant General Counsel
TDCJ - Office of General Counsel
P.O. Box 4004
Huntsville, Texas 77342-4004

OR2015-26211

Dear Mr. West and Mr. Smeltzer:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 590658.

The Texas Department of Criminal Justice (the "department") received a request for information related to the death of a named inmate. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, 552.108, 552.117, 552.1175, 552.130, and 552.134 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information. We have also considered comments submitted by the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (interested party may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released).

Initially, we note some of the submitted information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a)(1) provides for the required public disclosure of "a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body[.]" unless it is excepted by section 552.108 of the Government Code or "made confidential under [the Act] or other law[.]" Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(1). The information at issue consists of a completed investigation that is subject to section 552.022(a)(1). The

information subject to section 552.022(a)(1) must be released unless it is either excepted under section 552.108 of the Government Code or is confidential under the Act or other law. *Id.* Although you assert the investigation is excepted from disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code, this section is discretionary and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); Open Records Decision No. 542 at 4 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.103 may be waived); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally). Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the information at issue under section 552.103. You also raise section 552.108 of the Government Code for the investigation. As previously noted, section 552.022(a)(1) states information subject to that section may be withheld under section 552.108. Thus, we will consider your argument under section 552.108 for the information at issue. Further, because sections 552.101, 552.117, 552.1175, 552.130, and 552.134 of the Government Code can make information confidential under the Act, we will consider the applicability of these exceptions to the information at issue.

Section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[a]n internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution . . . if . . . release of the internal record or notation would interfere with law enforcement or prosecution[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(b)(1). Section 552.108(b)(1) is intended to protect “information which, if released, would permit private citizens to anticipate weaknesses in a police department, avoid detection, jeopardize officer safety, and generally undermine police efforts to effectuate the laws of this State.” *City of Fort Worth v. Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320, 327 (Tex. App.—Austin 2002, no pet.). To prevail on its claim that section 552.108(b)(1) excepts information from disclosure, a governmental body must do more than merely make a conclusory assertion that releasing the information would interfere with law enforcement. Instead, the governmental body must meet its burden of explaining how and why release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement and crime prevention. *See* Open Records Decision No. 562 at 10 (1990) (construing statutory predecessor). This office has concluded that section 552.108(b) excepts from public disclosure information relating to the security or operation of a law enforcement agency. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 531 (1989) (release of detailed use of force guidelines would unduly interfere with law enforcement), 252 (1980) (section 552.108 of the Government Code is designed to protect investigative techniques and procedures used in law enforcement), 143 (1976) (disclosure of specific operations or specialized equipment directly related to investigation or detection of crime may be excepted). Section 552.108(b)(1) is not applicable, however, to generally known policies and procedures. *See, e.g.*, ORDs 531 at 2-3 (Penal Code provisions, common law rules, and constitutional limitations on use of force not protected), 252 at 3 (governmental body failed to indicate why investigative procedures and techniques requested were any different from those commonly known).

You state a portion the submitted information consists of the department's emergency response procedures. You argue the release of this information would compromise security measures and undermine the department's ability to respond to emergencies. Having considered your argument, we conclude the department may withhold the information at issue, which you have marked, under section 552.108(b)(1).¹

Section 552.134 of the Government Code is applicable to information related to inmates of the department. Section 552.134 states, in relevant part:

(a) Except as provided by Subsection (b) or by Section 552.029, information obtained or maintained by the [department] is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if it is information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the department.

Gov't Code § 552.134(a). However, section 552.029 of the Government Code provides:

Notwithstanding Section . . . 552.134, the following information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the [department] is subject to required disclosure under Section 552.021:

...

(8) basic information regarding the death of an inmate in custody, an incident involving the use of force, or an alleged crime involving the inmate.

Id. § 552.029(8). Thus, the legislature explicitly made section 552.134 subject to section 552.029. Although the inmate to whom the information at issue pertains is deceased, section 552.134 is applicable to information that relates to the decedent as an inmate. Thus, we find section 552.134 is generally applicable to the information at issue. We note, however, the information in question is related to the death of an inmate in custody. Therefore, basic information about this inmate's death is subject to disclosure under section 552.029(8). Basic information under section 552.029(8) includes the time and place of the incident, the names of inmates and of department employees who were involved, a brief narrative of the incident, a brief description of any injuries sustained by anyone involved, and information regarding any criminal charges or disciplinary actions that were filed as a result of the incident. Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, which you state you have released, the department must withhold the remaining information under section 552.134 of the Government Code.

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

In summary, the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code. With the exception of basic information, which you state you have released, the department must withhold the remaining information under section 552.134 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Ramsey A. Abarca
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

RAA/dls

Ref: ID# 590658

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)