



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

January 5, 2016

Ms. Katherine Antwi Green
Associate General Counsel
University of North Texas System
1155 Union Circle #310907
Denton, Texas 76203-5017

OR2016-00247

Dear Ms. Green:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 593027 (UNT PIR No. 003535).

The University of North Texas Police Department (the "department") received two requests from the same requestor for personnel records related to a named department officer and a specified case report. You state the department will make some information available to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Initially, we note the information you have marked Representative Samples 3 and 4 consists of department officers' body worn camera recordings. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661(a) provides:

A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and
- (3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). In this instance, the requestor does not give the requisite information under section 1701.661(a). As the requestor did not properly request the body worn camera recordings at issue pursuant to chapter 1701, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released.² Please note, however, pursuant to section 1701.661(b), a “failure to provide all the information required by Subsection (a) to be part of a request for recorded information does not preclude the requestor from making a future request for the same recorded information.” *Id.*

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, including section 51.971 of the Education Code. Section 51.971 provides, in relevant part, the following:

(a) In this section:

(1) “Compliance program” means a process to assess and ensure compliance by the officers and employees of an institution of higher education with applicable laws, rules, regulations, and policies, including matters of:

(A) ethics and standards of conduct;

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your argument against disclosure of this information.

(B) financial reporting;

(C) internal accounting controls; or

(D) auditing.

(2) “Institution of higher education” has the meaning assigned by Section 61.003.

...

(c) The following are confidential:

(1) information that directly or indirectly reveals the identity of an individual who made a report to the compliance program office of an institution of higher education, sought guidance from the office, or participated in an investigation conducted under the compliance program; and

(2) information that directly or indirectly reveals the identity of an individual as a person who is alleged to have or may have planned, initiated, or participated in activities that are the subject of a report made to the compliance program office of an institution of higher education if, after completing an investigation, the office determines the report to be unsubstantiated or without merit.

(d) Subsection (c) does not apply to information related to an individual who consents to disclosure of the information.

Educ. Code § 51.971(a), (c)-(d). You state the University of North Texas (the “university”) is an institution of higher education for purposes of section 61.003 of the Education Code. *See id.* § 51.971(a)(2). You state the information you have marked Representative Sample 1 consists of a completed compliance investigation. You state the investigation was undertaken by the university’s Office of Equal Employment. Accordingly, we agree the information at issue pertains to the university’s compliance program for the purposes of section 51.971. *See id.* § 51.971(a).

You state Representative Sample 1 is subject to section 51.971(c). Section 51.971(c)(1) makes confidential information that identifies individuals as complainants, as having sought guidance from a compliance program, or as participants in an investigation conducted under a compliance program. *Id.* § 51.971(c)(1). Section 51.971(c)(2) makes confidential information that identifies individuals alleged to have committed the activities that are the

subject of a complaint made to a compliance program office if the office determines the report is unsubstantiated. *Id.* § 51.971(c)(2). However, subsection (c) does not apply to information related to an individual who consents to disclosure of the information. *Id.* § 51.971(d). You state the investigation at issue concluded in a determination that the allegations concerning the subject of the complaint were without merit. Upon review, we agree the information at issue identifies individuals as participants in the compliance program investigation or as individuals alleged to have committed the activity that is the subject of the unsubstantiated complaint. We understand these individuals have not consented to release of their information. Accordingly, we find the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 51.971(c) of the Education Code. However, we find the remaining information you have marked is not subject to section 51.971(c) of the Education Code. Thus, the department may not withhold this information on this basis.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime [if] release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the information you have marked Representative Sample 2 pertains to a pending criminal prosecution. Based on this representation, we conclude the release of the information you marked would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Accordingly, the department may withhold the information you have marked in Representative Sample 2 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov’t Code § 552.130(a). The information you have marked Representative Samples 5 and 6 consists of video recordings containing motor vehicle record information. You state the department does not have the technological capability to redact this information from these video recordings. Accordingly, we find the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked in Representative Samples 1 and 2, and Representative Samples 5 and 6 in their entirety, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. *See Open Records Decision No. 364* (1983).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.³ *Texas Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. Upon review, we find the department must withhold the identifiable public citizens' dates of birth in the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, the department: (1) need not release Representative Samples 3 and 4 pursuant to section 1701.661(a) of the Occupations Code, (2) must withhold the information we have marked in Representative Sample 1 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 51.971(c) of the Education Code, (3) may withhold the information you have marked in Representative Sample 2 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code, (4) must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked in Representative Samples 1 and 2, and Representative Samples 5 and 6 in their entirety, under section 552.130 of the Government Code, (5) must withhold the identifiable public citizens' dates of birth in the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy, and (6) must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/>

³Section 552.102(a) exempts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

[url_ruling_info.shtml](#), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Tim Neal". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Tim Neal
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

TN/bhf

Ref: ID# 593027

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)