



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

January 12, 2016

Mr. James Kopp
Assistant City Attorney
Office of the City Attorney
City of San Antonio
P.O. Box 839966
San Antonio, Texas 78283-3966

OR2016-00911

Dear Mr. James Kopp:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 593775 (COSA File No. W099872).

The City of San Antonio (the "city") received a request for an accident report, including officer notes and video, pertaining to a specified accident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, article 2.139 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, as added by House Bill 3791 by the 84th Texas Legislature,² provides:

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

²Act of May 30, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 1124, § 1 (codified at Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.139).

A person stopped or arrested on suspicion of an offense under Section 49.04, 49.045, 49.07, or 49.08, Penal Code, is entitled to receive from a law enforcement agency employing the peace officer who made the stop or arrest a copy of any video made by or at the direction of the officer that contains footage of:

- (1) the stop;
- (2) the arrest;
- (3) the conduct of the person stopped during any interaction with the officer, including during the administration of a field sobriety test; or
- (4) a procedure in which a specimen of the person's breath or blood is taken.

Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.139. We note the requestor was stopped or arrested on suspicion of an offense under section 49.04 of the Penal Code and the submitted video contains footage subject to section 2.139 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. *See* Penal Code § 49.04 (person commits offense if person is intoxicated while operating motor vehicle in public place). Therefore, the requestor is entitled to receive a copy of this video pursuant to article 2.139. Although the city asserts section 552.108 to withhold this information, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). Because section 552.108 is a general exception under the Act, the requestor's statutory access under article 2.139 prevails and the city may not withhold the submitted video recording under section 552.108. As you raise no further exceptions against disclosure of the video recording, the city must release it to the requestor.

Next, we note the remaining information contains a CR-3 accident report. Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information subject to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065 applies only to a written report of an accident required under section 550.061, 550.062, or 601.004. Transp. Code § 550.065(a)(1). Chapter 550 requires the creation of a written report when the accident resulted in injury to or the death of a person or damage to the property of any person to the apparent extent of \$1,000 or more. *Id.* §§ 550.061 (operator's accident report), .062 (officer's accident report). An accident report is privileged and for the confidential use of the Texas Department of Transportation or a local governmental agency of Texas that has use for the information for accident prevention purposes. *Id.* § 550.065(b). However, a governmental entity may release an accident report

in accordance with subsections (c) and (c-1). *Id.* § 550.065(c), (c-1). Section 550.065(c) provides a governmental entity shall release an accident report to a person or entity listed under this subsection. *Id.* § 550.065(c).

The requestor is a person listed under section 550.065(c). Although the city asserts section 552.108 of the Government Code to withhold the information, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.*, ORDs 613 at 4, 451. Because section 552.108 is a general exception under the Act, the requestor's statutory access under section 550.065(c) prevails and the city may not withhold the information under section 552.108. Thus, the city must release the CR-3 accident report to the requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c).

The city asserts the remaining information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108(a) of the Government Code, which excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the information at issue would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706, 710 (Tex. 1977). We note the submitted information includes a DIC-24 statutory warning and a DIC-25 notice of suspension. Because the city provided copies of these forms to the arrestee, we find their release will not interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. Therefore, the city may not withhold the DIC-24 statutory warning or DIC-25 notice of suspension under section 552.108(a)(1). The city states the remaining information relates to an open criminal case within the city's police department. Based on this representation, we conclude the release of the remaining information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177, 186-87 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (delineating law enforcement interests present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information at issue.

However, section 552.108 of the Government Code does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of the submitted DIC-24 statutory warning, the submitted DIC-25 notice of suspension, and basic information, the city may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1).

In summary, the city must release the submitted video recording pursuant to article 2.139 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. The city must release the CR-3 accident report to the requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code. With the exception of

the submitted DIC-24 statutory warning, the submitted DIC-25 notice of suspension, and basic information, the city may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cole Hutchison
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CH/bhf

Ref: ID# 593775

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

³We note the requestor has a right of access beyond that of the general public to some of the information being released. See Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.139; Transp. Code § 550.065(c); Gov't Code § 552.023(a) (person or person's authorized representative has special right of access, beyond right of general public, to information held by governmental body that relates to person and is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect person's privacy interests); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual asks governmental body to provide him with information concerning himself).