



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 1, 2016

Ms. Jena R. Abel
Assistant General Counsel
Texas Board of Nursing
333 Guadalupe Street, Suite 3-460
Austin, Texas 78701

OR2016-02426

Dear Ms. Abel:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 596383.

The Texas Board of Nursing (the "board") received a request for any records regarding a named nurse licensee. You state you have redacted social security numbers under section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.¹ You state the board has released some information. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.136, and 552.137 of the Government Code.² We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information other statutes make confidential, such as section 301.466 of the Occupations Code, which provides:

(a) A complaint and investigation concerning a nurse under this subchapter and all information and material compiled by the board in connection with the complaint and investigation are:

¹Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See id.* § 552.147(b).

²We understand you to raise sections 552.136 and 552.137 of the Government Code based on your markings in the submitted information.

(1) confidential and not subject to disclosure under [the Act]; and

(2) not subject to disclosure, discovery, subpoena, or other means of legal compulsion for release to anyone other than the board or board employee or agent involved in license holder discipline.

(b) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), information regarding a complaint and an investigation may be disclosed to:

(1) a person involved with the board in a disciplinary action against the nurse;

(2) a nursing licensing or disciplinary board in another jurisdiction;

(3) a peer assistance program approved by the board under Chapter 467, Health and Safety Code;

(4) a law enforcement agency; or

(5) a person engaged in bona fide research, if all information identifying a specific individual has been deleted.

(c) The filing of formal charges against a nurse by the board, the nature of those charges, disciplinary proceedings of the board, and final disciplinary actions, including warnings and reprimands, by the board are not confidential and are subject to disclosure in accordance with [the Act].

Occ. Code § 301.466. You inform us Exhibit C and portions of Exhibit B consist of information that was created or compiled by the board in connection with board investigations concerning the named nurse licensee. You state the information at issue does not fall into any of the categories of information that are subject to disclosure under section 301.466(c). Based on your representations and our review, we agree the information at issue is confidential under section 301.466(a). Further, we find the requestor is not entitled to receive this information under section 301.466(b). Accordingly, we conclude the board must withhold Exhibit C and the portions of Exhibit B you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 301.466(a)(1) of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 301.207 of the Occupations Code. Section 301.207 provides as follows:

The following information that a person submits to the board for a petition for a declaratory order of eligibility for a license or for an application for an initial license or a license renewal under this chapter is confidential to the

same extent information collected on a nurse as part of an investigation of a complaint is confidential under Section 301.466:

- (1) information, including diagnosis and treatment, regarding a person's physical or mental condition, intemperate use of drugs or alcohol, or chemical dependency;
- (2) information regarding a person's criminal history; and
- (3) any other information in the petition for declaratory order of eligibility.

Id. § 301.207. You have marked portions of Exhibit B under section 301.207, which you state are confidential under this statute. Upon review, we agree the information you have marked in Exhibit B is confidential under section 301.207 of the Occupations Code. Further, we find the requestor is not entitled to receive this information under section 301.466(b), and the information at issue does not fall under section 301.466(c). Therefore, we conclude the board must withhold the information you have marked in Exhibit B under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 301.207 of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has also found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally highly intimate or embarrassing. See Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992) (personal financial information includes choice of particular insurance carrier), 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under common-law privacy). Further, under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 682. In considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in

disclosure.³ *Texas Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. Upon review, we find some of the remaining information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Thus, the board must withhold the information we have marked, along with the dates of birth of all public citizens, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code states “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” Gov’t Code § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). Upon review, we find the board must withhold the credit card numbers you have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. However, we find the remaining information does not include access device numbers excepted by section 552.136 of the Government Code and the board may not withhold any of the remaining information on that basis.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body,” unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *Id.* § 552.137(a)-(c). We note subsection 552.137(c)(5) states subsection 552.137(a) does not apply to an e-mail address “provided to a governmental body for the purpose of providing public comment or receiving notices related to an application for a license as defined by Section 2001.003(2) of [the Government Code], or receiving order or decisions from a governmental body.” *Id.* § 552.137(c)(5). Because we are unable to discern whether the e-mail address within the responsive documents falls within the scope of section 552.137(c), we must rule conditionally. To the extent the e-mail address you’ve marked is not excluded by subsection 552.137(c) of the Government Code, the board must withhold such e-mail address under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the individual to whom the e-mail address belongs affirmatively consents to its release. *See id.* § 552.137(b). However, to the extent the e-mail address at issue is excluded by subsection 552.137(c), the e-mail address may not be withheld under section 552.137 of the Government Code.

In summary, the board must withhold Exhibit C and the portions of Exhibit B you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 301.466(a)(1) of the Occupations Code. The board must withhold the information you have marked in Exhibit B under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 301.207 of the Occupations Code. The board must withhold the information we have marked, along with the dates of birth of all public citizens, under section 552.101

³Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a).

of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The board must withhold the credit card numbers you marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. To the extent the e-mail address you've marked is not excluded by subsection 552.137(c) of the Government Code, the board must withhold this e-mail address under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the individual to whom the e-mail address belongs affirmatively consents to its release. The board must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Ramsey A. Abarca
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

RAA/dls

Ref: ID# 596383

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)