



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 3, 2016

Mr. Brandon S. Shelby  
City Attorney  
City of Sherman  
P.O. Box 1106  
Sherman, Texas 75091

OR2016-02580

Dear Mr. Shelby:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 596730 (Ref. No. OR-2097; SPD No. 187).

The Sherman Police Department (the "department") received a request for three specified police reports involving the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation. Id.* at 683. Generally, only the information that either identifies or tends to identify a victim of sexual assault or other sex-related offense may be withheld under common-law privacy. However, a governmental body is required to withhold an entire report when identifying information is inextricably intertwined with other releasable information or when the requestor knows the identity of the

alleged victim. *See* Open Records Decisions Nos. 393 (1983), 339 (1982); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 440 (1986) (detailed descriptions of serious sexual offenses must be withheld).

In this instance, the requestor knows the identity of the alleged victim in report numbers 90-15609 and 90-16789. Thus, withholding only the victim's identifying information from the requestor would not preserve the victim's common-law right to privacy. Therefore, we conclude the department must withhold report numbers 90-15609 and 90-16789 in their entireties under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.<sup>1</sup>

We note the remaining information contains dates of birth. Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 682. In considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.<sup>2</sup> *Texas Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3. We note the requestor has a right of access to his own private information. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(b) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates or person's agent on ground that information is considered confidential by privacy principles); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Accordingly, the department must withhold the dates of birth at issue, other than the requestor's, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code, which provides in part:

---

<sup>1</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

<sup>2</sup>Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

(a) A communication between certified emergency medical services [“EMS”] personnel or a physician providing medical supervision and a patient that is made in the course of providing emergency medical services to the patient is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) Records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by emergency medical services personnel or by a physician providing medical supervision that are created by the emergency medical services personnel or physician or maintained by an emergency medical services provider are confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

...

(g) The privilege of confidentiality under this section does not extend to information regarding the presence, nature of injury or illness, age, sex, occupation, and city of residence of a patient who is receiving emergency medical services.

Health & Safety Code § 773.091(a)-(b), (g). Upon review, we find you have not demonstrated any portion of the remaining information consists of communications between certified emergency medical services personnel providing medical supervision and patients that were made in the course of providing emergency medical services to the patients. *See id.* § 773.091(a). Furthermore, the remaining information does not consist of records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of patients by emergency medical services personnel providing medical supervision that were created by the emergency medical services personnel or maintained by an emergency medical services provider. *See id.* § 773.091(b). Accordingly, we find section 773.091 does not apply to any portion of the remaining information, and the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

In summary, the department must withhold report numbers 90-15609 and 90-16789 in their entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the dates of birth at issue, other than the requestor’s, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must release the remaining information.<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>3</sup>We note the requestor has a special right of access to some of the information being released. Gov’t Code § 552.023. Accordingly, if the department receives another request for this same information from a different requestor, then the department must again seek a ruling from this office.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Lee Seidlits  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

CLS/som

Ref: ID# 596730

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)