



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 19, 2016

Ms. Alexis G. Allen
Counsel for the City of Lancaster
Nichols Jackson Dillard Hager & Smith, L.L.P.
1800 Ross Tower
500 North Akard
Dallas, Texas 75201

OR2016-04030

Dear Ms. Allen:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 598935 (City Ref. No.74551).

The City of Lancaster (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You state you have released some information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information subject to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065 of the Transportation Code applies only to a written report of an accident required under section 550.061, 550.062, or 601.004. Transp. Code § 550.065(a)(1). Chapter 550 requires the creation of a written report when the accident resulted in injury to or the death of a person or damage to the property of any person to the apparent extent of \$1,000 or more. *Id.* §§ 550.061 (operator's accident report), .062 (officer's accident report). An accident report is privileged and for the confidential use of the Texas Department of Transportation or a local governmental agency of Texas that has use for the information for accident prevention purposes. *Id.* § 550.065(b). However, a

governmental entity may release an accident report in accordance with subsections (c) and (c-1). *Id.* § 550.065(c), (c-1). Section 550.065(c) provides a governmental entity shall release an accident report to a person or entity listed under this subsection. *Id.* § 550.065(c). Here, the requestor is a person listed under section 550.065(c). Although the city raises section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy, we note a specific statutory right of access overcomes the common law. *See Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common-law principle). Thus, the city may not withhold the submitted accident report under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

You assert portions of the accident report are confidential under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. *See Gov't Code* § 552.130(a)(1)-(2). We note a statutory right of access generally prevails over the Act's general exceptions to disclosure. *See Open Record Decision Nos.* 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). However, because section 552.130 has its own access provisions, we conclude section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. Thus, we must address the conflict between the confidentiality provided under section 552.130 of the Government Code and the right of access provided under section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code for the accident report. Where information falls within both a general and a specific provision of law, the specific provision prevails over the general. *See Horizon/CMS Healthcare Corp. v. Auld*, 34 S.W.3d 887,901 (Tex. 2000) ("more specific statute controls over the more general"); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 211 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones); *Open Records Decision Nos.* 598 (1991), 583 (1990), 451. Section 550.065(c) specifically provides access only to accident reports of the type at issue, while section 552.130 generally excepts motor vehicle record information maintained in any context. Thus, we conclude the access to accident reports provided under section 550.065(c) is more specific than the general confidentiality provided under section 552.130. Accordingly, the city may not withhold any portion of the accident report under section 552.130. Thus, the city must release the CR-3 accident report to the requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 730.004 of the Transportation Code, which provides "an agency may not disclose personal information about any person obtained by the agency in connection with a motor vehicle record." *Transp. Code* § 730.004. "Personal information" includes a person's name, address, and driver identification number, but not the zip code. *Id.* § 730.003(6). The Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") is an "agency" for purposes of chapter 730. *See id.* § 730.003(1) ("agency" is state agency that compiles or maintains motor vehicle records). You state the

information at issue was obtained by the city from DPS. *See id.* § 730.007(a)(2)(A)(I) (personal information may be disclosed to government agency in carrying out its functions). An authorized recipient of personal information may not re-disclose the personal information and to do so is a misdemeanor offense. *Id.* § 730.013(a), (d). Accordingly, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with sections 730.004 and 730.013 of the Transportation Code. However, we find none of the remaining information is confidential under section 730.004 and the city may not withhold it from release under section 552.101 on that ground.

As noted above, section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See Gov't Code* § 552.130. The submitted video recordings contain motor vehicle record information that is subject to section 552.130. You state the city lacks the technical capability to redact the information subject to section 552.130 from the video recordings. Based on this representation, the city must withhold the submitted video recordings in their entirety under section 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ *See Open Records Decision No. 364 (1983)*. Additionally, the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683.

This office has found that personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally intimate or embarrassing. *See generally* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 9-10 (1992) (employee's withholding allowance certificate, designation of retirement beneficiary, choice of insurance carrier, election of optional coverages, direct deposit authorization, forms allowing employee to allocate pretax compensation to group insurance, health care or dependent care), 545 (1990) (deferred compensation information, participation in voluntary investment program, election of optional insurance coverage, mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history), 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information). Whether the public's interest in obtaining personal

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

financial information is sufficient to justify its disclosure must be determined on a case-by-case basis. *See* Open Records Decision No. 373 (1983).

Upon review, we find the remaining information contains information that satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, we conclude the city must withhold this information, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note a portion of the remaining information is subject to section 552.136 of the Government Code.² Section 552.136 states, “Notwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” Gov’t Code § 552.136(b); *see also id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). This office has determined an insurance policy number is an access device number for the purposes of section 552.136. *See* Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009). Accordingly, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.136.

In summary, the city must release the CR-3 accident report in its entirety to this requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code. The city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with sections 730.004 and 730.013 of the Transportation Code. The city must withhold the submitted video recordings in their entireties, as well as the additional information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

³We note the requestor has a right of access beyond that of the general public to some of the information being released. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.023(a) (person or person’s authorized representative has special right of access, beyond right of general public, to information held by governmental body that relates to person and is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect person’s privacy interests); Transp. Code § 550.065(c); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual asks governmental body to provide him with information concerning himself). Accordingly, if the city receives another request for this information from an individual other than this requestor or his client, the city must again seek a ruling from this office.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Mili Gosar". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Mili Gosar
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MG/akg

Ref: ID# 598935

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)