



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

March 3, 2016

Ms. Sarah Parker
Associate General Counsel
Texas Department of Transportation
125 East 11th Street
Austin, Texas 78701-2483

OR2016-05048

Dear Ms. Parker:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 600622.

The Texas Department of Transportation (the "department") received a request for the statement of qualifications cover page, packet, and attachments for the awardee and next three highest ranked offerors as well as the scoring document for eighteen specified solicitations. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.104 and 552.111 of the Government Code. Additionally, you state release of some the submitted information may implicate the proprietary interests of third parties. Accordingly, you state, and provide documentation showing, you notified these third parties of the request for information and of the companies' rights to submit arguments to

this office as to why the submitted information should not be released.¹ *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain circumstances). We have received comments from CobbFendley and Halff. We have considered the submitted arguments and reviewed the submitted information, a portion of which is a representative sample.²

Initially, you inform us some of the responsive information was the subject of previous requests for information, as a result of which this office issued Open Records Letter Nos. 2014-15149 (2014), 2015-12115 (2015), 2015-16048 (2015), 2015-19036 (2015), 2015-26376 (2015), 2015-26573 (2015), 2016-00373 (2016), 2016-03136 (2016), and 2016-03677 (2016). CobbFendley and Halff now seek to withhold some of their information previously ordered released in Open Records Letter Nos. 2014-15149, 2015-12115, 2015-16048, 2015-19036, 2015-26376, and 2016-00373 under section 552.104 of the Government Code. Section 552.007 of the Government Code provides that, if a governmental body voluntarily releases information to any member of the public, the governmental body may not withhold such information from further disclosure unless its public release is expressly prohibited by law or the information is confidential under law. *See* Gov't Code § 552.007; Open Records Decision No. 518 at 3 (1989); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 400 (1983) (governmental body may waive right to claim permissive exceptions to disclosure under the Act, but it may not disclose information made confidential by law). Accordingly, pursuant to section 552.007, the department may not now withhold

¹The department notified the following third parties: AECOM Technical Services, Inc.; Aguirre & Fileds, L.P.; AIA Engineers, Ltd.; Alliance Transportation Group, Inc.; ARS Engineers, Inc.; Atkins North America, Inc.; Baseline Corporation; Binkley & Barfield, Inc.; Brown & Gay Engineers, Inc.; Burns & McDonnell Engineering Company, Inc.; Cardno Inc.; C&M Associates; CH2M Hill, Inc.; CivilTech Engineering, Inc.; Cobb, Fendley & Associates, Inc. ("CobbFendley"); Collins Surveying and Mapping; CW Engineering; DAL-TECH Engineering, Inc.; Dannenbaum Engineering Corporation; Entech Civil Engineers, Inc.; Excelsis, Inc.; Freese and Nichols, Inc.; Halff Associates, Inc. ("Halff"); H. W. Lochner; HDR Engineering, Inc.; HNTB Corporation; IDCUS, Inc.; IS Engineers, L.L.C.; Jacobs Engineering Group, Inc.; Kellogg Brown & Root Services, Inc.; Kimley-Horn and Associates, Inc.; KCI Technologies, Inc.; Lamb-Star Engineering L.P.; Landtech Consultants; Lina T. Ramey and Associates, Inc.; Maverick Engineering, Inc.; Midtown Engineers, L.L.C.; Pancheco Koch Consulting Engineers, Inc.; Pape Dawson Engineers, Inc.; Parsons Bickerhoff, Inc.; Pierce, Goodwin, Alexander & Linville, Inc.; Poznecki-Camarillo, Inc.; R.G. Miller Engineers, Inc.; The Rios Group, Inc.; RODS Subsurface Utility Engineering, Inc.; SAM-Construction Services, L.L.C.; Sanderson Surveying, Inc.; Summit Surveying, Inc.; Surveying and Mapping, L.L.C.; Teague Nall and Perkins, Inc.; TranSystems Corporation Consultants; Underwood Drafting and Surveying; Vickrey & Associates, Inc.; and Walter P. Moore and Associates, Inc.

²We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

any previously released information unless its release is expressly prohibited by law or the information is confidential under law. Although CobbFendley and Halff now raise section 552.104 of the Government Code for the information at issue, this section does not prohibit the release of information or make information confidential. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions in general), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 592 (1991) (stating that governmental body may waive section 552.104). Thus, the department may not now withhold any of the previously released information under section 552.104 of the Government Code on behalf of CobbFendley or Halff. Furthermore, there is no indication the law, facts, and circumstances on which the prior rulings were based have changed. Accordingly, for the requested information that is identical to the information previously requested and ruled upon by this office, we conclude the department must continue to rely on Open Records Letter Nos. 2014-15149, 2015-12115, 2015-16048, 2015-19036, 2015-26376, 2015-26573, 2016-00373, 2016-03136, and 2016-03677 as previous determinations and withhold or release the identical information in accordance with those rulings.³ *See* Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (so long as law, facts, and circumstances on which prior ruling was based have not changed, first type of previous determination exists where requested information is precisely same information as was addressed in prior attorney general ruling, ruling is addressed to same governmental body, and ruling concludes that information is or is not excepted from disclosure). Next, we address the arguments against the disclosure of the requested information that is not subject to those prior rulings.

An interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) of the Government Code to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should be withheld from public disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, we have received comments from only CobbFendley and Halff explaining why the submitted information should not be released. Therefore, we have no basis to conclude any of the remaining third parties have protected proprietary interests in the submitted information. *See id.* § 552.110; Open Records Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6 (1999) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual evidence, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that release of requested information would cause that party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret), 542 at 3. Accordingly, the department may not withhold any of the submitted information on the basis of any proprietary interest the remaining third parties may have in the information.

We note Halff argues against disclosure of information not submitted to this office for review. This ruling does not address information beyond what the department has submitted

³As we are able to make this determination, we need not address the arguments against disclosure of this information.

to us for our review. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(D) (governmental body requesting decision from attorney general must submit a copy of specific information requested). Accordingly, this ruling is limited to the information the department submitted as responsive to the request for information.

Section 552.104(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information that, if released, would give advantage to a competitor or bidder.” *Id.* § 552.104(a). The “test under section 552.104 is whether knowing another bidder’s [or competitor’s information] would be an advantage, not whether it would be a decisive advantage.” *Boeing Co. v. Paxton*, 466 S.W.3d 831 (Tex. 2015). The department represents Exhibit B pertains to a competitive bidding situation. In addition, the department states disclosure of Exhibit B would allow third-party competitors to tailor their proposal and bids and undermine competition among competitors. After review of the information at issue and consideration of the arguments, we find the department has established the release of Exhibit B would give advantage to a competitor or bidder. Thus, the department may withhold Exhibit B under section 552.104(a) of the Government Code.⁴

Further, CobbFendley and Halff state they have competitors. CobbFendley states release of portions of its information will allow competitors to copy CobbFendley’s statements of expertise and unique approach and give these companies a competitive advantage in future bids. Halff states release of its information would allow competitors to duplicate Halff’s “successful and proven formatting techniques and specific language,” also placing Halff at a competitive disadvantage. After review of the information at issue and consideration of the arguments, we find CobbFendley and Halff have established the release of the information at issue in solicitation number 36-6RFP5192, which we have marked, would give advantage to a competitor or bidder. Thus, the department may withhold the information we have marked in Exhibit C under section 552.104(a) of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must continue to rely on Open Records Letter Nos. 2014-15149, 2015-12115, 2015-16048, 2015-19036, 2015-26376, 2015-26573, 2016-00373, 2016-03136, and 2016-03677 as previous determinations and withhold or release the identical information in accordance with those rulings. The department may withhold Exhibit B and the information we have marked in Exhibit C under section 552.104(a) of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

⁴As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Abigail T. Adams
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

ATA/akg

Ref: ID# 600622

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Steve Roberson
Teague Nall and Perkins, Inc.
1100 Macon Street
Fort Worth, Texas 76137
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. R. Brent Patterson
AECOM Technical Services, Inc.
5444 Westheimer Road, Suite 200
Houston, Texas 77056
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Kenneth Erwin
TranSystems Corporation
Consultants
500 West 7th Street, Suite 1100
Fort Worth, Texas 76102
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Khurram D. Warach
Atkins North America, Inc.
1250 Wood Branch Park Drive,
Suite 300
Houston, Texas 77079
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Brenda Vickrey Johnson
Vickery & Associates, Inc.
12940 Country Parkway
San Antonio, Texas 78216
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Ovidio Alanis
Entech Civil Engineers, Inc.
16360 Park Ten Place, Suite 230
Houston, Texas 77084
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Thomas Howard Caldwell
HNTB Corporation
2950 North Loop West, Suite 900
Houston, Texas 77092
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Gregory S. Cleveland
SAM-Construction Services
11111 Katy Freeway, #200
Houston, Texas 77079
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. J. Michael Heath
Alliance Transportation Group Inc
Building M1, Suite 150
11500 Metric Boulevard
Austin, Texas 78758
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Carlos Conteraras
C&M Associates
15770 North Dallas Parkway,
Suite 870
Dallas, Texas 75248
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Kevin Hoppers
Kimley-Horn and Associates
12750 Merit Drive, Suite 1000
Dallas, Texas 75251
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Tim C. Newton
Kellogg Brown & Root Services
601 Jefferson Street, JE-1664
Houston, Texas 77002
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Brian Boecker
Kimley-Horn and Associates
1015 Morado Circle, Building 1,
Suite 300
Austin, Texas 78759
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Fernando Camarillo
Poznecki-Camarillo Inc
5835 Callaghan Road, Suite 200
San Antonio, Texas 78228
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Karan Khosla
HDR Engineering
17111 Preston Road, Suite 200
Dallas, Texas 75248
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. K. Stephen Bonnette
Pape Dawson Engineers
2000 NW Loop 410
San Antonio, Texas 78213
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Rene Garza
Atkins North America Inc
6504 Bridge Point Parkway, Suite
200
Austin, Texas 78730
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Mark Charles Conway
Walter P. Moore and Associates
221 North Kansas Street, Suite 601
El Paso, Texas 79901
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Amparo Ortega
AIA Engineers
6606 LBJ Freeway, Suite 150
Dallas, Texas 75240
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Ayub Sandhu
ARS Engineers
12801 North Central Expressway,
Suite 1250
Dallas, Texas 75243
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. R. Kyle Jones
Atkins North America Inc
18383 Preston Road, Suite 500
Dallas, Texas 75252
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Gary Moonshower
Brown & Gay Engineers
700 North Pearl, Suite 2100
Dallas, Texas 75201
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Travis Isaacson
Cardno Inc
2590 Oakmont Drive, Suite 410
Round Rock, Texas 78665
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. James Glen Cowart
CW Engineering
305 South Broadway, Suite 403
Tyler, Texas 75702
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Sandra Khoury
Cobb-Fendley & Associates
505 East Huntland Drive, Suite
485
Austin, Texas 78752
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Maen Hourani
Dannenbaum Engineering
Corporation
3100 West Alabama Street
Houston, Texas 77098
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Gus Nowak, Jr.
Excelsis, Inc.
2825 Wilcrest Drive, Suite 100
Houston, Texas 77042
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Juan Mendoza Sierra
Freese and Nichols
4055 International Plaza #200
Fort Worth, Texas 76109
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. William P. Hicks
H W Lochner
12001 North Central Expressway,
Suite 1050
Dallas, Texas 75243
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Mona Mayer
HDR Engineering
4401 West Gate Boulevard, #400
Austin, Texas 78745
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Scott Stockburger
KCI Technologies
1431 Greenway Drive
Irving, Texas 75038
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Joseph A. Murphy
Lina T. Ramey and Associates
3320 Belt Line Road
Farmers Branch, Texas 75234
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Joel Colwell
Midtown Engineers
5225 Katy Freeway, Suite 400
Houston, Texas 77007
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Michael Crain
Surveying and Mapping LLC
7101 Envoy Court
Dallas, Texas 75247
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Joseph Anderson
The Rios Group
7400 Sand Street
Fort Worth, Texas 76118
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Brian O'Neill
Pancheco Koch Consulting
Engineers
6100 Western Place, Suite 1001
Fort Worth, Texas 76107
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Hilda Lease
RODS Subsurface Utility
Engineering
6810 Lee Road, Suite 300
Spring, Texas 77379
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Steven Williams
Baseline Corporation
1750 Seamist Drive, Suite 160
Houston, Texas 77008
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Tim Jackson
Lamb-Star Engineering
5700 West Plano Parkway, Suite
1000
Plano, Texas 75093
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Patrick Charles Matusek
Maverick Engineering
11490 Westheimer Road
Houston, Texas 77077
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Mickey Nowell
Cobb Fendley & Associates
6801 Gaylord Parkway, Suite 302
Frisco, Texas 75034
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Patrick Baldasaro
DAL-TECH Engineering
17400 Dallas Parkway, Suite 110
Dallas, Texas 75287
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Mark Gribble
Aguirre & Fields
12999 Jess Pirtle Boulevard
Sugar Land, Texas 77478
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Olen Howard
AIA Engineers
15310 Park Row
Houston, Texas 77084
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Paul Voiles
Binkley & Barfield
1710 Seamist Drive
Houston, Texas 77008
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Glen McCabe
CH2M Hill
14701 St Mary's Lane, Suite 300
Houston, Texas 77079
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Melvin Spinks
CivilTech Engineering
11821 Telge Road
Cypress, Texas 77429
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Darrin James Willer
IS Engineers
7700 San Felipe Street, Suite 485
Houston, Texas 77063
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. M. Niko Mozaffar
IDCUS Inc
11111 Wilcrest Green Drive, Suite
250
Houston, Texas 77042
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Douglas Huneycutt
Jacobs Engineering Group
5995 Rogerdale Road
Houston, Texas 77072
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Derron Vincik
PGAL
3131 Briarpark Drive, Suite 200
Houston, Texas 77042
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Wally Rex Burns
AECOM Technical Services
5444 Westheimer Road, Suite 200
Houston, Texas 77056
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Tony Kimmey
Burns & McDonnell Engineering
Company
15950 North Dallas Parkway,
Suite 700
Dallas, Texas 75248
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. David Simmons
Parsons Brickerhoff
Building 1, Suite 270
1250 Capital of Texas Highway
South
Austin, Texas 78746
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Patrick Ross
R G Miller Engineers
16340 Park Ten Place, Suite 350
Houston, Texas 77084
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Thusitha Silva
Walter P. Moore and Associates
1301 McKinney, Suite 1100
Houston, Texas 77010
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. David Collins
Collins Surveying and Mapping
910A Judson Road
Longview, Texas 75601
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Scott M. Fertak
Landtech Consultants
2525 North Loop West, Suite 300
Houston, Texas 77008
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Mark Sanderson
Sanderson Surveying
1874 South State Highway 121
Bonham, Texas 75418
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Monty Lynn Nixon
Summit Surveying
2040 Deerbrook Drive
Tyler, Texas 75703
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Douglas Underwood
Underwood Drafting & Surveying
3404 Interurban
Denison, Texas 75021
(w/o enclosures)