



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 26, 2016

Ms. Janice England
City Secretary
City of Saginaw
P.O. Box 79070
Saginaw, Texas 76179

OR2016-09306

Dear Ms. England:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 607835.

The Saginaw Police Department (the "department") received a request for all information regarding five named individuals. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. Upon review, we find the present request

requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the named individuals. Accordingly, we find the request implicates the named individuals' rights to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the department generally must withhold any such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note you have submitted information in which the named individuals are not depicted as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants. This information does not implicate the privacy interests of the named individuals. Thus, we will address your arguments against disclosure of this information.

We note the requestor is an investigator with the Child Protective Services Division of the Texas Department of Family and Protective Services ("DFPS"). Section 411.114(a) of the Government Code states, in pertinent part,

(2) The [DFPS] shall obtain from the [Department of Public Safety ("DPS")] criminal history record information ["CHRI"] maintained by the [DPS] that relates to a person who is:

...

(I) an alleged perpetrator in a report the [DFPS] receives alleging that the person has abused, neglected, or exploited a child, an elderly person, or a person with a disability, provided that:

(i) the report alleges the person has engaged in conduct that meets the applicable definition of abuse, neglect, or exploitation under Chapter 261, Family Code, or Chapter 48, Human Resources Code; and

(ii) the person is not also the victim of the alleged conduct[.]

...

(4) Subject to Section 411.087, the [DFPS] is entitled to:

...

(B) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state [CHRI] maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to a person described by Subdivision (2) or (3)[.]

Gov't Code § 411.114(a)(2)(I), (4)(B). CHRI consists of "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." *Id.* § 411.082(2). Thus, the requested information may contain CHRI, and this

requestor has a right of access under section 411.114 to CHRI in information held by the department if it involves an alleged perpetrator in a report of child abuse or neglect.

In this instance, the DFPS investigator does not state the named individuals are alleged perpetrators in a report of abuse or neglect of a child, but only requests information about the named individuals. Therefore, to the extent the named individuals are alleged perpetrators in a report of child abuse or neglect that was reported to DFPS, the department must release to the requestor the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions from any requested information, to the extent it exists, depicting the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants. Although you raise section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy, we note a statutory right of access generally prevails over the common law. *See Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common law principle); *CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law). To the extent it exists, the department must withhold any remaining information depicting the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, to the extent the named individuals are not alleged perpetrators in a report of child abuse or neglect that was reported to DFPS, then, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting either of the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the department must withhold any such information in its entirety under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 682. In considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.¹ *Texas Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. Thus, the department must withhold all of the submitted dates of birth contained in the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

¹Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

In summary, to the extent the named individuals are alleged perpetrators in a report of child abuse or neglect that was reported to DFPS, the department must release the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions from any responsive information depicting the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants. To the extent it exists, any remaining information depicting the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, to the extent the named individuals are not alleged perpetrators in a report of child abuse or neglect that was reported to DFPS, then, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting either of the named individuals as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold all of the submitted dates of birth contained in the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Britni Ramirez
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

BR/bhf

Ref: ID# 607835

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)