



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 28, 2016

Mr. W. Montgomery Meitler
Senior Counsel
Office of Legal Services
Texas Education Agency
1701 North Congress Avenue
Austin, Texas 78701-1494

OR2016-09619

Dear Mr. Meitler:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 607787 (TEA PIR # 26344).

The Texas Education Agency (the "agency") received a request for all correspondence, orders, or other written records pertaining to the closure of a specified school and the transfer of students and schools to a specified school district, and any documentation pertaining to the removal of specified board members or trustees. You state you will release some information. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.107 and 552.116 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹ Initially, you state some of the responsive information was the subject of previous requests for information, as a result of which this office issued Open Records Letter Nos. 2016-04647 (2016), 2016-04678 (2016), and 2016-04685 (2016). In Open Records Letter No. 2016-04647 we determined the agency may withhold the information at issue under section 552.116 of the Government Code. In Open Records Letter Nos. 2016-04678, we determined the agency may withhold the information you marked under section 552.107(1)

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

of the Government Code and the remaining information under section 552.116 of the Government Code. In Open Records Letter No. 2016-04685 we determined the agency must withhold or release identical information in accordance with specified previous rulings, may withhold the information you marked under section 552.107(1) of the Government Code, and may withhold the remaining information under section 552.116 of the Government Code. To the extent the responsive information was the subject of previous rulings, the agency must dispose of any such information in accordance with those rulings, provided there has been no change in the law, facts, and circumstances on which the previous rulings were based. To the extent the responsive information is not the subject of a previous ruling, the underlying law, facts, and circumstances of which have not changed, we will address your arguments against disclosure of the information. *See* Open Records Decision No. 673 at 6-7 (2001) (listing elements of first type of previous determination under Gov't Code § 552.301(a)).

Section 552.107(1) of the Government Code protects information coming within the attorney-client privilege. When asserting the attorney-client privilege, a governmental body has the burden of providing the necessary facts to demonstrate the elements of the privilege in order to withhold the information at issue. Open Records Decision No. 676 at 6-7 (2002). First, a governmental body must demonstrate that the information constitutes or documents a communication. *Id.* at 7. Second, the communication must have been made “to facilitate the rendition of professional legal services” to the client governmental body. TEX. R. EVID. 503(b)(1). The privilege does not apply when an attorney or representative is involved in some capacity other than that of providing or facilitating professional legal services to the client governmental body. *In re Tex. Farmers Ins. Exch.*, 990 S.W.2d 337, 340 (Tex. App.—Texarkana 1999, orig. proceeding) (attorney-client privilege does not apply if attorney acting in a capacity other than that of attorney). Governmental attorneys often act in capacities other than that of professional legal counsel, such as administrators, investigators, or managers. Thus, the mere fact that a communication involves an attorney for the government does not demonstrate this element. Third, the privilege applies only to communications between or among clients, client representatives, lawyers, and lawyer representatives. TEX. R. EVID. 503(b)(1)(A), (B), (C), (D), (E). Thus, a governmental body must inform this office of the identities and capacities of the individuals to whom each communication at issue has been made. Lastly, the attorney-client privilege applies only to a *confidential* communication, *id.* 503(b)(1), meaning it was “not intended to be disclosed to third persons other than those: (A) to whom disclosure is made to further the rendition of professional legal services to the client; or (B) reasonably necessary to transmit the communication.” *Id.* 503(a)(5). Whether a communication meets this definition depends on the *intent* of the parties involved at the time the information was communicated. *Osborne v. Johnson*, 954 S.W.2d 180, 184 (Tex. App.—Waco 1997, orig. proceeding). Moreover, because the client may elect to waive the privilege at any time, a governmental body must explain that the confidentiality of a communication has been maintained. Section 552.107(1) generally excepts an entire communication that is demonstrated to be protected by the attorney-client privilege unless otherwise waived by the governmental body. *See Huie v. DeShazo*, 922 S.W.2d 920, 923 (Tex. 1996) (privilege extends to entire communication, including facts contained therein).

You state the information you have marked consists of communications involving agency attorneys, employees, and officials. You also state the communications were made for the purpose of facilitating the rendition of professional legal services to the agency and these communications have remained confidential. Upon review, we find you have demonstrated the applicability of the attorney-client privilege to the information you have marked. Thus, the agency may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.107(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.116 of the Government Code provides the following:

(a) An audit working paper of an audit of the state auditor or the auditor of a state agency, an institution of higher education as defined by Section 61.003, Education Code, a county, a municipality, a school district, a hospital district, or a joint board operating under Section 22.074, Transportation Code, including any audit relating to the criminal history background check of a public school employee, is excepted from [required public disclosure]. If information in an audit working paper is also maintained in another record, that other record is not excepted from [public disclosure] by this section.

(b) In this section:

(1) "Audit" means an audit authorized or required by a statute of this state or the United States, the charter or an ordinance of a municipality, an order of the commissioners court of a county, the bylaws adopted by or other action of the governing board of a hospital district, a resolution or other action of a board of trustees of a school district, including an audit by the district relating to the criminal history background check of a public school employee, or a resolution or other action of a joint board described by Subsection (a) and includes an investigation.

(2) "Audit working paper" includes all information, documentary or otherwise, prepared or maintained in conducting an audit or preparing an audit report, including:

(A) intra-agency and interagency communications; and

(B) drafts of the audit report or portions of those drafts.

Gov't Code § 552.116. You state the remaining information consists of audit working papers prepared or maintained by the agency's Divisions of School Finance and State Funding. You explain this audit is authorized by section 13.054(e) of the Education Code. *See* Educ. Code § 13.054(e) (commissioner must investigate educational and financial impact of annexation on receiving school district before ordering annexation). Upon review, we agree

section 552.116 is applicable in this instance. Therefore, the agency may withhold the remaining information under section 552.116 of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the responsive information was the subject of previous rulings, the agency must dispose of any such information in accordance with those rulings, provided there has been no change in the law, facts, and circumstances on which the previous rulings were based. The agency may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.107(1) of the Government Code. The agency may withhold the remaining information under section 552.116 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Katelyn Blackburn-Rader
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KB-R/bw

Ref: ID# 607787

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)