



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 3, 2016

Ms. Vanessa A. Gonzalez
Counsel for Baylor University
Bickerstaff Heath Delgado Acosta, L.L.P.
Building One, Suite 300
3711 MoPac Expressway
Austin, Texas 78746

OR2016-09915

Dear Ms. Gonzalez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 608422.

The Baylor University Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for reports concerning on-campus drug and alcohol violations during a specified time period. You claim the submitted information is not subject to the Act. Alternatively, you claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered your arguments and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹ We have also received and considered comments submitted by the McLennan County Criminal District Attorney's Office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (interested party may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released).

Initially, we note the 84th Legislature added section 51.212(f) of the Education Code, which reads as follows:

(f) A campus police department of a private institution of higher education is a law enforcement agency and a governmental body for purposes of [the Act], only with respect to information relating solely to law enforcement activities.

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Educ. Code § 51.212(f). We understand the department is a campus police department of a private institution of higher education. *See id.* §§ 51.212(e), 61.003. Thus, the department is a governmental body for purposes of the Act, and information maintained by the department is subject to disclosure under the Act, to the extent such information relates solely to law enforcement activities. The department states the submitted police offense reports were created and are maintained by the department for law enforcement purposes. However, the department asserts the reports do not relate solely to law enforcement activities because the reports are also maintained in duplicate by Baylor University's Judicial Affairs Office (the "office"), and, thus, are not subject to release under the Act pursuant to section 51.212(f). Nevertheless, the submitted offense reports reflect they involve investigations of possible criminal violations. Therefore, we find these reports relate "solely to law enforcement activities" for purposes of section 51.212(f) of the Education Code, and thus, are subject to the Act. Accordingly, this information must be released, unless it falls within an exception to public disclosure under the Act. *See Gov't Code* §§ 552.006, .021, .301, .302. Consequently, we will address the department's arguments against its disclosure under the Act.

Next, the department asserts the submitted offense reports in their entirety are excepted from disclosure under the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act ("FERPA"), section 1232g of title 20 of the United States Code. The United States Department of Education Family Policy Compliance Office has informed FERPA does not permit state and local educational authorities to disclose to this office, without parental or an adult student's consent, unredacted, personally identifiable information contained in education records for the purpose of our review in the open records ruling process under the Act.² Consequently, state and local educational authorities that receive a request for education records from a member of the public under the Act must not submit education records to this office in unredacted form, that is, in a form in which "personally identifiable information" is disclosed. *See* 34 C.F.R. § 99.3 (defining "personally identifiable information").

The department states the submitted reports were created and are maintained by the department for a law enforcement purpose. We note FERPA is not applicable to records that were created by a law enforcement unit of an educational agency or institution for a law enforcement purpose and that are maintained by the law enforcement unit. *See* 20 U.S.C. § 1232g(a)(4)(B)(ii); 34 C.F.R. §§ 99.3, .8. The department informs us the submitted information is also maintained by the office, a component of an educational agency. Thus, the department contends this information is subject to FERPA because it is not maintained exclusively by the department. However, these law enforcement records are maintained separate and apart from the records of the office. Further, the request for information was made to the department, and the requestor seeks law enforcement records created and

²A copy of this letter may be found on the Office of the Attorney General's website at: <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/files/og/20060725usdoe.pdf>.

maintained by the department, rather than student records maintained by the office.³ Therefore, the submitted information is not encompassed by FERPA and none of it may be withheld on that basis. Accordingly, we will address the department's arguments with respect to the information at issue.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state Exhibit B-1 pertains to an active criminal investigation or prosecution. Based on your representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to Exhibit B-1.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. *See* Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You state Exhibit B-2 pertains to a closed case that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on your representation, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to Exhibit B-2.

However, we note section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold Exhibit B-1 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and may withhold Exhibit B-2 under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which

³We note this ruling does not address the public availability of any records maintained by the office, and the office is not required to release any information in response to this request.

the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.⁴ *Texas Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. Thus, the department must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth in Exhibit B-3 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, with the exception of the basic information, the department may withhold Exhibit B-1 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and may withhold Exhibit B-2 under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The department must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth in Exhibit B-3 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must release the remaining information in Exhibit B-3.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Britni Ramirez
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

BR/dls

⁴Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

Ref: ID# 608422

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Sterling Harmon
Assistant District Attorney
McLennan County Criminal District Attorney's Office
219 North 6th Street, Suite 200
Waco, Texas 76701
(w/o enclosures)