



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 3, 2016

Ms. Jessica Vu
Assistant General Counsel
Office of the Governor
P.O. Box 12428
Austin, Texas 78711

OR2016-09957

Dear Ms. Vu:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 611338 (OOG ID# 16-068).

The Office of the Governor (the "governor's office") received a request for the governor's schedule during a specified time period. You state the governor's office has released some information to the requestor. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.104 and 552.107 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.104(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information that, if released, would give advantage to a competitor or bidder." Gov't Code § 552.104(a). The "test under section 552.104 is whether knowing another bidder's [or competitor's information] would be an advantage, not whether it would be a decisive advantage." *Boeing Co. v. Paxton*, 466 S.W.3d 831, 841 (Tex. 2015). You argue expansion and recruitment of businesses to the State of Texas is a competitive process and the inform us the governor's office "works tirelessly to promote Texas, in part by providing state resources to encourage business growth within the state." You state "Texas devotes substantial resources to programs designed primarily to attract new businesses to the state or assist with the substantial expansion of an existing business as part of competitive recruitment." You explain the governor's office is currently negotiating potential approvals or contracts with the entity at issue, and contracts with this entity have not been executed. You argue release

of this information, before contracts are signed or final approval given, would disadvantage Texas by permitting other states to directly approach this entity with competing incentives. Based on your representations and our review, we find you have demonstrated the governor's office has specific marketplace interests and may be considered a "competitor" for purposes of section 552.104(a). We also find you have demonstrated release of the information it has marked would give advantage to a competitor or bidder. Accordingly, the governor's office may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.104(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.107(1) of the Government Code protects information subject to the attorney-client privilege. *See* Gov't Code § 552.107(1). When asserting the attorney-client privilege, a governmental body has the burden of providing the necessary facts to demonstrate the elements of the privilege in order to withhold the information at issue. Open Records Decision No. 676 at 6-7 (2002). First, a governmental body must demonstrate that the information constitutes or documents a communication. *Id.* at 7. Second, the communication must have been made "to facilitate the rendition of professional legal services" to the client governmental body. TEX. R. EVID. 503(b)(1). The privilege does not apply when an attorney or representative is involved in some capacity other than that of providing or facilitating professional legal services to the client governmental body. *In re Tex. Farmers Ins. Exch.*, 990 S.W.2d 337, 340 (Tex. App.—Texarkana 1999, orig. proceeding) (attorney-client privilege does not apply if attorney acting in a capacity other than that of attorney). Governmental attorneys often act in capacities other than that of professional legal counsel, such as administrators, investigators, or managers. Thus, the mere fact that a communication involves an attorney for the government does not demonstrate this element. Third, the privilege applies only to communications between or among clients, client representatives, lawyers, and lawyer representatives. TEX. R. EVID. 503(b)(1)(A), (B), (C), (D), (E). Thus, a governmental body must inform this office of the identities and capacities of the individuals to whom each communication at issue has been made. Lastly, the attorney-client privilege applies only to a *confidential* communication, *id.* 503(b)(1), meaning it was "not intended to be disclosed to third persons other than those: (A) to whom disclosure is made to further the rendition of professional legal services to the client; or (B) reasonably necessary to transmit the communication." *Id.* 503(a)(5). Whether a communication meets this definition depends on the *intent* of the parties involved at the time the information was communicated. *Osborne v. Johnson*, 954 S.W.2d 180, 184 (Tex. App.—Waco 1997, orig. proceeding). Moreover, because the client may elect to waive the privilege at any time, a governmental body must explain that the confidentiality of a communication has been maintained. Section 552.107(1) generally excepts an entire communication that is demonstrated to be protected by the attorney-client privilege unless otherwise waived by the governmental body. *See Huie v. DeShazo*, 922 S.W.2d 920, 923 (Tex. 1996) (privilege extends to entire communication, including facts contained therein).

You state the information you have marked reveals communications between governor's office attorneys, officials, and employees that were made for the purpose of facilitating the rendition of professional legal services to the governor's office. You also state the communications were intended to be confidential and have remained confidential. Based on your representations and our review, we find the governor's office may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.107(1) of the Government Code.

In summary, the governor's office may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.104(a) of the Government Code and the information you have marked under section 552.107(1) of the Government Code. The governor's office must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Tim Neal
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

TN/bw

Ref: ID# 611338

Enc. Submitted documents