



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 3, 2016

Mr. Stephen D. Gates
Assistant City Attorney
City of Midland
P.O. Box 1152
Midland, Texas 79702

OR2016-10014

Dear Mr. Gates:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 608374 (ORR # 18835).

The Midland Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a named individual. You state the department has released some information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

We note the information we have marked is not responsive to the instant request for information because it does not pertain to the named individual. This ruling does not address the public availability of non-responsive information, and the city is not required to release non-responsive information in response to this request.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes such as section 58.007 of the Family Code, which provides in pertinent part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Juvenile law enforcement records relating to delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007. *See id.* § 51.03(a), (b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of section 58.007 of the Family Code). For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the conduct at issue. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we find the responsive incident report involves juvenile delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred after September 1, 1997. As such, this information constitutes juvenile law enforcement records that are confidential pursuant to section 58.007(c). We note the information at issue lists the named individual as a suspect who was older than seventeen at the time of the conduct. Although the requestor is a representative of the Probation Office of the United States District Court for the Western District of Texas (the “probation office”), she is seeking information about the adult suspect and not the child suspect identified in this report. Thus, we conclude the requestor does not have a right of access to this report under section 58.007 of the Family Code. *See id.* § 58.007(e) (providing “[l]aw enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by . . . a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code[.]”). Therefore, as the department does not state any of the exceptions to section 58.007 apply in this instance, the information at issue is generally confidential under section 58.007 of the Family Code. However, the requestor may have a right of access to some of the information under section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code. *See Gov’t Code* § 411.087(a)(2).

Section 411.089(a) of the Government Code provides that “[a] criminal justice agency is entitled to obtain from the [Texas Department of Public Safety] any criminal history record information [(“CHRI”)] maintained by the [Texas Department of Public Safety] about a person.” *See id.* § 411.089(a). In addition, section 411.087(a) of the Government Code provides in pertinent part the following:

(a) [A] person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter or Subchapter E-1 to obtain from the [Texas Department of Public Safety] [CHRI] maintained by the [Texas Department of Public Safety] that relates to another person is authorized to:

...

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state [CHRI] maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

Id. § 411.087(a)(2). We note CHRI is defined as “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *See id.* § 411.082(2). Thus, the responsive incident report contains CHRI of the individual named in the request. However, a criminal justice agency that receives CHRI from another criminal justice agency pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) may only receive such information for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* §§ 411.083(c), .087(b); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997) (discussing limitations on release of CHRI).

Section 411.082 of the Government Code defines a “criminal justice agency” as including “a federal or state agency that is engaged in the administration of criminal justice under a statute or executive order and that allocates a substantial portion of its annual budget to the administration of criminal justice[.]” Gov’t Code § 411.082(3)(A). “Administration of criminal justice” has the meaning assigned to it by article 60.01 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. *See id.* § 411.082(1). Article 60.01 defines “administration of criminal justice” as the “performance of any of the following activities: detection, apprehension, detention, pretrial release, post-trial release, prosecution, adjudication, correctional supervision, or rehabilitation of an offender. The term includes criminal identification activities and the collection, storage, and dissemination of [CHRI].” Crim. Proc. Code art. 60.01(1). You acknowledge, and we agree, the probation office is a criminal justice agency as defined by section 411.082. *See id.* You also inform us the requestor intends to use the CHRI for a criminal justice purpose. Consequently, pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2), the department must generally make available to the requestor information pertaining to the named individual that shows the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions, and must withhold the remainder of information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. Thus, there is a conflict between the confidentiality provided by section 58.007(c) of the Family Code and the requestor’s right of access under section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Where information falls within both a general and a specific statutory provision, the specific provision prevails over the general statute. *See* Gov’t Code § 311.026 (where general statutory provision conflicts with specific provision, specific provision prevails as exception to general provision unless the general provision is the later enactment and the manifest intent is that the general provision prevail); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 277 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones). In this instance, although section 58.007(c) of the Family Code generally makes juvenile law enforcement records confidential, section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code gives specific types of requestors, criminal justice agencies, access to particular information, CHRI, for a criminal justice purpose.

Thus, the statutory right of access granted to the requestor by section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code prevails over the more general confidentiality provision of section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. Therefore, notwithstanding section 58.007(c), the department must make available to this requestor information pertaining to the named individual that shows the types of allegations made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions from the information in the responsive incident report pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code.¹ Although you additionally raise section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy for the responsive incident report, we note a statutory right of access prevails over the common-law. *See Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common-law principle); *CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law). The department must withhold the remaining information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Katelyn Blackburn-Rader
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KB-R/bw

¹Because the requestor has a special right of access to the information being released, the city must again seek a decision from this office if it receives another request for the same information from another requestor.

Ref: ID# 608374

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)