



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 11, 2016

Ms. Amanda Pell
Open Records Specialist
Baytown Police Department
3200 North Main Street
Baytown, Texas 77521

OR2016-10755

Dear Ms. Pell:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 609734 (PIR Nos. 6129, 6175).

The Baytown Police Department (the "department") received two requests from different requestors for information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.152 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the

submitted information pertains to a pending criminal investigation. Based on your representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Accordingly, the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen’s date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court’s rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees’ dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees’ privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.² *Texas Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens’ dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. We note the department may not withhold the first requestor’s date of birth from him under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy because the first requestor has a right of access to his own date of birth under section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.023(a) (person or person’s authorized representative has special right of access to information held by governmental body that relates to person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect person’s privacy interests); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning himself). Thus, the department must withhold the dates of birth you have marked from the respective requestors under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

²Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a).

identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.152 of the Government Code provides:

Information in the custody of a governmental body that relates to an employee or officer of the governmental body is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if, under the specific circumstances pertaining to the employee or officer, disclosure of the information would subject the employee or officer to a substantial threat of physical harm.

Id. § 552.152. You inform us the information you have marked identifies an undercover police officer. You state release of this information would subject this officer to a substantial threat of physical harm. Based on your representations and our review, we find you have demonstrated the release of the information at issue would subject the officer at issue to a substantial threat of harm. Thus, the department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.152 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the dates of birth you have marked from the respective requestors under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.152 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information to the respective requestors.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for

³As noted above, the first requestor has a right of access to his own date of birth under section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4.

providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Lee Seidlits", with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Lee Seidlits
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CLS/bw

Ref: ID# 609734

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)