



KEN PAXTON  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 16, 2016

Mr. Robb D. Decker  
Counsel for the Northside Independent School District  
Walsh, Gallegos, Treviño, Russo & Kyle, P.C.  
P.O. Box 460606  
San Antonio, Texas 78246

OR2016-11224

Dear Mr. Decker:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 610592.

The Northside Independent School District (the "district"), which you represent, received a request for the personnel files of several named individuals, all records related to a specified incident, and records related to training received by the named individuals with regards to dealing with emotionally disturbed children.<sup>1</sup> You state the district will redact information pursuant to sections 552.117 and 552.147 of the Government Code.<sup>2</sup> We understand you are

---

<sup>1</sup>We note the requestor clarified his request. *See* Gov't Code § 552.222(b) (governmental body may communicate with requestor for purposes of clarifying or narrowing request). *See also* *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S. W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding that when governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of unclear or overbroad request for public information, ten-day period to request attorney general ruling is measured from date request is clarified or narrowed).

<sup>2</sup>Section 552.024(c)(2) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact information protected by section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code without the necessity of requesting a decision under the Act if the current or former employee or official to whom the information pertains timely chooses not to allow public access to the information. *See* Gov't Code § 552.024(c)(2). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with subsections 552.024(c-1) and (c-2). *See id.* § 552.024(c-1)-(c-2). Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. *See id.* § 552.147(b).

redacting personal e-mail addresses pursuant to Open Records Decision 684 (2009) and information pursuant to sections 552.130 and 552.136 of the Government Code.<sup>3</sup> You state you will release some information. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.102 of the Government Code.<sup>4</sup> We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the Americans with Disabilities Act (“ADA”). *See* 42 U.S.C. §§ 12101 *et seq.* Title I of the ADA requires information about the medical conditions and medical histories of applicants or employees be (1) collected and maintained on separate forms, (2) kept in separate medical files, and (3) treated as a confidential medical record. The federal Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (the “EEOC”) has determined medical information for purposes of the ADA includes “specific information about an individual’s disability and related functional limitations, as well as general statements that an individual has a disability or that an ADA reasonable accommodation has been provided for a particular individual.” *See* Letter from Ellen J. Vargyas, Legal Counsel, EEOC, to Barry Kearney, Associate General Counsel, National Labor Relations Board, 3 (Oct. L 1997). Upon review, we find the information we have marked is confidential under the ADA and the district must withhold that information under section 552.101 of the Government Code.<sup>5</sup>

Section 552.101 also encompasses information made confidential by the Medical Practice Act (the “MPA”), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code, which governs release of medical records. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides, in relevant part:

- (a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is

---

<sup>3</sup>Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain categories of information, including personal e-mail addresses under section 552.137 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general opinion. Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in subsection 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Section 552.136(c) of the Government Code permits a governmental body to withhold the information described in section 552.136(b) without the necessity of seeking a decision from this office. *See id.* § 552.136(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.136(e). *See id.* § 552.136(d), (e).

<sup>4</sup>We note the district did not comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code in requesting this decision. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.301(b), (e). Nonetheless, because sections 552.101 and 552.102 of the Government Code can provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness, we will consider their applicability to the submitted information. *See id.* §§ 552.007, .302, .352.

<sup>5</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure.

confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(a)-(c). Information subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004. This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982).* Upon review, we find the information we have marked constitutes records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that were created or are maintained by a physician. Accordingly, the district must withhold the medical records we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA.<sup>6</sup> However, we find the remaining information does not constitute medical records subject to section 159.002. Accordingly, the district may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 also encompasses chapter 411 of the Government Code, which pertains to criminal history record information ("CHRI"). Chapter 411 authorizes the Texas Department of Public Safety (the "DPS") to compile and maintain CHRI from law enforcement agencies throughout the state and to provide access to authorized persons to federal criminal history records. *See id.* §§ 411.042, .087. Section 411.0845 of the Government Code provides, in relevant part:

(a) The [DPS] shall establish an electronic clearinghouse and subscription service to provide [CHRI] to a particular person entitled to receive [CHRI] and updates to a particular record to which the person has subscribed under this subchapter.

---

<sup>6</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure.

(b) On receiving a request for [CHRI] from a person entitled to such information under this subchapter, the [DPS] shall provide through the electronic clearinghouse:

(1) the [CHRI] reported to the [DPS] or the Federal Bureau of Investigation relating to the individual who is the subject of the request; or

(2) a statement that the individual who is the subject of the request does not have any [CHRI] reported to the [DPS] or the Federal Bureau of Investigation.

...

(d) The [DPS] shall ensure that the information described by Subsection (b) is provided only to a person otherwise entitled to obtain [CHRI] under this subchapter. Information collected under this section is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under [the Act].

*Id.* § 411.0845(a)-(b), (d). Section 411.097(b) of the Government Code provides in part that “[a] school district . . . is entitled to obtain from the [DPS CHRI] maintained by the [DPS] that the district . . . is required or authorized to obtain under Subchapter C, Chapter 22, Education Code, that relates to a[n] . . . employee of the district[.]” *Id.* § 411.097(b). Pursuant to section 22.083(a-1) of the Education Code, a school district is authorized to obtain CHRI from the DPS’s electronic clearinghouse. *See* Educ. Code § 22.083(a-1)(1). Section 22.08391(d) of the Education Code states that any CHRI received by a school district is subject to section 411.097(d) of the Government Code. *Id.* § 22.08391(d). Section 411.097(d) provides in relevant part:

(d) [CHRI] obtained by a school district, charter school, private school, service center, commercial transportation company, or shared services arrangement in the original form or any subsequent form:

(1) may not be released to any person except:

(A) the individual who is the subject of the information;

(B) the Texas Education Agency;

(C) the State Board for Educator Certification;

(D) the chief personnel officer of the transportation company, if the information is obtained under Subsection (a)(2); or

(E) by court order[.]

Gov't Code § 411.097(d)(1). You state some of the submitted information consists of CHRI derived from the DPS criminal history clearinghouse. Upon review, we agree the information we marked is confidential under section 411.0845 of the Government Code. We note the requestor is not an individual authorized to receive information under section 411.097(d)(1). Thus, the district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.0845 of the Government Code. However, we find you have not demonstrated any of the remaining information constitutes CHRI that is confidential under chapter 411 of the Government Code. Therefore, the district may not withhold any of the remaining responsive information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 21.355 of the Education Code. Section 21.355(a) provides “[a] document evaluating the performance of a teacher or administrator is confidential.” Educ. Code § 21.355(a). This office has interpreted section 21.355 to apply to any document that evaluates, as that term is commonly understood, the performance of a teacher. *See* Open Records Decision No. 643 at 3 (1996). We also determined a “teacher” for purposes of section 21.355 means a person who (1) is required to and does in fact hold a teaching certificate under subchapter B of chapter 21 of the Education Code or a school district teaching permit under section 21.055 and (2) is engaged in the process of teaching, as that term is commonly defined, at the time of the evaluation. *See id.* at 4.

You contend portions of the submitted information are confidential under section 21.355 of the Education Code. You assert some of the submitted information evaluates the performance of teachers who hold the appropriate certificates for the purpose of section 21.355. Upon review, we agree the information you have indicated consists of evaluations of the teachers’ performances and is subject to section 21.355 of the Education Code. Therefore, the district must withhold the information you have indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 21.355 of the Education Code.

You assert a portion of the remaining information is confidential pursuant to common-law privacy. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we find you have

failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Thus, the district may not withhold the remaining information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Accordingly, the district must withhold the information we have marked and you have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.102(b) of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure “a transcript from an institution of higher education maintained in the personnel file of a professional public school employee[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.102(b). However, section 552.102(b) further provides, “the degree obtained or the curriculum on a transcript in the personnel file of the employee” is not excepted from disclosure. *Id.*; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 526 (1989). Thus, with the exception of the employee’s name, courses taken, and degrees obtained, the district must withhold the submitted college transcripts you have indicated under section 552.102(b) of the Government Code.

As noted above, you state you will redact the information you have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code pursuant to section 552.024(c)(2) of the Government Code. However, we note the remaining responsive information contains additional information subject to section 552.117(a)(1). Section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home address and telephone number, emergency contact information, social security number, and family member information of a current or former employee or official of a governmental body who requests this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.117(a)(1). Whether a particular item of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time of the governmental body’s receipt of the request for the information. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Thus, information may be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) only on behalf of a current or former employee or official who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date of the governmental body’s receipt of the request for the information. You have provided copies of election forms completed by the named employees, in which they elected to keep the information at issue confidential. Accordingly, the district must withhold the information we have marked and you have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code.

In summary, the district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the ADA. The district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA. The district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with sections 411.0845 of the Government Code. The district must withhold the information you have indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 21.355 of the Education Code. The district must withhold the dates of birth we have marked and you have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. With the exception of the employee's name, courses taken, and degrees obtained, the district must withhold the submitted college transcripts it has indicated under section 552.102(b) of the Government Code. The district must withhold the information we have marked and you have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kavid Singh  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

KVS/som

Ref: ID# 610592

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)