



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 17, 2016

Mr. Gary A. Scott
Assistant City Attorney
City of Conroe
P. O. Box 3066
Conroe, Texas 77305

OR2016-11297

Dear Mr. Scott:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 610483.

The City of Conroe (the "city") received a request for information pertaining to a named individual. The city claims the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code, which makes confidential juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. *See* Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Section 58.007 provides in relevant part the following:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

...

(e) Law enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101. a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code, the child, and the child's parent or guardian.

Id. § 58.007(c), (e). Upon review, we find police report number 11123143 involves alleged juvenile delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred after September 1, 1997. *See id.* §§ 51.02(2) (for purposes of section 58.007(c), "child" means person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age when conduct occurred), .03(a)-(b) (defining "delinquent conduct" and "conduct indicating a need for supervision"). Although the requestor is a recruiter for the United States Army (the "Army") and the named individual has provided the Army with a signed authorization for the release of his information, the named individual is not the juvenile offender at issue, so as to implicate the access provided in section 58.007(e) of the Family Code. *See id.* § 58.007(e). Therefore, police report number 11123143 is confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

Nevertheless, we note the United States Department of Defense (the "DoD") is authorized to perform background investigations of persons seeking acceptance or retention in the armed services. *See* 5 U.S.C. § 9101(b)(1)(C); *see also id.* § 9101(a)(6)(A) (DoD is covered agency for purposes of section 9101). The Army has a right to the criminal history record information of state and local criminal justice agencies when the named individual has provided the Army with consent for the release of the criminal history record information. *See id.* § 9101(b)(1), (c); *see also* 10 U.S.C. § 111(b)(6) (DoD includes Department of the Army). Criminal history record information is defined as "information collected by criminal justice agencies on individuals consisting of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, indictments, informations, or other formal criminal charges, and any disposition arising therefrom, sentencing, correction supervision, and release" but does not include "identification information such as fingerprint records to the extent that such information

does not indicate involvement in the criminal justice system” or “records of a State or locality sealed pursuant to law from access by State and local criminal justice agencies of that State or locality.” 5 U.S.C. § 9101(a)(2).

Federal law provides the Army’s right of access to criminal history record information preempts state confidentiality provisions. *Id.* § 9101(b)(4) (section 9101 “shall apply notwithstanding any other provision of law . . . of any State”). The Army’s right of access under federal law preempts the state confidentiality provision you claim. *See English v. General Elec. Co.*, 496 U.S. 72, 79 (1990) (state law is preempted to extent it actually conflicts with federal law); *see also La. Pub. Serv. Comm’n v. FCC*, 476 U.S. 355, 369 (1986) (federal agency acting within scope of its congressionally delegated authority may preempt state regulation). However, federal law also provides the Army’s right of access is contingent on the request being made for eligibility or retention purposes, and on receiving written consent from the individual under investigation for the release of such CHRI. *See* 5 U.S.C. § 9101(c).

The requestor states the request for information was made for enlistment eligibility purposes, and the individual under investigation has provided the Army with a signed authorization for the release of the information at issue. Accordingly, the city must release the criminal history record information of the named individual from police report number 11123143, but must withhold the remaining information in this report under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

We find the remaining information does not involve alleged juvenile delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred after September 1, 1997. Thus, the remaining information is not confidential under section 58.007(c) and the city may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that ground.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen’s date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court’s rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees’ dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees’ privacy interest

substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.¹ *Tex. Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens and, thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. The requestor has a right of access to the named individual's private information pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Nevertheless, the city must withhold the remaining public citizen's date of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. The city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

To conclude, the city must withhold police report number 11123143 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code, with the exception of the criminal history record information of the named individual, which the city must release from this report. The city must withhold the public citizen's date of birth, other than the named individual's date of birth, in the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must also withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for

¹Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

²Because the requestor has a special right of access to some of the information being released, the city must again seek a decision from this office if it receives another request for the same information from another requestor.

providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Cindy Nettles". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name being more prominent.

Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/eb

Ref: ID# 610483

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)