



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 18, 2016

Ms. Lillian Guillen Graham
Assistant City Attorney
City of Mesquite
P.O. Box 850137
Mesquite, Texas 75185-0137

OR2016-11353

Dear Ms. Graham:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 610856.

The Mesquite Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You state the department will redact the dates of birth you have marked pursuant to Open Records Letter No. 2015-24970 (2015).¹ You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be

¹Open Records Letter No. 2015-24970 is a previous determination issued to the department authorizing the department to withhold private citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy without requesting a decision from this office.

satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987).

Upon review, we find some of the submitted information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate the remaining information you have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Accordingly, except for the information we have marked for release, the department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department may not withhold the remaining information at issue under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(a). The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, except for the information we have marked for release, the department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for

²We note the requestor has a special right of access to some of the information being released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates, or that party's representative, solely on grounds that information is considered confidential by privacy principles). Accordingly, if the department receives another request for this information from a different requestor, it must again seek a ruling from this office.

providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Cindy Nettles". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a long horizontal stroke at the end.

Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/dls

Ref: ID# 610856

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)