



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 18, 2016

Ms. Leslie O. Haby  
Assistant Criminal District Attorney  
Civil Division  
County of Bexar  
101 West Nueva Street, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Antonio, Texas 78205

OR2016-11403

Dear Ms. Haby:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 610779.

The Bexar County Criminal District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") received a request for the complete file related to a specified case. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the federal Driver's Privacy Protection Act of 1994 (the "DPPA"), section 2721 of title 18 of the United States Code. Section 2721 provides, in part, the following:

- (a) In general — A State department of motor vehicles, and any officer, employee, or contractor thereof, shall not knowingly disclose or otherwise make available to any person or entity:

(1) personal information, as defined in 18 U.S.C. 2725(3), about any individual obtained by the department in connection with a motor vehicle record, except as provided in subsection (b) of this section; or

(2) highly restricted personal information, as defined in 18 U.S.C. 2725(4), about any individual obtained by the department in connection with a motor vehicle record, without the express consent of the person to whom such information applies, except uses permitted in subsections (b)(1), (b)(4), (b)(6), and (b)(9)[.]

(b) Permissible uses.—Personal information referred to in subsection (a) . . . and, subject to subsection (a)(2), may be disclosed as follows:

(1) For use by any government agency . . . in carrying out its functions.

...

(c) Resale or redisclosure.—An authorized recipient of personal information (except a recipient under subsection (b)(11) or (12)) may resell or redisclose the information only for a use permitted under subsection (b) (but not for uses under subsection (b)(11) or (12)). . . . Any authorized recipient (except a recipient under subsection (b)(11)) that resells or rediscloses personal information covered by this chapter must keep for a period of 5 years records identifying each person or entity that receives information and the permitted purpose for which the information will be used and must make such records available to the motor vehicle department upon request.

18 U.S.C. § 2721(a), (b)(1), (c). Section 2721(a) is applicable to state departments of motor vehicles. *See id.* § 2721(a). Pursuant to section 2721(b), personal information may be disclosed to certain entities by a state department of motor vehicles. *See id.* § 2721(b). However, we find the district attorney’s office is not a state department of motor vehicles. Further, we find the district attorney’s office does not assert it received the information at issue from a state department of motor vehicles. Therefore, the district attorney’s office has failed to demonstrate any of the submitted information is subject to section 2721(a) of the DPPA. Accordingly, the district attorney’s office may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 730.004 of the Transportation Code, which provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of law to the contrary, including chapter 552, Government Code, except as provided by sections 730.005-730.007, an agency may not disclose personal information about any person obtained by the agency in connection

with a motor vehicle record.” Transp. Code § 730.004. Section 730.004 applies only to an “agency” that compiles or maintains motor vehicle records. *See id.* § 730.003(1). You have not established the district attorney’s office compiles or maintains motor vehicle records for purposes of chapter 730; therefore, section 730.004 does not apply to the district attorney’s office and the district attorney’s office may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 411.083 of the Government Code which pertains to criminal history record information (“CHRI”). CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter E-1 or F of the Government Code. *See Gov’t Code* § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Similarly, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. We note records relating to routine traffic violations are not considered criminal history information. *Cf. id.* § 411.082(2)(B) (criminal history record information does not include driving record information). Upon review, we find the information we have marked constitutes confidential CHRI that must be withheld under section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law. Accordingly, the district attorney’s office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law. However, we find you have not demonstrated any portion of the remaining information at issue consists of CHRI for purposes of chapter 411 of the Government Code, and the district attorney’s office may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 560.003 of the Government Code, which provides that “[a] biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under [the Act].” *See Gov’t Code* § 560.003; *see also id.* §§ 560.001(1) (defining “biometric identifier” to include fingerprints), .002(1)(A) (governmental body may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose individual’s biometric identifier to another person unless individual consents to disclosure). Upon review, we find

the fingerprints we have marked constitute biometric identifiers for purposes of section 560.003 of the Government Code. Accordingly, the district attorney's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. In considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure. *Tex. Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Furthermore, a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). We also find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, we note records relating to routine traffic violations are not considered criminal history information. *Cf. Gov't Code* § 411.082(2)(B).

Upon review, we find the district attorney's office must withhold the public citizens' dates of birth, as well as the information we have marked, in the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, you have failed to demonstrate the remaining information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Thus, the district attorney's office may not withhold any portion of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.108 of the Government Code provides, in part:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:

...

(4) it is information that:

(A) is prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation; or

(B) reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state.

(b) An internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution [is excepted from required public disclosure] if:

...

(3) the internal record or notation:

(A) is prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation; or

(B) reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state.

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(4), (b)(3). A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why this exception is applicable to the information the governmental body seeks to withhold. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(4), (b)(3), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state some of the remaining information reflects the mental impressions and legal strategies of attorneys representing the state in anticipation of, or in the course of preparing for, criminal litigation. Upon review, we agree some of the information at issue reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of attorneys representing the state. Accordingly, we find the district attorney's office may withhold the information we have marked under sections 552.108(a)(4) and 552.108(b)(3)

of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> However, we find you have failed to demonstrate, nor does the submitted documentation reflect, any portion of the remaining information at issue was prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation or reflects the mental processes or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state. Accordingly, we find you have failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information at issue is protected by sections 552.108(a)(4) and 552.108(b)(3), and the district attorney's office may not withhold such information under section 552.108 of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit, a motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. Gov't Code § 552.130(a). Accordingly, the district attorney's office must withhold the information we have marked in the remaining information under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136(b) of the Government Code provides, "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining "access device"). However, we find the remaining information does not include access device numbers excepted by section 552.136 of the Government Code and the district attorney's office may not withhold any of the remaining information on that basis.

In summary, the district attorney's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law. The district attorney's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code. The district attorney's office must withhold the public citizens' dates of birth, as well as the information we have marked, in the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The district attorney's office may withhold the information we have marked under sections 552.108(a)(4) and 552.108(b)(3) of the Government Code. The district attorney's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The district attorney's office must release the remaining information.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup>As our ruling is dispositive for this information, we need not address your remaining arguments against its disclosure.

<sup>2</sup>We note the information being released contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision under the Act. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Joseph Behnke  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

JB/som

Ref: ID# 610779

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)