



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 6, 2016

Mr. Mark G. Daniel  
Counsel for the City of Watauga  
Evans, Daniel, Moore, Evans & Biggs  
115 West Second Street, Suite 202  
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2016-12818

Dear Mr. Daniel:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 612875 (ORR No. 16-28).

The City of Watauga (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for the name and date of birth of the individual who receives bills at a specified address. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the requestor only seeks the name and date of birth of the individual who receives bills at a specified address. Accordingly, only the submitted name and date of birth are responsive to the request. This ruling does not address the public availability of any information that is not responsive to the request and the city is not required to release such information in response to this request.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup>Although you do not cite to sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code in your brief to this office, we understand you to raise these sections based on the substance of your arguments.

<sup>2</sup>As we are able to make this determination, we need not address your arguments against disclosure of this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses section 182.052 of the Utilities Code, which provides, in part, the following:

(a) Except as provided by Section 182.054, a government-operated utility may not disclose personal information in a customer’s account record, or any information relating to the volume or units of utility usage or the amounts billed to or collected from the individual for utility usage, if the customer requests that the government-operated utility keep the information confidential. However, a government-operated utility may disclose information related to the customer’s volume or units of utility usage or amounts billed to or collected from the individual for utility usage if the primary source of water for such utility was a sole-source designated aquifer.

(b) A customer may request confidentiality by delivering to the government-operated utility an appropriately marked form provided under Subsection (c)(3) or any other written request for confidentiality.

Util. Code § 182.052(a)-(b). “Personal information” under section 182.052(a) means an individual’s address, telephone number, or social security number, but does not include the individual’s name. *See id.* § 182.051(4); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 625 (1994) (construing statutory predecessor). Water service is included in the scope of utility services covered by section 182.052. Util. Code § 182.051(3). Section 182.054 of the Utilities Code provides six exceptions to the disclosure prohibition found in section 182.052. *See id.* § 182.054.

You argue the responsive information consists of confidential information in a customer’s account record. You assert the responsive information pertains to a customer who timely requested confidentiality for his information under section 182.052. However, we note the statute protects only personal information and information relating to the volume or units of utility usage or the amounts billed or collected from the individual for utility usage. Thus, the responsive information is not made confidential by section 182.052, and the city may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 182.052 of the Utilities Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen’s date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court’s rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-

CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.<sup>3</sup> *Tex. Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3. Thus, the city must withhold the public citizen's date of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. As you raise no further exceptions to disclosure, the city must release the remaining responsive information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kenny Moreland  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

KJM/som

Ref: ID# 612875

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)

---

<sup>3</sup>Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).