



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 6, 2016

Mr. Cary L. Bovey
Counsel for City of Brenham
Law Office of Cary L. Bovey PLLC
2251 Double Creek Drive, Suite 204
Round Rock, Texas 78664

OR2016-12860

Dear Mr. Bovey:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 613053.

The City of Brenham (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for the proposals and rate exhibits submitted for a specified request for proposals. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.104, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code. You also state you notified Budget Disposal ("Budget"); Progressive Waste Solutions ("Progressive"); Republic Services; and Texas Disposal Systems, Inc., of the request for information and of their right to submit arguments to this office as to why the submitted information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain circumstances). We have received comments from Budget and Progressive. We have considered the submitted arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

An interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this ruling, we have only received comments from Budget and Progressive. Thus, we have no basis to conclude any of the remaining third parties has a protected proprietary interest in the submitted information. *See id.* § 552.110(a)-(b); Open Records Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6

(1999) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual evidence, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that release of requested information would cause that party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret), 542 at 3. Accordingly, the city may not withhold any of the submitted information on the basis of any proprietary interest any of the remaining third parties may have in the information.

Section 552.104(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information that, if released, would give advantage to a competitor or bidder.” Gov’t Code § 552.104(a). The “test under section 552.104 is whether knowing another bidder’s [or competitor’s information] would be an advantage, not whether it would be a decisive advantage.” *Boeing Co. v. Paxton*, 466 S.W.3d 831 (Tex. 2015). You represent the submitted information pertains to a competitive bidding situation. In addition, you state release of the information at issue would give the requestor an advantage over its competitors. After review of the information at issue and consideration of the arguments, we find the city has established the release of the information at issue would give advantage to a competitor or bidder. Thus, we conclude the city may withhold the submitted information under section 552.104(a) of the Government Code.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,


Meredith L. Coffman
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MLC/bw

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

Ref: ID# 613053

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

4 Third Parties
(w/o enclosures)