



KEN PAXTON  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 6, 2016

Mr. Nicholas Toulet  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of Midland  
P.O. Box 1152  
Midland, Texas 79702

OR2016-12867

Dear Mr. Toulet:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 613172 (Midland ID# 19077).

The Midland Police Department (the "department") received a request for three specified incident reports involving a named individual. You state you have released some information to the requestor, including information released pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.087(a)(2). You claim the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes such as section 58.007 of the Family Code, which provides, in pertinent part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Juvenile law enforcement records relating to delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007 of the Family Code. *See id.* § 51.03(a), (b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of section 58.007 of the Family Code). For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the conduct at issue. *See id.* § 51.02(2). You assert Exhibit B is confidential under section 58.007(c). Upon review, we find Exhibit B involves juvenile delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. As such, this information constitutes juvenile law enforcement records that are generally confidential pursuant to section 58.007(c).

We note the requestor is a representative of the Probation Office of the United States District Court for the Western District of Texas (the “probation office”), and section 58.007(e) of the Family Code gives a “criminal justice agency as . . . defined by Section 411.082, Government Code” a right of access to juvenile law enforcement records. *Id.* § 58.007(e). Section 411.082 of the Government Code defines a “criminal justice agency” as including “a federal or state agency that is engaged in the administration of criminal justice under a statute or executive order and that allocates a substantial portion of its annual budget to the administration of criminal justice[.]” Gov’t Code § 411.082(3)(A). We understand the probation office is a criminal justice agency as defined by section 411.082. *See id.* Therefore, the requestor generally has a right of access to Exhibit B under section 58.007(e) and the department may not withhold this information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code exempts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” *Id.* § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706, 710 (Tex. 1977). You state Exhibit C relates to a pending criminal investigation. Based upon this representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177, 186-87 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law

enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559, 560-61 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to Exhibit C.

However, section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See 531 S.W.2d at 186-87; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold Exhibit C under section 552.108(a)(1).<sup>1</sup>

We note some of the information within Exhibit B is subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code.<sup>2</sup> Section 552.130 provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. See Gov't Code § 552.130(a). Accordingly, the motor vehicle record information we have marked and all images of license plates within the submitted photographs are generally excepted from disclosure under section 552.130.

However, as previously noted, the requestor has a statutory right to inspect Exhibit B pursuant to section 58.007(e) of the Family Code. Therefore, we must address the conflict between the access provided under section 58.007(e) and the confidentiality provided under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Where information falls within both a general and a specific provision of law, the specific provision prevails over the general. See *Horizon/CMS Healthcare Corp. v. Auld*, 34 S.W.3d 887, 901 (Tex. 2000) ("more specific statute controls over the more general"); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 277 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones). In this instance, section 58.007(e) generally applies to all juvenile law enforcement records, while section 552.130 specifically protects motor vehicle record information. Although a specific statutory right of access prevails over general exceptions to disclosure under the Act, because section 552.130 has its own access provisions, we conclude section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. Thus, we find the confidentiality provided by section 552.130 is more specific than the general right of access provided by section 58.007(e). Accordingly, within Exhibit B, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked and all images of license plates within the submitted photographs under section 552.130.

---

<sup>1</sup>As noted above, we understand the department has released any information to which the requestor would have a right of access under section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code.

<sup>2</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

In summary, with the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold Exhibit C under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. Within Exhibit B, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked and all images of license plates within the submitted photographs under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.<sup>3</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cole Hutchison  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

CH/akg

Ref: ID# 613172

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)

---

<sup>3</sup>We note the requestor has a special right of access to information being released pursuant to section 58.007(e) of the Family Code. *See* Fam. Code § 58.007(e). If the department receives another request for this information from a different requestor, then the department should again seek a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302; Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001).