



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 8, 2016

Ms. Dina Powell
Legal Assistant
Texas Alcoholic Beverages Commission
P.O. Box 13127
Austin, Texas 78711

OR2016-13103

Dear Ms. Powell:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 613579.

The Texas Alcoholic Beverage Commission (the "commission") received a request for e-mails sent or received by a named individual during a specified time period regarding specified parties. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information contains an agenda of a public meeting held by the commission. The agendas of a governmental body's public meetings are specifically made public under provisions of the Open Meetings Act, chapter 551 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code §§ 551.022 (minutes and tape recordings of open meeting are public records and shall be available for public inspection and copying on request to governmental body's chief administrative officer or officer's designee), .041 (governmental body shall give written notice of date, hour, place, and subject of each meeting), .043 (notice of meeting of governmental body must be posted in place readily accessible to general public for at least 72 hours before scheduled time of meeting). Although you seek to withhold this information under section 552.103 of the Government Code, as a general rule, the exceptions to

disclosure found in the Act do not apply to information that other statutes make public. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 623 at 3 (1994), 525 at 3 (1989). Accordingly, the commission must release the information we marked pursuant to chapter 551 of the Government Code.

Next, we note some of the remaining information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

...

(17) information that is also contained in a public court record[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). The remaining information contains court-filed documents that are subject to section 552.022(a)(17). The commission must release this information pursuant to section 552.022(a)(17), unless it is made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* You seek to withhold this information under section 552.103 of the Government Code. However, section 552.103 is a discretionary exception and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions). Therefore, the information at issue may not be withheld under section 552.103. However, because section 552.137 of the Government Code makes information confidential under the Act, we will consider the applicability of section 552.137 for the information at issue.¹ Further, we will consider the applicability of section 552.103 to the remaining information not subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code.

Section 552.103 of the Government Code provides in pertinent part:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

...

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

Gov't Code § 552.103(a), (c). A governmental body has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show the section 552.103(a) exception is applicable in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a showing that (1) litigation was pending or reasonably anticipated on the date of the receipt of the request for information and (2) the information at issue is related to the pending or anticipated litigation. *Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, orig. proceeding); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990). A governmental body must meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted from disclosure under section 552.103(a).

To establish litigation is reasonably anticipated, a governmental body must provide this office “concrete evidence showing that the claim that litigation may ensue is more than mere conjecture.” Open Records Decision No. 452 at 4 (1986). In the context of anticipated litigation in which the governmental body is the prospective plaintiff, the concrete evidence must at least reflect that litigation is “realistically contemplated.” See Open Records Decision No. 518 at 5 (1989); see also Attorney General Opinion MW-575 (1982) (finding that investigatory file may be withheld from disclosure if governmental body attorney determines that it should be withheld pursuant to section 552.103 and that litigation is “reasonably likely to result”). Whether litigation is reasonably anticipated must be determined on a case-by-case basis. See ORD 452 at 4. We note contested cases conducted under the Administrative Procedure Act (the “APA”), chapter 2001 of the Government Code, are considered litigation for purposes of section 552.103. See Open Records Decision No. 588 at 7 (1991). We further note a contested case before the State Office of Administrative Hearings (“SOAH”) is considered litigation for the purposes of the APA. See *id.*

You inform us the commission has the authority to pursue contested cases under the Alcoholic Beverage Code. You state the commission initiated an administrative case against a specified permit holder named in the request prior to the receipt of the instant request. You inform us the permittee has requested a hearing before SOAH. Based on your representations and our review, we determine the commission reasonably anticipated litigation on the date it received the instant request for information. Further, you state, and we agree, the submitted information relates to the anticipated litigation. Therefore, we

conclude the commission may generally withhold the remaining information under section 552.103 of the Government Code.

We note, however, the opposing party has seen or had access to some of the information at issue. The purpose of section 552.103 of the Government Code is to enable a governmental body to protect its position in litigation by forcing parties seeking information relating to the litigation to obtain such information through discovery procedures. *See* ORD 551 at 4-5. Thus, once the opposing party in pending litigation has seen or had access to information that is related to the litigation, there is no interest in withholding such information from public disclosure under section 552.103. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 349 (1982), 320 (1982). Accordingly, with the exception of the information we marked for release, the commission may withhold the remaining information under section 552.103 of the Government Code. We note the applicability of section 552.103 ends once the related litigation concludes. *See* Attorney General Opinion MW-575 (1982); Open Records Decision No. 350 (1982).

We note the remaining information contains e-mail addresses that are subject to section 552.137 of the Government Code. Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body” unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See* Gov’t Code § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail addresses at issue are not excluded by subsection (c). Therefore, the commission must withhold the personal e-mail addresses we marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners affirmatively consent to their public disclosure.

In summary, the commission must release the information we marked pursuant to chapter 551 of the Government Code. With the exception of the information we marked for release and the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17), the commission may withhold the remaining information under section 552.103 of the Government Code. Unless the owners of the e-mail addresses we marked affirmatively consent to their disclosure, the commission must withhold the e-mail addresses we marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for

providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Ian Lancaster".

Ian Lancaster
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

IML/akg

Ref: ID# 613579

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)