



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 9, 2016

Deputy Danie Huffman
Public Information Coordinator
Parker County Sheriff's Office
129 Hogle Street
Weatherford, Texas 76086

OR2016-13241

Dear Deputy Huffman:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 613520.

The Parker County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for all reports regarding any crime or public safety issue at any school or university within a specified time period. You state the sheriff's office will release some information upon payment of costs. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.117, 552.1175, 552.130, and 552.148 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information contains press releases. Section 552.007 of the Government Code provides information that has been voluntarily released to a member of the public may not subsequently be withheld from another member of the public, unless public disclosure of the information is expressly prohibited by law or the information is confidential under law. *See* Gov't Code § 552.007; Open Records Decision Nos. 518 at 3

¹Although you raise sections 552.021 of the Government Code, we note this section is not an exception to disclosure under the Act. *See* Gov't Code § 552.021. Further, although you cite to section 552.151 of the Government Code in your brief, you provide no argument or markings explaining how this exception is applicable. Therefore, we assume you no longer assert this exception. *Id.* §§ 552.301, .302.

(1989), 490 at 2 (1988). Accordingly, the sheriff's office may not withhold previously released information unless its release is expressly prohibited by law or the information is confidential under law. Although you seek to withhold the previously released information under section 552.108 of the Government Code, this section is a discretionary exception to disclosure and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5, 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 586 (1991) (governmental body may waive section 552.108). Therefore, the sheriff's office may not withhold the press releases, which we have marked, under section 552.108 of the Government Code. As you raise no further exceptions to disclosure for this information, it must be released.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). A portion of the submitted information consists of files, reports, records, communications, or working papers used or developed in investigations of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining "child" for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code), 261.001(1), (4) (defining "abuse" and "neglect" for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, the information at issue is within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. Because you do not indicate the sheriff's office has adopted a rule governing the release of this type of information, we assume no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, the information at issue, which we marked, is confidential pursuant to section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute). Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in

conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code.² However, none of the remaining information is confidential under section 261.201 of the Family Code, and none of it may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code, which makes confidential juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. *See* Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Section 58.007 provides, in relevant part, the following:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Id. For purposes of section 58.007(c), a “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age when the conduct occurred. *Id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we find the information we marked involves alleged delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred after September 1, 1997. Thus, the sheriff’s office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.³ However, we find the sheriff’s office has not demonstrated the applicability of section 58.007(c) of the Family Code to the remaining information at issue. Thus, the sheriff’s office may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

³As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state a portion of the remaining information relates to a pending criminal prosecution. Based on your representation and our review, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to this information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic “front-page” information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-187; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, which must be released, the sheriff’s office may withhold the information at issue, which we marked, under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.⁴

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You state the remaining information “[has] not or did not result in arrest, prosecution, conviction[,] or deferred adjudication.” We note, however, section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable only if the information at issue is related to a concluded criminal case that “*did not result* in conviction or deferred adjudication.” *See id.* § 552.108(a)(2) (emphasis added). Further, you do not explain or indicate whether the submitted information pertains to closed criminal cases. Thus, we find the sheriff’s office failed to demonstrate the applicability of section 552.108(a)(2) to the remaining information. Accordingly, the sheriff’s office may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

⁴As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 418.182 of the Government Code, which was added to chapter 418 of the Government Code as part of the Texas Homeland Security Act (“HSA”). Section 418.182(a) of the Government Code provides in relevant part, “information . . . in the possession of a governmental entity that relates to the specifications, operating procedures, or location of a security system used to protect public or private property from an act of terrorism or related criminal activity is confidential.” *Id.* § 418.182(a). The fact that information may be related to a governmental body’s security system does not make the information *per se* confidential under section 418.182. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 at 3 (1996) (language of confidentiality provision controls scope of its protection). Furthermore, the mere recitation by a governmental body of a statute’s key terms is not sufficient to demonstrate the applicability of a claimed provision. As with any confidentiality provision, a governmental body asserting section 418.182 must adequately explain how the responsive information falls within the scope of the statute. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.301(e)(1)(A).

You state the submitted information contains information regarding security alarms at schools. You state the disclosure of this information would reveal the locations and operation of these security alarms. You further state these alarms are part of a security system used to protect public property, students, and personnel from acts of terrorism or other criminal activity. Upon review, we find portions of the information relate to the specifications and location of a security system used to protect public or private property from an act of terrorism or related criminal activity. *See Tex. Dep’t of Pub. Safety v. Abbott*, 310 S.W.3d 670 (Tex. App.—Austin 2010, no pet.) (finding confidential under section 418.182 of HSA video recording containing images recorded by security cameras in Texas Capitol hallway because specifications of security system included cameras’ capabilities and video recording demonstrated those capabilities through characteristics, quality, and clarity of images recorded). Accordingly, the sheriff’s office must withhold the information at issue, which we marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 418.182(a) of the Government Code.⁵ However, upon review, we find the remaining information does not relate to the specifications and location of a security system used to protect public or private property from an act of terrorism or related criminal activity and may not be withheld on that basis.

You also raise section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (“HIPAA”). At the direction of Congress, the Secretary of Health and Human Services (“HHS”) promulgated regulations setting privacy standards for medical records, which HHS issued as the Federal Standards for Privacy of Individually Identifiable Health Information. *See* HIPAA, 42 U.S.C. § 1320d-2 (Supp. IV 1998) (historical & statutory note); Standards for Privacy of Individually Identifiable Health Information, 45 C.F.R. Pts. 160, 164 (“Privacy Rule”); *see*

⁵As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure.

also Attorney General Opinion JC-0508 at 2 (2002). These standards govern the releasability of protected health information by a covered entity. *See* 45 C.F.R. pts. 160, 164. Under these standards, a covered entity may not use or disclose protected health information, excepted as provided by parts 160 and 164 of the Code of Federal Regulations. *Id.* § 164.502(a).

This office has addressed the interplay of the Privacy Rule and the Act. Open Records Decision No. 681 (2004). In that decision, we noted section 164.512 of title 45 of the Code of Federal Regulations provides a covered entity may use or disclose protected health information to the extent such use or disclosure is required by law and the use or disclosure complies with and is limited to the relevant requirements of such law. *See* 45 C.F.R. § 164.512(a)(1). We further noted the Act “is a mandate in Texas law that compels Texas governmental bodies to disclose information to the public.” *See* ORD 681 at 8; *see also* Gov’t Code §§ 552.002, .003, .021. We therefore held the disclosures under the Act come within section 164.512(a). Consequently, the Privacy Rule does not make information confidential for the purpose of section 552.101 of the Government Code. *See Abbott v Tex. Dep’t of Mental Health & Mental Retardation*, 212 S.W.3d 648 (Tex. App.—Austin 2006, no pet.); ORD 681 at 9; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 478 (1987) (as general rule, statutory confidentiality requires express language making information confidential). Because the Privacy Rule does not make confidential information that is subject to disclosure under the Act, the sheriff’s office may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with HIPAA.

You also raise section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the Medical Practice Act (the “MPA”), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in pertinent part:

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient’s behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(b), (c). This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician and information obtained from those records. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). Upon review, we find none of the remaining information constitutes medical records subject to section 159.002. Accordingly,

the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.⁶ *Texas Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. This office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). This office has also found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992) (employee's designation of retirement beneficiary, choice of insurance carrier, election of optional coverages, direct deposit authorization, forms allowing employee to allocate pretax compensation to group insurance, health care or dependent care), 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under common-law privacy).

Upon review, we find the information we marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Therefore, the sheriff's office may not withhold the remaining information,

⁶Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

including the dates of birth of individuals who are not identified, under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home address and telephone number, emergency contact information, social security number, and family member information of a current or former employee or official of a governmental body who requests this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code. *See Gov't Code*. § 552.117(a)(1). Whether a particular item of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. *See Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989)*. Thus, information may be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) only on behalf of a current or former employee or official who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. However, upon review, we find no portion of the remaining information is subject to section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code, and the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue on that basis.

Section 552.1175 of the Government Code protects the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, date of birth, social security number, and family member information of certain individuals, when that information is held by a governmental body in a non-employment capacity and the individual elects to keep the information confidential. *Gov't Code* § 552.1175. Upon review, we find the sheriff's office has failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information is subject to section 552.1175 of the Government Code. Accordingly, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the remaining information on that basis.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *Id.* § 552.130(a). The sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. However, we find none of the remaining information is subject to section 552.130 and it may not be withheld on that basis.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential."⁷ *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining "access device"). Upon review, the sheriff's

⁷The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987)*.

office must withhold the account numbers we marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Section 552.147 of the Government Code provides that “[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from” required public disclosure under the Act. *Id.* § 552.147(a). Upon review, we agree the sheriff’s office may withhold the social security numbers you marked in the remaining information under section 552.147(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.148 of the Government Code provides the following:

- (a) In this section, “minor” means a person younger than 18 years of age.
- (b) The following information maintained by a municipality for purposes related to the participation by a minor in a recreational program or activity is excepted from [required disclosure]:
 - (1) the name, age, home address, home telephone number, or social security number of the minor;
 - (2) a photograph of the minor; and
 - (3) the name of the minor’s parent or legal guardian.

Gov’t Code § 552.148. Section 552.148 specifically applies to information maintained by a municipality “for purposes related to the participation by a minor in a recreational program or activity[.]” *Id.* § 552.148(b). Because the sheriff’s office is not a municipality, and because the remaining information is not related to participation in a recreational program or activity, section 552.148 of the Government Code does not apply, and the sheriff’s office may not withhold any of the remaining information on this basis.

In summary, the sheriff’s office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with sections 261.201(a) and 58.007(c) of the Family Code. With the exception of basic information, which must be released, the sheriff’s office withhold the information we marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The sheriff’s office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 418.182(a) of the Government Code and common-law privacy. The sheriff’s office must withhold the information we marked under sections 552.130 and 552.136 of the Government Code. The sheriff’s office may withhold the social security numbers you marked in the remaining

information under section 552.147(a) of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must release the remaining information.⁸

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Ramsey A. Abarca
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

RAA/dls

Ref: ID# 613520

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

⁸We note the information being released contains social security numbers subject to section 552.147 of the Government Code. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this officer under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b).