



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 15, 2016

Ms. Crystal Koonce
Open Records
County of Williamson
508 South Rock Street
Georgetown, Texas 78626

OR2016-13541

Dear Ms. Koonce:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 614443.

The Williamson County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for all information related to a named individual, including two specified incidents. We understand you will withhold some information pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.¹ You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.1175, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code.² We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

¹Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

²Although you also raise sections 552.102 through 552.107, sections 552.109 through 552.117, sections 552.118 through 552.129, sections 552.131 through 552.135, and sections 552.137 through 552.154 of the Government Code for the submitted information, you provide no arguments explaining how these exceptions are applicable to the information at issue. Therefore, we assume you no longer assert these exceptions. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302.

Initially, we note you did not submit any information responsive to the request for information related to one of the specified incidents. Therefore, to the extent information responsive to this aspect of the request exists, we assume the sheriff's office has released it to the requestor. If the sheriff's office has not released any such information, it must do so. Gov't Code §§ 552.301(a), .302; Open Records Decision No. 664 (2000) (noting that if governmental body concludes that no exceptions apply to requested information, it must release information as soon as possible under circumstances).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

We note you have submitted information that does not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant or information specifically requested by the requestor. This information is not part of a compilation of the individual's criminal history and may not be withheld on that basis. Therefore, we will consider applicability of the exceptions you raised to the information at issue.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). You state portions of the submitted information relate to investigations of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect conducted by the sheriff's office. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining "child" for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining "abuse" and "neglect" for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we find this information is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. You do not indicate the sheriff's office has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information. Therefore, we assume no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, we conclude the sheriff's office must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.³ *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state some of the remaining information pertains to an active criminal investigation or prosecution. Based on your representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. *See* Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply

³As our ruling is dispositive for this information, we need not address your remaining arguments against its disclosure.

to information requested). You state portions of the remaining information relate to a closed case that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on your representation, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the remaining information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

However, we note section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the basic information, the sheriff's office may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code⁴ and may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

As noted above, section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which is subject to the two-part test discussed above. Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 682. This office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. See Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). In considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.⁵ *Tex. Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. Upon review, we find some of the remaining information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, with the exception of the information we have marked for release, the sheriff's office must withhold the information you have marked, as well as the additional information we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate any portion of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Accordingly, the sheriff's office may not

⁴As our ruling is dispositive for this information, we need not consider your remaining argument against its disclosure.

⁵Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

withhold any portion of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.1175 of the Government Code protects the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, date of birth, social security number, and family member information of certain individuals, when that information is held by a governmental body in a non-employment capacity and the individual elects to keep the information confidential. *See* Gov't Code § 552.1175. Section 552.1175 applies, in part, to “peace officers as defined by Article 2.12, Code of Criminal Procedure[.]” *Id.* § 552.1175(a)(1). Accordingly, if the officer whose information is at issue elects to restrict access to his marked information in accordance with section 552.1175(b), the sheriff’s office must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.1175 of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See id.* § 552.130. Accordingly, the sheriff’s office must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the sheriff’s office must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. With the exception of the basic information, the sheriff’s office may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. With the exception of the information we have marked for release, the sheriff’s office must withhold the information you have marked, as well as the additional information we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. If the officer whose information is at issue elects to restrict access to his information in accordance with section 552.1175(b), the sheriff’s office must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.1175 of the Government Code. The sheriff’s office must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The sheriff’s office must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for

providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'JBW', with a long horizontal line extending to the right across the signature.

Joseph Behnke
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JB/som

Ref: ID# 614443

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)