



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 2, 2016

Mr. James K. Crain, III
Counsel for City of Cuero
Crain & Sheppard
P.O. Box 427
Cuero, Texas 77954

OR2016-17311

Dear Mr. Crain:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 620869.

The Cuero Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for certain personnel information pertaining to a named officer, except for social security numbers, driver's license numbers, and home addresses. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, 552.117, 552.1175, and 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information contains a peace officer's Texas Commission on Law Enforcement ("TCOLE") identification number. Section 552.002(a) of the Government Code defines "public information" as information that is written, produced, collected, assembled, or maintained under a law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of official business:

(1) by a governmental body;

¹Although you also raise section 552.119 of the Government Code, we note you have not submitted any photographs of a peace officer. Therefore, this ruling will not address that exception. You also raise sections 552.024 and 552.305 of the Government Code; however, we note these sections are not exceptions to disclosure. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.024, .305.

(2) for a governmental body and the governmental body:

(A) owns the information;

(B) has a right of access to the information; or

(C) spends or contributes public money for the purpose of writing, producing, collecting, assembling, or maintaining the information; or

(3) by an individual officer or employee of a governmental body in the officer's or employee's official capacity and the information pertains to official business of the governmental body.

Gov't Code § 552.002(a). In Open Records Decision No. 581 (1990), this office determined certain computer information, such as source codes, documentation information, and other computer programming, that has no significance other than its use as a tool for the maintenance, manipulation, or protection of public property is not the kind of information made public under section 552.021 of the Government Code. We understand an officer's TCOLE identification number is a unique computer-generated number assigned to peace officers for identification in the commissioner's electronic database, and may be used as an access device number on the TCOLE website. Accordingly, we find the officer's TCOLE identification number in the submitted information does not constitute public information under section 552.002 of the Government Code. Therefore, the TCOLE identification number is not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor.

Next, we note the requestor specifically excludes social security numbers, driver's license numbers, and home addresses from the scope of the request. Accordingly, these types of information are not responsive to the instant request. This ruling does not address the public availability of non-responsive information, nor is the department required to release non-responsive information to this requestor.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code, which pertains to L-2 Declaration of Medical Condition and L-3 Declaration of Psychological and Emotional Health forms required by TCOLE. Section 1701.306 provides the following:

(a) [TCOLE] may not issue a license to a person unless the person is examined by:

(1) a licensed psychologist or by a psychiatrist who declares in writing that the person is in satisfactory psychological and emotional health to serve as the type of officer for which a license is sought; and

(2) a licensed physician who declares in writing that the person does not show any trace of drug dependency or illegal drug use after a blood test or other medical test.

(b) An agency hiring a person for whom a license is sought shall select the examining physician and the examining psychologist or psychiatrist. The agency shall prepare a report of each declaration required by Subsection (a) and shall maintain a copy of the report on file in a format readily accessible to [TCOLE]. A declaration is not public information.

Occ. Code § 1701.306(a)-(b). Upon review, we find the department must withhold the submitted L-2 and L-3 forms under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a). You assert the privacy analysis under section 552.102(a) is the same as the common-law privacy test encompassed by section 552.101 of the Government Code, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W. 2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). In *Hubert v. Harte-Hanks Texas Newspapers, Inc.*, 652 S.W.2d 546, 549-51 (Tex. App.—Austin 1983, writ ref’d n.r.e.), the court of appeals ruled the privacy test under section 552.102(a) is the same as the *Industrial Foundation* privacy test. However, the Texas Supreme Court has expressly disagreed with *Hubert’s* interpretation of section 552.102(a), and held the privacy standard under section 552.102(a) differs from the *Industrial Foundation* test under section 552.101. *See Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). The supreme court also considered the applicability of section 552.102(a) and held it excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *See id.* at 348. Upon review, the department must withhold the date of birth we have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate the applicability of section 552.102(a) to any of the remaining responsive information, and the department may not withhold any of the remaining responsive information on this basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685. To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. The types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987)*. This office has found personal financial

information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under common-law privacy). Upon review, we find the information we have marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have not demonstrated any of the remaining responsive information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate concern to the public. Thus, none of the remaining responsive information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, and social security number of a peace officer, as well as information that reveals whether the peace officer has family members, regardless of whether the peace officer complies with sections 552.024 and 552.1175 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(2). We note section 552.117 is also applicable to personal cellular telephone numbers, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988) (section 552.117 not applicable to cellular telephone numbers paid for by governmental body and intended for official use). Section 552.117(a)(2) applies to peace officers as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code; however, the marked cellular telephone number may be withheld only if a governmental body does not pay for the cellular telephone service. The remaining responsive information does not contain the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, social security number, or family member information of a current or former official, employee, or peace officer of the department. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the remaining responsive information under section 552.117.

Section 552.1175 of the Government Code protects the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, date of birth, social security number, and family member information of certain individuals, when that information is held by a governmental body in a non-employment capacity and the individual elects to keep the information confidential. Gov't Code § 552.1175. We have marked information of a peace officer that is not held in an employment capacity by the department. To the extent the peace officer elects to restrict access to the information we have marked in accordance with section 552.1175(b), the department must withhold the marked information under section 552.1175 of the Government Code. To the extent the peace officer whose information is at issue does not elect to restrict access to the marked information in accordance with section 552.1175(b), the department may not withhold the marked information under section 552.1175 of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *Id.* § 552.130. Upon review, we find the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. However, none of the remaining responsive information is subject to section 552.130, and the department may not withhold it on that basis.

Section 552.140 of the Government Code provides a military veteran's DD-214 form or other military discharge record that is first recorded with or that otherwise first comes into the possession of a governmental body on or after September 1, 2003, is confidential for a period of seventy-five years and may be disclosed only in accordance with section 552.140 or a court order.² *See id.* § 552.140(a)-(b). We note that section 552.140 applies to only the DD-214 form itself or other military discharge records and not references to the form or records. Upon review, we find the department came into possession of the military discharge record we have marked after September 1, 2003. Thus, the department must withhold the military discharge record we have marked under section 552.140 of the Government Code.

In summary, the TCOLE identification number is not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor. The department must withhold the submitted L-2 and L-3 forms under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code. The department must withhold the date of birth we have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code; however, the marked cellular telephone number may be withheld only if a governmental body does not pay for the cellular telephone service. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.1175 of the Government Code, if the individual whose information is at issue elects to restrict access to the information in accordance with section 552.1175(b) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the military discharge record we have marked under section 552.140 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining responsive information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).*

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Britni Ramirez". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Britni Ramirez
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

BR/bhf

Ref: ID# 620869

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)