



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 16, 2016

Mr. Les Trobman  
General Counsel  
Texas Water Development Board  
P.O. Box 13231  
Austin, Texas 78711-3231

OR2016-13754

Dear Mr. Trobman:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 614439.

The Texas Water Development Board (the "board") received a request for 1) all files in specified computer locations, 2) all contacts in the requestor's former work e-mail account, and 3) the requestor's personnel file.<sup>1</sup> You state you released some information to the requestor with the redaction of personal information of employees subject to section 552.117 of the Government Code pursuant to section 552.024 of the Government Code and personal e-mail addresses under section 552.137 of the Government Code pursuant to Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009).<sup>2</sup> You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure

---

<sup>1</sup>We note the requestor modified her request. See Gov't Code § 552.222(b) (governmental body may communicate with requestor for purposes of clarifying or narrowing request). See also *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S. W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding that when governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of unclear or overbroad request for public information, ten-day period to request attorney general ruling is measured from date request is clarified or narrowed).

<sup>2</sup>Section 552.024(c)(2) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact information protected by section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code without the necessity of requesting a decision under the Act if the current or former employee or official to whom the information pertains timely chooses not to allow public access to the information. See Gov't Code § 552.024(c)(2). Open Records Decision No. 684 serves as a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain categories

under sections 552.101, 552.102, 552.107, 552.111, 552.116, 552.122, and 552.139 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>3</sup>

Initially, we note the requestor seeks “any documents that have yet to be added” to her personnel file. It is implicit in several provisions of the Act that the Act applies only to information already in existence. *See* Gov’t Code §§ 552.002, .021, .227, .351. We note the Act does not require a governmental body to release information that did not exist when it received a request or create responsive information. *See Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266, 267-68 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 452 at 3 (1986), 362 at 2 (1983). Consequently, a governmental body is not required to comply with a standing request to supply information prepared in the future. *See* Attorney General Opinion JM-48 at 2 (1983); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 476 at 1 (1987), 465 at 1 (1987). Thus, the only information encompassed by the present request consists of information the board maintained or had a right of access to as of the date it received the request.

Next, we note some of the submitted information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

...

(5) all working papers, research material, and information used to estimate the need for or expenditure of public funds or taxes by a governmental body, on completion of the estimate[.]

Gov’t Code § 552.022(a)(5). Attachment D consists of draft documents related to the board’s budget that are subject to section 552.022(a)(5). The board must release this information pursuant to section 552.022(a)(5) unless it is made confidential under the Act or other law. You seek to withhold the information subject to section 552.022(a)(5) under section 552.111 of the Government Code. However, section 552.111 is discretionary in

---

of information, including personal e-mail addresses under section 552.137 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision. *See* ORD 684.

<sup>3</sup>We assume that the “representative sample” of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

nature and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 470 at 7 (1987) (statutory predecessor to section 552.111 subject to waiver). Therefore, the board may not withhold Attachment D under section 552.111 of the Government Code. However, we will consider your arguments for the remaining information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses federal law such as the Family and Medical Leave Act (the “FMLA”). *See* 29 U.S.C. §§ 2601 *et. seq.* Section 825.500 of chapter V of title 29 of the Code of Federal Regulations identifies the record-keeping requirements for employers that are subject to the FMLA. Subsection (g) of section 825.500 states:

[r]ecords and documents relating to certifications, recertifications or medical histories of employees or employees’ family members, created for purposes of FMLA, shall be maintained as confidential medical records in separate files/records from the usual personnel files, and if the ADA, as amended, is also applicable, such records shall be maintained in conformance with ADA confidentiality requirements[], except that:

- (1) Supervisors and managers may be informed regarding necessary restrictions on the work or duties of an employee and necessary accommodations;
- (2) First aid and safety personnel may be informed (when appropriate) if the employee’s physical or medical condition might require emergency treatment; and
- (3) Government officials investigating compliance with FMLA (or other pertinent law) shall be provided relevant information upon request.

29 C.F.R. § 825.500(g). Upon review, we find the information you have marked is confidential under section 825.500 of title 29 of the Code of Federal Regulations. Further, we find none of the release provisions of the FMLA apply to this information. Accordingly, the board must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the FMLA.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a). We understand you to assert the privacy analysis under section 552.102(a) is the same as the common-law privacy test under

section 552.101 of the Government Code. Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). In *Hubert v. Harte-Hanks Texas Newspapers, Inc.*, 652 S.W.2d 546, 549-51 (Tex. App.—Austin 1983, writ ref'd n.r.e.), the court of appeals ruled the privacy test under section 552.102(a) is the same as the *Industrial Foundation* privacy test. However, the Texas Supreme Court has expressly disagreed with *Hubert's* interpretation of section 552.102(a) and held the privacy standard under section 552.102(a) differs from the *Industrial Foundation* test under section 552.101. See *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). The supreme court also considered the applicability of section 552.102(a) and held it excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. See *id.* at 348. Having carefully reviewed the remaining information, we have marked the information that must be withheld under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. However, we find no portion of the remaining information is subject to section 552.102(a) of the Government Code, and the board may not withhold any of the remaining information on that basis.

Section 552.107(1) of the Government Code protects information coming within the attorney-client privilege. When asserting the attorney-client privilege, a governmental body has the burden of providing the necessary facts to demonstrate the elements of the privilege in order to withhold the information at issue. See Open Records Decision No. 676 at 6-7 (2002). First, a governmental body must demonstrate the information constitutes or documents a communication. *Id.* at 7. Second, the communication must have been made “to facilitate the rendition of professional legal services” to the client governmental body. TEX. R. EVID. 503(b)(1). The privilege does not apply when an attorney or representative is involved in some capacity other than that of providing or facilitating professional legal services to the client governmental body. *In re Tex. Farmers Ins. Exch.*, 990 S.W.2d 337, 340 (Tex. App.—Texarkana 1999, orig. proceeding) (attorney-client privilege does not apply if attorney acting in capacity other than that of attorney). Governmental attorneys often act in capacities other than that of professional legal counsel, such as administrators, investigators, or managers. Thus, the mere fact that a communication involves an attorney for the government does not demonstrate this element. Third, the privilege applies only to communications between or among clients, client representatives, lawyers, and lawyer representatives. TEX. R. EVID. 503(b)(1)(A), (B), (C), (D), (E). Thus, a governmental body must inform this office of the identities and capacities of the individuals to whom each communication at issue has been made. Lastly, the attorney-client privilege applies only to a confidential communication, *id.* 503(b)(1), meaning it was “not intended to be disclosed to third persons other than those: (A) to whom disclosure is made to further the rendition of professional legal services to the client; or (B) reasonably necessary to transmit the communication.” *Id.* 503(a)(5). Whether a communication meets this definition depends on the *intent* of the parties involved at the time the information was

communicated. *See Osborne v. Johnson*, 954 S.W.2d 180, 184 (Tex. App.—Waco 1997, orig. proceeding). Moreover, because the client may elect to waive the privilege at any time, a governmental body must explain the confidentiality of a communication has been maintained. Section 552.107(1) generally excepts an entire communication that is demonstrated to be protected by the attorney-client privilege unless otherwise waived by the governmental body. *See Huie v. DeShazo*, 922 S.W.2d 920, 923 (Tex. 1996) (privilege extends to entire communication, including facts contained therein).

You state the information you have marked consists of communications between board attorneys and employees that were made for the purpose of providing legal services to the board. You state the communications were intended to be confidential and have remained confidential. Based on your representations and our review, we find the information you have marked consists of privileged attorney-client communications. Therefore, the board may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.107(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.116 of the Government Code provides,

(a) An audit working paper of an audit of the state auditor or the auditor of a state agency, an institution of higher education as defined by Section 61.003, Education Code, a county, a municipality, a school district, a hospital district, or a joint board operating under Section 22.074, Transportation Code, including any audit relating to the criminal history background check of a public school employee, is excepted from [required public disclosure]. If information in an audit working paper is also maintained in another record, that other record is not excepted from [public disclosure] by this section.

(b) In this section:

(1) “Audit” means an audit authorized or required by a statute of this state or the United States, the charter or an ordinance of a municipality, an order of the commissioners court of a county, the bylaws adopted by or other action of the governing board of a hospital district, a resolution or other action of a board of trustees of a school district, including an audit by the district relating to the criminal history background check of a public school employee, or a resolution or other action of a joint board described by Subsection (a) and includes an investigation.

(2) “Audit working paper” includes all information, documentary or otherwise, prepared or maintained in conducting an audit or preparing an audit report, including:

(A) intra-agency and interagency communications; and

(B) drafts of the audit report or portions of those drafts.

Gov't Code § 552.116. You state the information you have marked consists of communications utilized and maintained by the board in conducting an investigation authorized by the Texas Internal Auditing Act, as set forth in chapter 2102 of the Government Code. *See id.* §§ 2102.003 (defining types of audits), .005 (requiring state agencies to conduct internal audit program), .007 (relating to duties of the internal auditor). Based on your representations and our review, we agree the information at issue constitutes audit working papers under section 552.116. Thus, we conclude the board may withhold information you have marked under section 552.116 of the Government Code.

Section 552.122(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[a] test item developed by an educational institution that is funded wholly or in part by state revenue[.]” *Id.* § 552.122(a). In Open Records Decision No. 626 (1994), this office determined the term “test item” in section 552.122 includes “any standard means by which an individual’s or group’s knowledge or ability in a particular area is evaluated.” ORD 626 at 6. The question of whether specific information falls within the scope of section 552.122(a) must be determined on a case-by-case basis. *Id.* at 7. Traditionally, this office has applied section 552.122 where release of “test items” might compromise the effectiveness of future examinations. *See* Open Records Decision No. 118 (1976). *See generally* ORD 626 at 4-5. Section 552.122 also protects the answers to test questions when the answers might reveal the questions themselves. *See* Attorney General Opinion JM-640 at 3 (1987).

You seek to withhold the questions and answers you have marked under section 552.122 of the Government Code. You assert the questions test the knowledge and abilities of applicants in a particular area. You also inform us the board has used the questions at issue and will continue to use these questions. Based on your representations and our review, we find some of the submitted questions are “test items” under section 552.122(a) of the Government Code. Furthermore, we find release of the answers to the questions would reveal the questions themselves. Therefore, the board may withhold the questions and answers we have marked under section 552.122(a) of the Government Code. However, we find the remaining questions at issue do not evaluate an individual’s or group’s knowledge or ability in a particular area. Rather, the remaining information at issue reveals questions that evaluate an applicant’s individual abilities, personal opinions, and subjective ability to respond to a particular situation. Accordingly, the board may not withhold any portion of the remaining information at issue under section 552.122 of the Government Code.

Section 552.139 of the Government Code provides, in part:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information that relates to computer network security, to restricted

information under Section 2059.055 [of the Government Code], or to the design, operation, or defense of a computer network.

(b) The following information is confidential:

(1) a computer network vulnerability report; [and]

(2) any other assessment of the extent to which data processing operations, a computer, a computer program, network, system, or system interface, or software of a governmental body or of a contractor of a governmental body is vulnerable to unauthorized access or harm, including an assessment of the extent to which the governmental body's or contractor's electronically stored information containing sensitive or critical information is vulnerable to alteration, damage, erasure, or inappropriate use[.]

Gov't Code § 552.139(a), (b)(1)-(2). Section 2059.055 of the Government Code provides, in part:

(b) Network security information is confidential under this section if the information is:

(1) related to passwords, personal identification numbers, access codes, encryption, or other components of the security system of a state agency;

(2) collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental entity to prevent, detect, or investigate criminal activity; or

(3) related to an assessment, made by or for a governmental entity or maintained by a governmental entity, of the vulnerability of a network to criminal activity.

*Id.* § 2059.055(b). You state the information you have marked pertains to an assessment of the board's computer network and passwords and other access codes and login information assigned to board personnel to access the board's computer network systems. The board also states release of the information at issue would provide a roadmap of the system's network security in place to protect sensitive information. Based on the board's representations and our review of the information, we conclude the board must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.139 of the Government Code.

We note some of the remaining information may be subject to section 552.117 of the Government Code.<sup>4</sup> Section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the current and former home addresses and telephone numbers, emergency contact information, social security numbers, and family member information of current or former employees of a governmental body who request that this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code. *Id.* § 552.117(a)(1). Section 552.117(a)(1) also applies to the personal cellular telephone number of a current or former official or employee of a governmental body, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988). Whether a particular piece of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time the request for it is made. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Therefore, a governmental body must withhold information under section 552.117(a)(1) on behalf of a current or former employee only if the individual made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date on which the request for this information was made. Therefore, if the employee whose information is at issue timely requested confidentiality under section 552.024 of the Government Code and the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body, the board must withhold the cellular telephone number we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code. Conversely, if the employee at issue did not timely request confidentiality under section 552.024 or the cellular telephone service is paid for by a governmental body, the board may not withhold the information at issue under section 552.117(a)(1).

In summary, the board must release Attachment D pursuant to section 552.022(a)(5) of the Government Code. The board must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the FMLA. The board must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. The board may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.107(1) of the Government Code. The board may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.116 of the Government Code. The board may withhold the information we have marked under section 552.122(a) of the Government Code. The board must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.139 of the Government Code. If the employee whose information is at issue timely requested confidentiality under section 552.024 of the Government Code and the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body, the board must withhold the cellular telephone number we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code. The board must release the remaining information.

---

<sup>4</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision No. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Meredith L. Coffman', with a long horizontal line extending to the right.

Meredith L. Coffman  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

MLC/bw

Ref: ID# 614439

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)