



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 22, 2016

Mr. Jeffrey W. Giles
Assistant City Attorney
Legal Department
City of Houston
P.O. Box 368
Houston, Texas 77001-0368

OR2016-14194

Dear Mr. Giles:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 615299 (GC No. 23250).

The City of Houston (the "city") received a request for the personnel file of a named individual. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note portions of the submitted information consist of final orders of the city's Civil Service Commission (the "commission"). Section 143.011 of the Local Government Code provides that "[e]ach rule, opinion, directive, decision, or order issued by the commission must be written and constitutes a public record that the commission shall retain on file." Local Gov't Code § 143.011(c). Accordingly, we find the commission's final orders are subject to section 143.011 of the Local Government Code and, thus, are public records. Although you raise section 552.103 of the Government Code as an exception to disclosure of this information, we note that as a general rule, the exceptions to disclosure found in the Act are not applicable to information that other statutes make public. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 623 at 3 (1994), 525 at 3 (1989). Accordingly, the city must release the commission's final orders, which we have marked, pursuant to section 143.011 of the Local Government Code.

Next, we note some of the submitted information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

(1) a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body, except as provided by Section 552.108; [and]

...

(15) information regarded as open to the public under an agency's policies; [and]

...

(17) information that is also contained in a public court record[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(1), (15), (17). The submitted information includes a completed report and evaluations that are subject to subsection 552.022(a)(1). The city must release this information pursuant to subsection 552.022(a)(1) unless it is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code or is made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* § 552.022(a)(1). The submitted information also includes a job posting. Job postings are generally open to the public. If the city regards the submitted job posting as open to the public, then this information is subject to section 552.022(a)(15). *See id.* § 552.022(a)(15). The submitted information also contains information that is contained in a public court record that is subject to section 552.022(a)(17). The submitted job posting and court-filed document must be released unless they are made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* § 552.022(a)(17). You seek to withhold the information subject to section 552.022 under section 552.103 of the Government Code. However, section 552.103 is discretionary in nature and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive Gov't Code § 552.103); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions). Therefore, the information subject to section 552.022, which we have marked, may not be withheld under section 552.103 of the Government Code. However, because section 552.117 of the Government Code makes information confidential under the Act, we will consider its applicability to the information subject to section 552.022

of the Government Code.¹ We will also consider your argument under section 552.103 for the remaining information not subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code.

Section 552.103 of the Government Code provides, in relevant part, as follows:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

...

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

Gov't Code § 552.103(a), (c). The governmental body has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show the section 552.103(a) exception is applicable in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a showing that (1) litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date the governmental body received the request for information and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. *Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, orig. proceeding); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990). The governmental body must meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted from disclosure under section 552.103(a).

The question of whether litigation is reasonably anticipated must be determined on a case-by-case basis. *See* Open Records Decision No. 452 at 4 (1986). To establish litigation is reasonably anticipated, the governmental body must furnish concrete evidence that litigation involving a specific matter is realistically contemplated and is more than mere conjecture. *Id.* This office has found a pending complaint with the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission ("EEOC") indicates litigation is reasonably anticipated. *See* Open Records Decisions Nos. 386 at 2 (1983), 336 at 1 (1982), 281 at 1 (1981).

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480(1987), 470 (1987).

You state, and provide documentation showing, prior to the city's receipt of the request for information, the requestor filed a complaint against the city with the EEOC. Based on your representation, we find the city has demonstrated it reasonably anticipated litigation when it received the request for information. You also state the submitted information pertains to the substance of the EEOC claim. Based on your representations and our review, we find the remaining information is related to the anticipated litigation. Therefore, the city may withhold the remaining information under section 552.103(a) of the Government Code.

However, once the information has been obtained by all parties to the pending litigation, no section 552.103(a) interest exists with respect to that information. Open Records Decision No. 349 at 2 (1982). We also note the applicability of section 552.103(a) ends when the litigation has concluded. Attorney General Opinion MW-575 at 2 (1982); Open Records Decision Nos. 350 at 3 (1982), 349 at 2.

Section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home address and telephone number, emergency contact information, social security number, and family member information of a current or former employee or official of a governmental body who requests this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code. *See Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(1)*. Whether a particular item of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. *See Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989)*. Thus, information may be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) only on behalf of a current or former employee or official who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. Therefore, to the extent the individual whose information is at issue timely requested confidentiality under section 552.024 of the Government Code, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code.

In summary, the city must release the information we have marked under section 552.022 of the Government Code; however, in releasing such information, to the extent the individual whose information is at issue timely requested confidentiality under section 552.024 of the Government Code, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code. The city may withhold the remaining submitted information under section 552.103(a) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/>

[orl_ruling_info.shtml](#), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'J. Behnke', with a stylized flourish at the end.

Joseph Behnke
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JB/som

Ref: ID# 615299

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)