



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 28, 2016

Mr. Matthew L. Grove
Assistant County Attorney
Fort Bend County
401 Jackson Street, 3rd Floor
Richmond, Texas 77469

OR2016-14736

Dear Mr. Grove:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 616289.

The Fort Bend County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for information pertaining the requestor and four named individuals during a specified period of time. You state the sheriff's office has released some of the requested information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. This office has found a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

You claim the present request requires the sheriff's office to compile the criminal history of one of the named individuals. However, upon review of the request and the submitted information, we find the request is seeking reports involving the requestor and the named individual at issue. Thus, the request does not implicate the named individual's right to privacy, and the submitted information may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of the named individual's privacy interests as a compilation of his criminal history.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by other statutes. Section 261.201 of the Family Code provides, in relevant part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Juvenile Justice Department, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would

otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law[.]

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l)(2). Upon review, we find report numbers 14-24755, 15-13410, 15-36241, and 15-36386 relate to investigations of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect conducted by the sheriff's office. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining "child" for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining "abuse" and "neglect" for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we find this information is subject to section 261.201 of the Family Code. In this instance, the requestor is a parent of the child victims listed in the information at issue. However, we note the requestor is alleged to have committed the suspected abuse or neglect in report numbers 15-36241 and 15-36386. Thus, the requestor does not have a right of access to these reports under section 261.201(k). *See id.* § 261.201(k). Therefore, we conclude report numbers 15-36241 and 15-36386 are confidential pursuant to section 261.201(a) of the Family Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.² *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).

We note, however, the requestor is not alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect in the report numbers 14-24755 and 15-13410. Thus, pursuant to section 261.201(k), these reports may not be withheld from this requestor on the basis of section 261.201(a). *See* Fam Code § 261.201(k). However, section 261.201(l)(2) states any information that is excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law must still be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(l)(2). Accordingly, we will consider your remaining arguments for report numbers 14-24755 and 15-13410. Further, we find report number 14-27178 is not confidential under section 261.201(a), and the sheriff's office may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that basis.

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of the this information.

You assert the remaining information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the information at issue would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706, 710 (Tex. 1977). You state report number 14-24755 relates to a pending criminal investigation. Based on this representation, we conclude the release of this information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177, 186-87 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (delineating law enforcement interests present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Therefore, we agree section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to this information.

Section 552.108(a)(2) excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the information at issue relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(2), .301(e)(1)(A). You state report numbers 14-27178 and 15-13410 pertain to cases that concluded in results other than convictions or deferred adjudications. Therefore, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to this information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the sheriff’s office may withhold report number 14-24755 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and report numbers 14-27178 and 15-13410 under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.³

You raise section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code for the basic information. Section 552.101 also encompasses criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center, which is confidential under federal and state law. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to

³As our ruling is dispositive, we need not consider your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter E-1 or subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter E-1 or subchapter F. Upon review, we find the sheriff’s office has failed to demonstrate any of the basic information contains CHRI for purposes of chapter 411. Accordingly, none of the basic information is confidential under chapter 411, and the sheriff’s office may not withhold any of this information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that ground.

You also claim the basic information is confidential under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of common-law privacy, which is subject to the two-part test described above. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685. Types of information considered highly intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate any of the basic information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public interest. Therefore, the sheriff’s office may not withhold any portion of the basic information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, the sheriff’s office must withhold report numbers 15-36241 and 15-36386 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. With the exception of basic information, which must be released, the sheriff’s office may withhold report number 14-24755 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and report numbers 14-27178 and 15-13410 under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.⁴

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

⁴Because this requestor has a special right of access to the information being released, if the sheriff’s office receives another request for this same information from a different requestor, the sheriff’s office must again seek a ruling from this office. *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(k).

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Nicholas A. Ybarra". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name being the most prominent.

Nicholas A. Ybarra
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

NAY/bw

Ref: ID# 616289

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)