



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 1, 2016

Ms. Lillian Guillen Graham  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of Mesquite  
P.O. Box 850137  
Mesquite, Texas 75185-0137

OR2016-15096

Dear Ms. Graham:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 617032.

The Mesquite Police Department (the "department") received a request for the incident report and the video recording relating to a specified incident. You state the department will withhold the dates of birth you marked pursuant to Open Records Letter No. 2015-24970 (2015).<sup>1</sup> You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. We note the submitted information includes a recording from a body worn camera. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Section 1701.661(a) of the Occupations Code states the information a requestor must provide when seeking a body worn camera recording. *See* Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). In this instance, the requestor

---

<sup>1</sup>Open Records Letter No. 2015-24970 authorizes the department to withhold the dates of birth of public citizens under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy without requesting a decision from this office.

provides the requisite information. You indicate the submitted recording was required to be made by law or the policies of the department and the recordings relate to a law enforcement purpose. *See id.* § 1701.661(h). Further, you indicate the recording is or could be used as evidence in a criminal prosecution. *See id.* § 1701.661(d). Additionally, we have no indication the recording documents an incident that involves the use of deadly force by an officer or relates to an administrative or criminal investigation of an officer. *See id.* § 1701.660(a). We note, however, section 1701.661(f) provides, in relevant part:

A law enforcement agency may not release any portion of a recording made in a private space . . . without written authorization from the person who is the subject of that portion of the recording or, if the person is deceased, from the person's authorized representative.

*Id.* § 1701.661(f). Upon review, we find a portion of the submitted information consists of a body worn camera recording made in a private space. *See id.* § 1701.651(3) (defining "private space" for purposes of section 1701.661(f)). The department does not indicate it has permission for release from the subject of the recording made in the private space. *See id.* § 1701.661(f). Accordingly, we find the department must withhold the information we have indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.661(f) of the Occupations Code.<sup>2</sup>

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 261.201(a) of the Family Code, which provides:

(a) Except as provided by Section 261.203, the following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

---

<sup>2</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). You assert the remaining information is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. *See id.* § 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). However, the submitted information does not reflect this information was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect. Accordingly, we conclude this information is not within the scope of section 261.201. Therefore, the department may not withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. In Open Records Decision No. 393 (1983), this office concluded generally, only information that either identifies or tends to identify a victim of sexual assault or other sex-related offense may be withheld under common-law privacy; however, because the identifying information was inextricably intertwined with other releasable information, the governmental body was required to withhold the entire report. Open Records Decision No. 393 at 2 (1983); *see* Open Records Decision No. 339 (1982); *see also Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519 (Tex. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (identity of witnesses to and victims of sexual harassment was highly intimate or embarrassing information and public did not have a legitimate interest in such information); Open Records Decision No. 440 (1986) (detailed descriptions of serious sexual offenses must be withheld). Further, in those instances where it is determined the requestor knows the identity of the victim, the entire report must be withheld to protect the victim’s privacy under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

You contend the department must withhold the entirety of the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, upon review, we find this is not an instance in which the department must withhold the entirety of the information at issue to protect an individual’s privacy. Further, we find you have failed to demonstrate any portion of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Therefore, the department may not withhold any portion of the remaining information under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.130 provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit, a motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of Texas or another state or country is excepted from public release.

Gov't Code § 552.130(a). The department must withhold the information you have indicated under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the information we have indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.661(f) of the Occupations Code. The department must withhold the information you have indicated under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.<sup>3</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Lee Seidlits  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

CLS/bw

Ref: ID# 617032

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)

---

<sup>3</sup>We note the requestor has a right of access beyond that of the general public to his motor vehicle information being released, which is generally excepted from disclosure under section 552.130 of the Government Code. See Gov't Code § 552.023(a); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987).