



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 5, 2016

Ms. Amy L. Sims  
Assistant City Attorney  
Office of the City Attorney  
City of Lubbock  
P.O. Box 2000  
Lubbock, Texas 79457

OR2016-15227

Dear Ms. Sims:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 617047 (Ref. No. 1325).

The Lubbock Police Department (the "department") received a request for all information pertaining to a named individual, to include information pertaining to a specific incident. The department claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> We have considered the exceptions the department claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. The department raises section 552.101 in conjunction with the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 ("HIPAA") for some of the submitted information. At the direction of Congress, the Secretary of Health and Human Services ("HHS") promulgated regulations setting privacy standards for medical records, which HHS issued as the Federal Standards for Privacy of Individually Identifiable Health Information. *See* HIPAA, 42 U.S.C. § 1320d-2 (Supp. IV 1998) (historical & statutory note); Standards for Privacy of Individually Identifiable Health Information, 45 C.F.R. Pts. 160, 164 ("Privacy Rule"); *see also* Attorney General Opinion JC-0508 at 2 (2002). These standards govern the

---

<sup>1</sup>Although the department raises section 552.108 of the Government Code, the department has provided no arguments explaining how section 552.108 is applicable to the submitted information. Therefore, we assume the department no longer asserts this exception. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301(e)(1)(A), .302.

releasability of protected health information by a covered entity. *See* 45 C.F.R. pts. 160, 164. Under these standards, a covered entity may not use or disclose protected health information, except as provided by parts 160 and 164 of the Code of Federal Regulations. 45 C.F.R. § 164.502(a).

This office has addressed the interplay of the Privacy Rule and the Act. *See* Open Records Decision No. 681 (2004). In that decision, we noted section 164.512 of title 45 of the Code of Federal Regulations provides a covered entity may use or disclose protected health information to the extent such use or disclosure is required by law and the use or disclosure complies with and is limited to the relevant requirements of such law. *See* 45 C.F.R. § 164.512(a)(1). We further noted the Act “is a mandate in Texas law that compels Texas governmental bodies to disclose information to the public.” *See* ORD 681 at 8; *see also* Gov’t Code §§ 552.002, .003, .021. We therefore held the disclosures under the Act come within section 164.512(a). Consequently, the Privacy Rule does not make information confidential for the purpose of section 552.101 of the Government Code. *See Abbott v Tex. Dep’t of Mental Health & Mental Retardation*, 212 S.W.3d 648 (Tex. App.—Austin 2006, no pet.); ORD 681 at 9; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 478 (1987) (as general rule, statutory confidentiality requires express language making information confidential). Because the Privacy Rule does not make confidential information that is subject to disclosure under the Act, the department may not withhold any portion of the submitted information on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 181.006 of the Health and Safety Code, which provides the following:

[F]or a covered entity that is a governmental unit, an individual’s protected health information:

(1) includes any information that reflects that an individual received health care from the covered entity; and

(2) is not public information and is not subject to disclosure under [the Act].

Health & Safety Code § 181.006. Section 181.001(b)(2)(A) defines “covered entity” to include any person who:

(A) for commercial, financial, or professional gain, monetary fees, or dues, or on a cooperative, nonprofit, or pro bono basis, engages, in whole or in part, and with real or constructive knowledge, in the practice of assembling, collecting, analyzing, using, evaluating, storing, or transmitting protected health information. The term includes a business associate, health care payer, governmental unit, information or computer management entity, school, health researcher, health care facility, clinic, health care provider, or person who maintains an Internet site[.]

*Id.* § 181.001(b)(2)(A). The department asserts it is a covered entity for purposes of section 181.006 of the Health and Safety Code. However, in order to determine whether the department is a covered entity, we must address whether the department engages in the practice of “assembling, collecting, analyzing, using, evaluating, storing, or transmitting protected health information.” *Id.* Section 181.001 states that “[u]nless otherwise defined in this chapter, each term that is used in this chapter has the meaning assigned by the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act and Privacy Standards.” *Id.* § 181.001(a). Accordingly, as chapter 181 does not define “protected health information,” we turn to HIPAA’s definition of the term. HIPAA defines “protected health information” as individually identifiable health information that is transmitted or maintained in electronic media or any other form or medium. *See* 45 C.F.R. § 160.103. HIPAA defines “individually identifiable health information” as information that is a subset of health information, including demographic information collected from an individual, and:

- (1) Is created or received by a health care provider, health plan, employer, or health care clearinghouse; and
- (2) Relates to the past, present, or future physical or mental health or condition of an individual; the provision of health care to an individual; or the past, present, or future payment for the provision of health care to an individual; and
  - (i) That identifies the individual; or
  - (ii) With respect to which there is a reasonable basis to believe the information can be used to identify the individual.

*Id.* The submitted information consists of a police report. Although the department asserts it is a covered entity, it has not explained the submitted information consists of protected health information. Thus, we find the department has failed to demonstrate the applicability of section 181.006 of the Health and Safety Code. Accordingly, the department may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 58.007(c) of the Family Code which makes juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 confidential. Section 58.007(c) of the Family Code reads as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). The department asserts the submitted information is confidential under section 58.007(c). However, the department has failed to demonstrate the submitted information depicts an individual who is ten years of age or older and under the age of seventeen as a suspect or offender of delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision. *See id.* § 51.03(a)-(b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of section 58.007). Therefore, the department may not withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, we find the submitted information was used or developed in an investigation conducted by the department under chapter 261 of the Family Code, so as to fall within the scope of section 261.201(a). *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of section 261.201), 261.001(1) (defining “abuse” for purposes of section 261.201 of Family Code). Therefore, we find the submitted information is generally confidential under section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. Section 261.201(a), however, also provides information encompassed by subsection (a) may be disclosed “for purposes consistent with [the Family Code] and applicable federal or state law.” *Id.* § 261.201(a).

We note chapter 411 of the Government Code constitutes “applicable state law” in this instance, and the requestor is an investigator with the Texas Department of Licensing and Regulation (the “TDLR”). Sections 411.093 and 411.122 of the Government Code both provide the TDLR is entitled to obtain criminal history record information (“CHRI”) maintained by the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) that relates to a person who is an applicant for a license issued by the TDLR. Gov’t Code §§ 411.093(a), .122(a)(1), .122(d)(10). Section 411.087 of the Government Code provides an agency that is entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS is also authorized to “obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state [CHRI] maintained by that criminal justice agency[.]” *Id.* § 411.087. CHRI is defined as “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *See id.* § 411.082(2). Thus, when read together, sections 411.087, 411.093, and 411.122 of the Government Code may grant the TDLR a right of access to CHRI in the submitted information. Although the department also raises section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy for this information, we note a statutory right of access prevails over the common-law. *See CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd. Auth.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law); *Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex.App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common-law principle).

In this instance, the requestor states she is conducting a criminal background check on an individual who has applied for licensure with the TDLR. Accordingly, if the department determines release of the information at issue is consistent with the purposes of the Family Code, then, pursuant to sections 411.087, 411.093, and 411.122 of the Government Code, the department must release the information that shows the types of allegations made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. In that event, the department must withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. However, if the department determines release of the information is not consistent with the purposes of the Family Code, then it must withhold the submitted information in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code.<sup>2</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

---

<sup>2</sup>As our ruling is dispositive in either instance, we need not address the department’s remaining arguments against disclosure.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten mark, possibly a signature or initials, consisting of a short horizontal line with a diagonal stroke extending downwards and to the left.

Rahat Huq  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

RSH/som

Ref: ID# 617047

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)