



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 5, 2016

Ms. Susan E. Tennyson
Open Government Attorney
Texas Department of Family and Protective Services
Mail Code E611
P.O. Box 149030
Austin, Texas 78714-9030

OR2016-15233

Dear Ms. Tennyson:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 617079 (DFPS ORR No. 04262016UIZ).

The Texas Department of Family and Protective Services (the "department") received a request for the appeal made pertaining to the termination of a named former employee. You indicate the department will redact information subject to section 552.117 of the Government Code as permitted by section 552.024(c) of the Government Code; personal e-mail addresses under section 552.137 of the Government Code pursuant to Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009); and certain information pursuant to the previous determination issued in Open Records Letter No. 2003-5590 (2003).¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted

¹Section 552.117 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, emergency contact information, and family member information of current or former officials or employees of a governmental body. *See* Gov't Code § 552.117. Section 552.024 of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to withhold information subject to section 552.117 without requesting a decision from this office if the employee or official or former employee or official chooses not to allow public access to the information. *See id* § 552.024(c). Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain categories of information, including an e-mail address of a member of the public under section 552.137 of the Government Code, without the necessity of seeking a decision from this office. Open Records Letter No. 2003-5590 is a previous determination authorizing the department to withhold, without the necessity of seeking a decision from this office, the records concerning an investigation of an allegation of abuse or neglect of a child and the records used or developed in providing services as a result of such an investigation under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code, unless the department's rules permit the department to release requested records to a particular requestor.

from disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.103 of the Government Code provides in relevant part as follows:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

...

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

Gov't Code § 552.103(a), (c). The governmental body has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show the section 552.103(a) exception is applicable in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a showing that (1) litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date the governmental body received the request for information and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. *Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, orig. proceeding); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990). The governmental body must meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted from disclosure under section 552.103(a).

For purposes of section 552.103, "litigation" includes contested cases conducted in a quasi-judicial forum. Open Records Decision Nos. 588 at 2 (1991), 474 at 6 (1987) (disciplinary action before Texas State Board of Pharmacy), 368 at 2 (1983) (administrative hearing before Commissioner of Insurance), 301 at 1-2 (1982). Likewise, "contested cases" conducted under the Texas Administrative Procedure Act, chapter 2001 of the Government Code, constitute "litigation" for purposes of section 552.103. *See, e.g.*, ORD 588 at 7 (State Board of Insurance proceeding), 301 at 2 (hearing before Public Utilities Commission). Factors this office considers in determining whether an administrative proceeding is conducted in a quasi-judicial forum include whether the administrative proceeding provides for discovery, evidence to be heard, factual questions to be resolved, the making of a record, and whether the proceeding is an adjudicative forum of first jurisdiction with appellate review of the resulting decision without a re-adjudication of fact questions. *See* ORD 588 at 3-4.

You assert the submitted information is related to pending litigation. You inform us the requestor filed a grievance against the department regarding her termination before the department received the request for information. We understand the department to assert its grievance hearings are “litigation” because the department follows administrative procedures in handling such disputes. You state the requestor is entitled to a hearing before an administrative law judge. You also explain that, at the hearing, the requestor may present relevant evidence and testimony at the hearing, may be represented by an attorney, and has access to documentary evidence on which the grievance is based. Based on your representations and our review, we find the department’s administrative procedure for the dispute at issue, as described above, is conducted in a quasi-judicial forum. Thus, the department’s administrative procedure for disputes constitutes litigation for purposes of section 552.103. Accordingly, we determine the department was involved in pending litigation when it received the request for information. We also find you have established the submitted information is related to the pending litigation for purposes of section 552.103(a). Therefore, the department may generally withhold the submitted information under section 552.103(a).

We note, however, the opposing party to the litigation has seen or had access to some of the information at issue. The purpose of section 552.103 of the Government Code is to enable a governmental body to protect its position in litigation by forcing parties seeking information relating to the litigation to obtain such information through discovery procedures. *See* ORD 551 at 4-5. Thus, once the opposing party in anticipated litigation has seen or had access to information that is related to the litigation, there is no interest in withholding such information from public disclosure under section 552.103. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 349 (1982), 320 (1982). Therefore, the department may not withhold the information that the requestor has seen or had access to under section 552.103. Accordingly, the department must release this information, which we have marked. However, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.103 of the Government Code. We note the applicability of section 552.103 ends once the related litigation concludes. *See* Attorney General Opinion MW-575 (1982); Open Records Decision No. 350 (1982). As you raise no further exceptions to disclosure, the remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for

providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Matthew Taylor".

Matthew Taylor
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MHT/dls

Ref: ID# 617079

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)