



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 8, 2016

Ms. Crystal Koonce
Open Records
Williamson County Sheriff's Office
508 South Rock Street
Georgetown, Texas 78626

OR2016-15539

Dear Ms. Koonce:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 620512.

The Williamson County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received two requests from the same requestor for information pertaining to two named individuals, to include information related to a specified case. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, 552.136, and 552.137 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note some of the submitted information consists of grand jury subpoenas and information obtained pursuant to grand jury subpoenas. The judiciary is expressly excluded from the requirements of the Act. Gov't Code § 552.003(1)(B). This office has determined for purposes of the Act, a grand jury is a part of the judiciary and therefore not subject to the Act. *See* Open Records Decision No. 411 (1984). Further, records kept by a governmental body that is acting as an agent for a grand jury are considered records in the constructive possession of the grand jury, and are also not subject to the Act. *See* Open Records Decisions Nos. 513 (1988), 411, 398 (1983). Thus, to the extent the sheriff's office holds the information at issue as an agent of the grand jury, such information consists of records of the judiciary that are not subject to disclosure under the Act and the sheriff's office is not required to release that information in response to the instant request. To the extent the

sheriff's office does not hold the information at issue as an agent of the grand jury, we will address the arguments of the sheriff's office against its disclosure.

Next, we note, and you acknowledge, the sheriff's office has not complied with the time periods prescribed by section 552.301 of the Government Code in seeking an open records decision from this office. Gov't Code § 552.301. When a governmental body fails to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301, the information at issue is presumed public and must be released unless there is a compelling reason to withhold it. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Generally, a governmental body may demonstrate a compelling reason to withhold information by a showing the information is made confidential by another source of law or affects third party interests. *See* Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). You claim an exception to disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code, which is a discretionary exception that protects a governmental body's interests and may be waived. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Nevertheless, the interests under section 552.108 of a governmental body other than the one that failed to comply with section 552.301 can provide a compelling reason for non-disclosure under section 552.302. *See* Open Records Decision No. 586 at 2-3 (1991). You provide a representation that the Williamson County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") asserts the information at issue should be withheld under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Therefore, we will consider whether the information at issue may be withheld under section 552.108 on behalf of the district attorney's office. Furthermore, because sections 552.101, 552.130, 552.136, and 552.137 of the Government Code can provide compelling reasons for non-disclosure, we will consider the applicability of these exceptions to the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public

records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Moreover, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present requests, in part, seek unspecified law enforcement records pertaining to two named individuals. These portions of the requests require the sheriff's office to compile the named individuals' criminal histories and implicate the named individuals' rights to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the sheriff's office maintains unspecified law enforcement records listing the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the sheriff's office must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we note the requestor also seeks information pertaining to a specified case. This aspect of the requests does not implicate the named individuals' rights to privacy, and the sheriff's office may not withhold the information pertaining to the specified case under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy as a compilation of the named individuals' criminal histories.

We note some of the information at issue is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

...

(17) information that is also contained in a public court record[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). The submitted information contains a court-filed document that is subject to section 552.022(a)(17) and must be released unless it is made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* Although the sheriff's office raises section 552.108 of the Government Code for this information, this exception is discretionary in nature and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See* ORDs 665 at 2 n.5, 663 at 5, 177 at 3. Therefore, the sheriff's office may not withhold the marked court-filed document under section 552.108. Furthermore, although the sheriff's office seeks to withhold some of this information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy, we note information that has been filed with a court is not protected by common-law privacy. *See Star-Telegram v. Walker*, 834 S.W.2d 54 (Tex. 1992) (common-law privacy not applicable to court-filed document). As a result, the sheriff's office may not withhold the information that is subject to section 552.022(a)(17) under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. As you do not claim another exception to the disclosure of the marked court-filed document, the sheriff's office must release it.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(a); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). Section 552.108 may be invoked by the proper custodian of information relating to a pending investigation or prosecution of criminal conduct. *See Open Records Decision No. 474 at 4-5 (1987)*. Where a governmental body has custody of information relating to a pending case of another law enforcement agency, the custodian of the records may withhold the information if it provides this office with a demonstration that the information relates to the pending case and a representation from the law enforcement agency that it wishes to have the information withheld. You inform this office the district attorney’s office objects to release of the information at issue because release would interfere with a pending criminal investigation and prosecution. Based on this representation, we conclude that section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable in this instance. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976).

Section 552.108, however, does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note basic information does not include dates of birth or information subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code. *See* ORD 127 at 3-4. Thus, with the exception of the court-filed document and basic information, the sheriff’s office may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney’s office.¹

As noted above, section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 683. In considering whether a public citizen’s date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court’s rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees’ dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees’ privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

disclosure.² *Tex. Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. Thus, the sheriff's office must withhold the date of birth we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, to the extent the sheriff's office maintains unspecified law enforcement records listing the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the sheriff's office must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. To the extent the sheriff's office holds the information at issue as an agent of the grand jury, such information consists of records of the judiciary that are not subject to disclosure under the Act and the sheriff's office is not required to release that information in response to the instant request. With the exception of the court-filed document we have marked and basic information, the sheriff's office may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney's office. The sheriff's office must withhold the date of birth we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Lee Seidlits
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CLS/bw

²Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

Ref: ID# 620512

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)